

Fostering Gender-Transformative Change in Sustainable Forest Management

A CASE STUDY OF DGM INDONESIA

Ezgi Canpolat, Meerim Shakirova, Vince McElhinny, Kame Westerman, Alli Cruz, and Theresa Buppert

© 2022 International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank
1818 H Street NW
Washington DC 20433
Telephone: 202-473-1000
Internet: www.worldbank.org

This work is a product of the staff of The World Bank with external contributions. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work do not necessarily reflect the views of The World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent.

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy, completeness, or currency of the data included in this work and does not assume responsibility for any errors, omissions, or discrepancies in the information, or liability with respect to the use of or failure to use the information, methods, processes, or conclusions set forth. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Nothing herein shall constitute or be construed or considered to be a limitation upon or waiver of the privileges and immunities of The World Bank, all of which are specifically reserved.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this work is subject to copyright. Because The World Bank encourages dissemination of its knowledge, this work may be reproduced, in whole or in part, for noncommercial purposes as long as full attribution to this work is given.

Any queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to World Bank Publications, The World Bank Group, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; fax: 202-522-2625; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

Cover photo: DGM Indonesia/ Heri Nugroho
Graphic design: Andrea Carega and Karlien Truyens

The DGM Indonesia (DGM-I) country project focuses on improving clarity and security of land rights for Indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs), as well as improving livelihood opportunities from sustainable forests and land. In implementation since March 2017, with 63 subprojects either in implementation or completed, there are ample opportunities for detailed examination of a particular DGM-I subproject. This can offer insight into whether and how DGM projects are influencing women's participation and leadership on the ground, and can also provide an indication of the extent to which the project may be influencing broader social and gender norms in Indonesia. In turn, this case study informs the wider line of inquiry of the World Bank DGM & REDD+ Gender Study, which follows a conceptual framework of gender transformative change to analyze the contribution the DGM-I project is making to women's economic achievement, access to and control over productive assets, voice, and agency that support positive changes in women's leadership and meaningful participation.

The conceptual framework for this study follows a stepwise, yet flexible and dynamic, progression toward gender transformative change. The framework begins by assessing the inputs that the DGM project provides to

beneficiaries, such as assets, information, skills, and capacity building. This assessment looks at what types of inputs are provided, as well as to whom and how they are provided. Next, we assess through the framework how those inputs have influenced women's income and assets, and building on that, how women are gaining voice and agency. Next, we assess whether and how those changes in voice and agency are influencing gender norms, attitudes, and perceptions of women and men at multiple levels—from individual to household to community. Finally, we look at whether those shifts have the potential to be sustained beyond the lifetime of the project and influence more formal practices, rules, policies, and laws that treat women in an unequal way.

The subproject analyzed in this case study was implemented in East Java with the objective of securing forest access rights within the state-owned forest enterprise for a local community. As a result of this subproject, community members both male and female reported a number of benefits and positive shifts for women, both at the individual and community or societal level. This suggested that the DGM in Indonesia has been successful in supporting meaningful, positive changes for women at multiple scales, and indicated some clear movement along the progression toward gender transformative change.



Photo: DGM Indonesia / Andhika Vega

Country Context

Indonesia is one of several countries leading the charge when it comes to the design and implementation of REDD+ (Arwida et al. 2016). In 2020, nearly a decade after the initial formulation of national and subnational REDD+ strategies, Indonesia achieved a huge milestone when it received its first results-based payments, receiving \$56 million in payments in exchange for an estimated 17 million tons of CO₂eq emissions avoided through reduced deforestation and degradation (Satrio 2021). According to an August 2020 statement from Indonesia's Minister of Environment and Forestry, Indonesia has seen a 38% decrease in the rate of deforestation from 2011 to 2017, as compared to the 2003 to 2009 period.

Key to the current and continued success of REDD+ programs in Indonesia will be the implementation of REDD+ programs that are socially sensitive, including considerations for gender sensitivity. Like other countries, Indonesia is prone to gendered risks in REDD+ program development, given a historically male-dominated forestry sector

and growing commercial pressures on forests. It also has embedded social and cultural norms and religious interpretations that can exacerbate gender inequalities, especially in rural communities where 47% of Indonesia's population live (Arwida et al. 2016).

Clear and secure tenure, with clarification of which group has access to REDD+ benefits, is another crucial factor to the successful implementation of REDD+ ([UN-REDD 2012](#)). In Indonesia a lack of clarity in tenure regulations limits women's ability to participate in or benefit equally from REDD+ programs. As explained in DGM-I's Project Appraisal Document (PAD), de jure access and use of the forest is controlled by the Ministry of Environment and Forests, but the National Land Agency, a different bureau, is in charge of actual land titling (World Bank 2017). This overlapping system of governance has resulted in unclear land-related regulations and guidelines and ambiguous provisions regarding the management and administration of land and land-based natural resources.

Within an already complex tenure system, Indonesian women are also disadvantaged in their ability to legally hold property, with Indigenous women facing a unique layer of added challenges. Legal frameworks on inheritance, especially those based in customary or Islamic traditions, favor men as heirs or allocate a larger portion of inherited land to men than women (Astri et al. 2020). The National Land Agency reports that just 24.2% of legally registered land in Indonesia is held under female ownership. Despite some successes within REDD+ for Indigenous communities to reclaim their rights to customary lands and territories, Indigenous women have had limited representation and involvement in these struggles and still do not receive full recognition from their own communities, social movements, or the state (Siscawati 2020).

Forest tenure reforms in Indonesia are under way in an attempt to clarify the tenure regime and provide more benefit to Indigenous (known in Indonesia as *adat*) and forest-based communities. These reforms fall short in fostering an environment for gender equality in forestry. In 2014, President Joko Widodo announced a forest tenure program called Perhutanan Sosial (Social Forestry), intended to improve the well-being of people with forest based livelihoods and to protect forests through sustainable management ([Wahyuningsih 2018](#)). Through the social

forestry scheme, local communities have the ability to obtain forest management licenses, granting them the right to use and manage a particular forest area for 35 years. In their current design, Indonesia's social forestry schemes do not confer full land ownership to communities, although communities are pressing for full land ownership rights (Banjade et al. 2016). Although the management license is granted to the community as a whole, these access rights are then distributed within the community through heads of households. Female-headed households, such as those where the wife is a divorcee or the husband has migrated for work, can be disadvantaged in this process (Wahyuning-sih 2018). As a forest tenure reform strategy, the FAO has noted that "participatory policies [like social forestry] presume communities to be homogeneous social entities with common interests and priorities; they do not consider that they comprise different groups with disparate genders... levels of power and access to resources" (FAO 2015).

While social forestry in Indonesia has been acknowledged to leave women behind in some respects, it is worth exploring whether the DGM as a program working within that scheme might facilitate steps toward women's equality by promoting women's increased participation and agency in the forestry space.

Case Study Methodology

The DGM-I subproject chosen for closer analysis in this case study is entitled “Encouraging Certainty of Community Access to Forest Areas to Reduce Inequality in Land Tenure through Social Forestry.” It is taking place in Sabrang Village of Ambulu District, in the Jember Regency of East Java. This subproject was selected for case study analysis with guidance from both the Samdhana Institute, DGM Indonesia’s National Executing Agency (NEA), as well as the DGM Indonesia National Steering Committee (NSC), to showcase gender outcomes of a DGM-I project.

In spring of 2021, the study team conducted a desk review of overall DGM project documents, as well as documents specific to the DGM Indonesia country project, such as the DGM-I Operations Manual and Project Appraisal Document (PAD). In early March 2021, an interview was held via Zoom with three World Bank staff close to the DGM-I country project, including the two DGM-I Task Team Leaders (TTLs) and a local community and social development specialist. This interview helped to establish context and provide insight into overall DGM-I design, objectives and gender considerations. In late March 2021, an interview was held via Zoom with four staff from Samdhana Institute, DGM-I’s NEA, including the country project coordinator, Samdhana’s gender advisor, and two grant coordinators helping with subproject management. This conversation with the NEA provided further insight into DGM-I project design, including subproject selection and gender-specific outcomes.

Shifting focus to a case study analysis at the subproject level, the study team engaged a consultant to conduct remote interviews with relevant subproject actors. A lack of Bahasa Indonesian (and local dialect) language skills on the study team, as well as COVID-19 travel restrictions necessitating remote interviews, led the study team to believe that the use of a consultant familiar with the context of Indonesia, of the DGM, and of gender considerations in community-based natural resource management, would yield the most useful information under the constraints. Subproject-specific were conducted in May 2021 via the virtual platform Zoom, in both Bahasa and local Javanese. Mobile data packages were provided to cover the connection costs of all subproject-level interviewees participating in virtual calls, in an effort to control for selection bias that may otherwise favor respondents able to afford quality, reliable internet access.

In total, 14 interviews were conducted with 23 total individuals (12 men/11 women). Besides World Bank and NEA experts, interviewees included one male and one female representative from Indonesia’s NSC, four staff from the implementing organization of the case study subproject, two members of village government from the case study village, and four men and four women beneficiaries of the subproject. See Table 1 for a full list of interviews conducted to inform this case study.

Table 1: Interviews Conducted for this Case Study

1	World Bank Staff – DGM-I Co-TTL	Male
2	World Bank Staff – DGM-I Co-TTL	Female
3	World Bank Staff – Local Community and Social Dvlpt Specialist	Male
4	Samdhana Staff – DGM Project Coordinator	Female
5	Samdhana Staff – Gender Advisor	Female
6	Samdhana Staff – Grants Coordinator	Female
7	Samdhana Staff – Grants Coordinator	Female
8	DGM-I National Steering Committee (NSC) Member	Female
9	DGM-I National Steering Committee (NSC) Member	Male
10	Local NGO Staff	Male
11	Local NGO Staff	Male
12	Local NGO Staff	Male
13	Local NGO Staff	Female
14	Subproject Beneficiary	Female
15	Subproject Beneficiary	Female
16	Subproject Beneficiary	Female
17	Subproject Beneficiary	Female
18	Subproject Beneficiary	Male
19	Subproject Beneficiary	Male
20	Subproject Beneficiary	Male
21	Subproject Beneficiary	Male
22	Village Government Official	Male
23	Village Government Official	Male
Total Interviewees:		23 (12 men / 11 women)

The study team recognizes potential limitations associated with the decision to engage a consultant in the data collection process. COVID-19 travel restrictions, both for the study team and internal to Indonesia, required all interviews to be conducted remotely, potentially limiting the level of detail in interviewee responses and the ability for follow up. Additionally, the consultant chosen to conduct sub-project level interviews was the Gender Advisor for DGM Indonesia's NEA and, in a previous position on Indonesia's National Forestry Council (Indonesian abbreviation DKN) was involved in DGM-I design. There was a potential here for conflict of interest, with

a possibility on the consultant's side to skew toward an overly positive portrayal of DGM outcomes and gender impacts. Beneficiaries, in their interviews with the consultant, may also have felt obliged to report overly positive gender impacts of the subproject, perhaps in a bid for continued project support or because they were speaking to a gender expert. Nonetheless, the study team is confident that evidence reported and conclusions drawn, both from our own data collection and from the consultant's work, provided an accurate portrayal of the DGM's impact on gender outcomes.

Design of the DGM Indonesia Project

Project Design

The DGM-I was approved by Forest Investment Program (FIP) in December 2016 and by the World Bank in March 2017. The first call for subproject proposals opened in August of that same year. With a total funding envelope of US\$6.5 million, the express goal of the DGM in Indonesia is to improve the capacity of IPLCs to engage in tenure security processes and livelihood processes from sustainable lands and forests. The project was organized around three main components:

Component 1: Subgrants to strengthen IPLC capacity to enhance tenure security and improve livelihoods. As with most DGM country projects, the subgranting/ subproject component constituted the bulk of the DGM project in Indonesia, having been dedicated over 60% of total project funds. The component allowed communities and community-based organizations to submit proposals for support for forestry initiatives. Funding priority was reserved for communities

and proposals with previous or ongoing efforts to secure land rights. All funded subprojects were required to feature activities related to community outreach and mobilization, and were additionally required to either address strengthening IPLC capacity to enhance land tenure security or improving IPLC capacity to improve livelihoods.

Component 2: Improvement of policy processes and dialogues.

Component 3: Project management, monitoring and evaluation and institutional development.

The project was expressly designed to work with both indigenous (*adat* in Indonesian) beneficiaries and local community (non-*adat* identifying, but still long-term occupants of the lands they manage) beneficiaries in all seven of the geographical regions of Indonesia: Kalimantan, Java, the Maluku Islands, Bali-Nusa Tenggara, Papua, Sulawesi and Sumatra. Project documents specifically outline that at least 30% of direct beneficiaries will be women.

Project Governance

The National Steering Committee (NSC) is the governing body for each DGM country project. The NSC is charged with setting the priorities for the DGM-I, with guidance from the FIP and World Bank in accordance with overall DGM objectives, as well as in alignment with national government aims. Per the design outlined in the DGM-I Operations Manual, Indonesia's NSC consists of nine voting members—one representative of each of the seven regions in which the DGM works, plus two dedicated seats for women representatives (one of them an indigenous women's representative and the other a women's representative of local communities). Representatives to the NSC are elected by a deliberative process in each region, involving IPLC representatives from that region, and is facilitated by the National Forestry Council (Indonesian abbreviation DKN). In addition to the nine voting members, the NSC also includes an appointed representative from the DKN Community Chamber, and a representative from the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF) as non-voting members. A representative of the World Bank is invited as an observer to the NSC.

Near parity in DGM Indonesia's NSC gender composition distinguishes it as one of the most balanced of all DGM NSCs. Currently, Indonesia's NSC consists of 5 men and 4 women, a 55% male to 45% female composition. Besides the earmark for two NSC seats specifically for women's representatives—a decision pressed by female members of the DKN during the process to establish the NSC—no specific provision is made within the NSC design for any gender parity, leaving the nomination up to the deliberative process in the regions. If these two specifically dedicated seats for women were removed from the NSC, the composition for

voting members of the NSC would drop to five men and just two women, or a 71% male to 29% female composition.

National Executing Agency (NEA)

For the DGM-I, Samdhana Institute was selected as the NEA. Samdhana Institute is a registered NGO in Indonesia with the stated mission, in part, of supporting "communities to have clear and secured rights to manage their territories/places," a mission that dovetails with objectives of the DGM-I. Samdhana was selected, in addition to other factors, for their history of managing small grants for IPLCs across Indonesia. The DGM project management unit sitting within Samdhana consists of several staff, including an overall DGM project coordinator, a finance lead, a gender advisor, several grant coordinators, and others.

As an organization, Samdhana is dedicated to the promotion of gender equality and social inclusion in Indonesia. This attitude is codified in their institutional Gender Equality and Social Inclusion (GESI) guidelines, where they outline a commitment to "mainstreaming gender equality and social inclusion (GESI) within the organization" and the activities it supports, including the DGM-I (Abdulkadir-Sunito, M. et al. 2019). To this end, within the implementation of the DGM-Indonesia, Samdhana retained a specific gender advisor for the project, tasked with providing guidance regarding gender issues such as "socially and culturally sound approaches to address gender gaps," designing "reliable and measurable indicators" for gender mainstreaming, and identifying factors influencing the success and failure of mainstreaming gender in the DGM-I project, per the DGM-I Operations Manual.

Subproject Design and Granting Procedures

Samdhana facilitated three calls for subproject proposals for DGM-I, with a total of 63 subprojects funded. Table 2 below outlines specifics of each call.

Samdhana's gender advisor was closely involved in the selection process, reviewing all proposals for their sensitivity to gender considerations like the proportion of direct women beneficiaries of the project, and how projects provide for women's participation in activities given the unique time constraints and other challenges they face. Beyond examining just the face value participation of women, the gender advisor also provided selection guidance that considered the intersectionality of women's experience, encouraging subprojects where possible to include widowed, low caste and other marginalized women, with a specific emphasis on the inclusion of indigenous women.

As required by the foundational project documents, **all subproject proposals were required to include provisions for at least 30% women's participation in subproject activities and decision-making.** For proposals

selected to move from the concept to full proposal stage, any concepts found to be out of compliance with this requirement were not rejected but were instead flagged for further development of their gender sensitivity provisions, with guidance from the gender advisor. While the 30% women's participation target was a requirement of DGM-I from the beginning, and subproject proposals meeting this criteria received additional marks in the scoring for selection, a World Bank TTL noted that "the selection process can be politicized, so it's not always about scoring, per se," implying that **some subprojects failing to meet the 30% target were still approved.** The NEA still worked with the sponsors of these proposals to sharpen their strategies on gender equality.

Following subproject selection, subproject implementers were convened by Samdhana for training in gender and social inclusion and the application of those concepts in the subprojects. As a Samdhana staff person noted, "we want them to understand the concepts of gender equality, social inclusion, tenure and livelihoods." Trainings also included instruction in how to measure tenure and livelihoods indicators with a gender and social inclusion perspective. Unlike some other DGM country projects, trainings specific to

Table 2: DGM Indonesia Calls for Subproject Proposals

	First Call for Proposals (2018)	Second Call for Proposals (2019)	Third Call for Proposals (2020)
Thematic focus	Tenure security	Tenure security	Livelihoods
Total proposals received	209	247	
Total proposals forwarded to the NSC for consideration	31	59	
Total approved proposals	21 (3 from each of the 7 regions)	28 (4 from each of the 7 regions)	14 (2 from each of the 7 regions)

women only were not emphasized at the project level in Indonesia, a conscious decision of the NEA. One NEA staff person observed that in some cases, “activities specifically for women can even more exclude women from the community.” In previous cases women had been ostracized within their communities following their participation in “women only” training events, because of a perception in the wider community that they were receiving preferential treatment. This design and delivery decision for the DGM-I showed how complex and interlinking threads of gender and social norms and stereotypes can influence country projects. Individual subprojects, especially subprojects in *adat* communities, may have included capacity training activities specific to women, but these were held at the discretion of each subproject.

Overall Results of the DGM Indonesia

Overall, DGM Indonesia has performed well in achieving its expected targets and objectives.

The most recent Semi-Annual Report (SAR 11) observed that Indonesia had exceeded three of its four project development objective targets, and was on track to reach the fourth by the project’s end. IP and LC participants in DGM-I activities were reporting an increase in completed submissions to the government for formal access or tenure decrees, as compared to baseline, and participants both male and female were reporting benefits from participating in DGM livelihood related grant activities.

While DGM Indonesia’s official monitoring framework for World Bank reporting collects sex-disaggregated data for only two indicators, targets are matched or exceeded in both these indicators, as outlined in Table 3 below.

The DGM in Indonesia established, and has largely reached, ambitious targets for benefits to *adat* and local communities, serving to create a positive enabling environment for subprojects of DGM-Indonesia to benefit women, as evidenced in the subproject case study.

Table 3: DGM Indonesia sex-disaggregated performance indicators

Indicator	Actual	Target
Participants who benefit (monetary or non-monetary) from livelihood-only grant activities (female)	34%	30%
Participants in consultation activities during project implementation (female)	30%	30%

Source: DGM Country Project ISRRs (mry); SAR-11

Subproject Case Study

Subproject Overview

The DGM-I subproject chosen for analysis in this case study is entitled “Encouraging Certainty of Community Access to Forest Areas to Reduce Inequality in Land Tenure through Social Forestry.” The subproject, selected during DGM-I’s second call for proposals and implemented in the 2019- 2020 period, takes place in Sabrang village, Ambulu district, in the Jember Regency of East Java.

The subproject was implemented by the “Institute for Village Studies for Farmers SD INPERS,” known by its Indonesian abbreviation as LSDP SD INPERS. LSDP SD INPERS is an NGO focused on community development. It has been active throughout Jember Regency, but has focused in Sabrang village as an organizing base since the early 1990s. SD INPERS is also part of the Pokja PPS (Working Group for the Acceleration of Social Forestry) having received this designation by decree of the Governor of East Java and the head of the East Java Forestry Service.

The objective of the subproject as stated in the original proposal was to secure formal forest access rights and reduce inequality of land tenure through Social Forestry for Sabrang village. Through this formalization of their access rights to the forest, Sabrang villagers hoped to reduce economic inequality within the village by prioritizing forest benefit flows to marginalized community members such as widows and returned migrant laborers. As required under Social Forestry, the village also hoped to establish a sustainable management plan for the forests under their management in part by promoting improved productivity of new and existing forest farms, to reduce pressure to clear standing natural forest.

Sabrang village received its *Surat Keputusan* (formal decree) for forest access and use rights through Social Forestry in July 2019.

Initially, the allocated forest area under the decree included 910 total hectares, although this was later expanded to encompass 2,219 total hectares. LSDP SD INPERS estimates that as many as 1,400 Sabrang households have directly benefitted from this acquisition of forest management rights.



While access rights have been granted to Sabrang communally, the forest management area has then been divided among households, granting each household rights to make management decisions over specific forest plots within the forest management area. Within Sabrang's Village Regulation, a forest management plan which was required to be developed as part of the Social Forestry permit application, this land distribution mechanism was collectively agreed upon, and explicitly prioritizes widows, the elderly and the poor in the designation of plots. This was an intentional design decision of the community, meant to address the subproject objective of reducing inequality in the community. In addition to assisting with acquisition of the Social Forestry permit, SD INPERS also provided training intended to build women's capacity in policy, planning, and especially forest product processing, expanding their options for income streams from forest products.

Sabrang village describes not a single village, but actually an administrative area of over 1.1 million hectares (11,000 km²) on the southern side of East Java. While the village of Sabrang proper is the population and administrative center of the area, the administrative area also covers a number of smaller hamlets. Informal counts place the village population at just under 15,000 residents. The population does not identify as indigenous, or *adat*. Many residents of Sabrang village make a livelihood from farming, mainly growing commodity crops such as peppers, tropical fruits or coffee for export or sale in local markets, and depend on local forest resources for their subsistence needs. The village scores low in development indices, and many residents live in poverty.

Despite the presence of productive forest lands, Sabrang villagers historically received no formal benefit from the forests. 3,500 hectares (35 km²) of forested area sit within

the administrative boundary of Sabrang, but the village does not hold jurisdiction over these areas. Across Java, these and all forest lands are held and managed by *Perum Perhutani*, the state-owned forestry enterprise.

A long-standing history of conflict exists between Sabrang's villagers and the state.

Farmers, many of whom do not own their own land and who are unable to afford the rent on land leases for their farms, enter the state-owned forest to clear land and cultivate their crops. These farmers cultivating plots within the forest became known in the village as "forest farmers." Other villagers, and especially women, also enter the forest to gather firewood and other forest products they depend on. Criminalization of these forest farmers and other entrants into the forest is widespread, with some acts of state violence against them. LSDP SD INPERS staff said they had often filed cases with the Komnas HAM (Indonesian National Committee on Human Rights) regarding the criminalization of Sabrang forest farmers and others.

Unable to make a living in these conditions, many of Sabrang's residents migrate out of the area in search of better opportunities, often taking unskilled domestic labor positions in nearby Singapore and Malaysia. SD INPERS reports that **an estimated 70% to 80% of migrants from Sabrang are women.** Women whose husbands migrate are left behind as heads of household, depending on remittances and what they can earn from their own labor to support their families.

Sabrang village recognized Social Forestry as a potential solution to the untenable situation created by its lack of access and use rights to forests within its own boundaries.

Under Indonesia's participatory tenure system of *Perhutanan Sosial* (Social Forestry), forest dependent communities can apply to obtain forest management licenses, granting them

the formal right to use and manage state-owned forest area for a period of 35 years. In interviews, Sabrang villagers recalled that their main concerns before the introduction of Social Forestry in the village included their limited access to forest resources, the ongoing tenure conflicts between villagers and the state, and the high out-migration of Sabrang residents. They also expressed that, at the time, many villagers felt they were the victims of injustice perpetuated by the state, given that they were surrounded by fertile land and productive forests but had no rights to access the state-owned land and were left in poverty.

The process of application for Social Forestry is complicated, and communities often do not have the capacity to undertake the application on their own. At a minimum, the village would need to prepare 1) a village regulation for the organization for forest management; 2) a village decree for the organization of the village enterprise; and 3) a description of the facilities, including socioeconomic details of the village and a proposed map of the village forest area for which rights would be conferred (Erbaugh 2019). In practice, this would involve considerable time and effort on the part of Sabrang.

Resolved to pursue a Social Forestry permit despite the challenges, the Sabrang village government submitted a formal written request to LSDP SD INPERS in 2017 to provide assistance in preparing and submitting the application. LSDP SD INPERS had been active in Sabrang village since the 1990s through a number of initiatives, including promotion of tourism to the area and education and outreach programs for migrants originating from the village. SD INPERS had also been designated part of the *Pokja PPS* (Working Group for the Acceleration of Social Forestry), having received this designation by decree of

the Governor of East Java and the head of the East Java Forestry Service. In late 2018, the DGM-I second call for subproject proposals was opened, with a thematic focus on tenurial issues.

Subproject Development

Given the alignment of Sabrang village's expressed desire to pursue forest access rights with the focus of the second DGM-I call on issues of tenure and access to forests, LSDP SD INPERS convened a consultation with villagers to propose the idea of developing a proposal to the DGM-I to support Sabrang's Social Forestry application process. Villagers supported this proposal. Over the next several months, LSDP SD INPERS developed the subproject proposal, as guided by the expressed desires of the Sabrang community and with cooperation from the Sabrang village government. Sabrang villagers had full autonomy over the subproject design.

Considerations of gender equality in the subproject development were key, given the stated desire of Sabrang for the subproject to reduce inequality in the community.

Within the design outlined in the subproject proposal document, provisions were made to "encourage the participation of women and other marginalized groups in the institutional structure to ensure that their rights and interests are accommodated in every internal institutional policy." Capacity building and institutional strengthening opportunities for women and women's groups were laid out in the subproject design. Recognizing the issue of outmigration from Sabrang, and especially of women, the subproject was designed also to "encourage women's groups to take advantage of local economic potential, as an effort to improve their welfare and to reduce overseas migrations, especially of women migrants."

The final subproject proposal was delivered in late April 2019, and was one of 57 proposals to be recommended by Samdhana to the NSC for consideration. After consideration by the NSC, and a process of revision as guided by Samdhana to sharpen several concepts in the proposal and clarify the budget, the proposal became one of the 28 subprojects selected for funding under the second DGM-I call for proposals.

Subproject Activities and Inputs Provided

After subproject approval, the first order of business was to prepare and submit Sabrang village's application for the Social Forestry permit. Preparations included meetings to draft a Village Regulation, which had to accompany the Social Forestry permit application and which outlined the community's plan for forest management under the Social Forestry scheme. Community participation in the drafting process for the Village Regulation was initially low, so several specific awareness and socialization events were held to encourage villagers to join the process.

A stakeholders workshop on community economic development was arranged to familiarize stakeholders, including women,

on the principles of community economic development and to build the necessary capacity for villagers to contribute to the development of the business plans. Tasks included: the Development of Business Work Plans and Annual Work Plans for Social Forestry, which were designed through consultative meetings and interviews. It was necessary to increase the capacity of community groups for preparation of baseline data and area mapping, which involved training in the use of GPS, participatory mapping and database development. As part of the application for the Social Forestry permit it was required to establish and provide technical support for Social Forestry Business Groups.

Specific to the objective of decreasing the inequality in the village through Social Forestry, activities conducted as part of the subproject included:

- Training for the community in organizing community groups
- Formation and mentoring of women cadres, including specific gender training and organization of women farmers
- Capacity building for women in policy, planning, and especially forest product processing, to expand women's options for income streams from forest products

Individual Level Impacts of the Subproject

Photo: DGM Indonesia/ Margaretha Seting Beraan



Inputs provided by the DGM-Indonesia throughout this subproject have had a meaningful positive impact on women at the individual level. This is based on responses and anecdotes shared by subproject beneficiaries, both male and female, that were consulted for the case study.

Increased income was the most immediate benefit from participation in the subproject that women beneficiaries reported. Each of the four women beneficiaries interviewed for the case study pointed to increased income from cultivation of plots within the Social Forestry area. Crops such as chili peppers, corn, and eggplant are yielding anywhere from IDR 2 million to 3 million (US\$140 to 210, approximately) for the women, per harvest. Other crops like arabica coffee, bananas, oranges and durian have been planted but are not yet ready for harvest. In one notable case, one of the woman beneficiaries interviewed reported receiving a price between IDR 1 million and 6 million (US\$70 to 420), dependent on market prices, for her *cabe jamu* crop (*Piper retrofractum* or Javanese Long Pepper), a popular spice in the export market to India. She was able to harvest the pepper crop twice a month. With this income from forest crops, the women reported being able to pay off debts, purchase a motorbike, pay

their children's school fees and cover their family's needs with their own income.

Besides financial benefits for themselves, women participating in the subproject were also able to provide income opportunities for other women in the community. To find help with irrigation or harvesting of their crops, many of the women managing their own forest farm plots hired related or neighboring women. At harvest time, three or four women could be hired, at a wage of IDR 60,000 (US\$4.00) per day. This meant the economic benefits of participation in the subproject had a multiplier effect for women—rather than just impacting the woman participating in farming, it also had economic benefits for other women in the community, expanding the impact to a wider network.

Additional economic benefits in the form of increased access to inputs and credit have resulted from the granting of the Social Forestry permit. The Jember Regency government has committed to supplying fertilizer to forest farmers in Sabrang, the Agriculture Service has provided seeds, and the MoEF has provided assistance in the use of chopping and brush-clearing machines. This makes it easier for women forest farmers to maintain and even expand their current forest plots and crop varieties, as they reallocate some of the funds previously earmarked for inputs that are now being provided by the government into other pursuits. Male and female beneficiaries both report easier access to business lines of credit from the banks, opening doors for expansion of current businesses or the ability to pursue new ones.

Increased income from forest farming also led women beneficiaries of the subproject to report an increased peace of mind. Whereas in the past women may have made the choice to work abroad to provide for their families, they now feel they are able to stay in the

community and pursue an income closer to home. Forest farming allows women to remain closer to their children, see family more often, and maintain other networks of social support, easing their concerns and allowing them to report that “the mind is calm and the heart is peaceful.”

Men and women report an increased feeling of security and safety with the formal assurance of their tenurial rights. Villagers reported fear of entering the forest before the Social Forestry permit was secured, because of crime and violence by the state-owned forest enterprise. One woman said she wouldn’t enter the forest before, knowing that the state-owned forestry enterprise *Perum Perhutani* “will hunt us.” With the security of their forest access rights through the subproject, villagers report a reduction in conflicts with *Perum Perhutani*.

Increased knowledge and technical capacity provided through subproject activities was reported by women as a specific benefit of participation in this subproject. Related to both gender equality and social forestry, women reported that they have more understanding now than they did before. Targeted gender equality trainings for women provided opportunities for them to grow comfortable expressing opinions and participating in decision making. A woman reported in the trainings that “they teach us how to talk with dignity and straight forward, they teach us how to talk assertively.” Social forestry training built women’s capacity in policy, planning, and especially forest product processing, expanding their options for income streams from forest products. Unusually for Indonesian women, one woman beneficiary even learned to use a GPS system through the DGM training and participated in the mapping process for the Social Forest area boundary.

An increased willingness to use their voice and express their opinions in public was another positive change women reported as a result of the subproject. In Indonesia’s male-dominated society, women tend to be unwilling to voice their viewpoints or opinions, either because of active discouragement of speaking up or just due to a lack of experience. Through participation in the subproject, however, women felt more empowered to express their opinion in public. This is attributable to increased knowledge provided by subproject trainings—women felt more informed and qualified to give their opinions. One woman beneficiary of the subproject recounted that “now we have the courage to talk about our opinion and mind in front of the crowd and even in the large group of men farmers.” Additionally, LSDP SD INPERS staff actively encouraged women to speak up and dedicated space for women to be heard. While one woman beneficiary admitted that she still did not feel brave enough to speak up in public, she expressed a desire to one day speak in public like some of the other women.

Specifically for the men of Sabrang, an outcome of the subproject was increased recognition of the positive benefits of women’s active participation in managing land. One male beneficiary admitted that the men of Sabrang village “actually have much to learn” from some of the women forest farmers, such as the woman who earned a significant and steady income from her crops of *cabe jamu*. The success of one of the women forest farmers has now motivated her husband to also get involved. Where he was previously employed as a fisherman outside the village, he has since abandoned that occupation to partner with his wife in her forest farming endeavors, helping her with care of her plot. “Since he know[s] that the land is producing income,” she said, he is now recognizing the value of her plot, her work to tend it, and her contributions to the household.

Subproject Impacts at the Community/Societal Level

Photo: DGM Indonesia/ Heri Nugroho



As a result of the DGM Indonesia's influence, the door is beginning to open for societal level shifts, including in the broader gender norms of Sabrang village, indicating some linkage between individual changes and higher scale impacts of the DGM's work.

Three women interviewees noted positive changes in the perceived role of men and women in the household, shifting toward a more equitable division of household responsibilities. One woman noted that, as a result of what she had learned from gender equality trainings through the subproject, she gave her husband "the understanding about how we should work together in this marriage. We are partners in this home." Another woman reported that her husband was now helping to

clean the house and care for the children, and another mentioned that she and her husband now jointly make decisions on household issues like spending or purchasing.

Perceptions of the role of women in forestry are shifting within Sabrang village as a result of the DGM-I. A woman interviewee recalled an instance in the early days of Social Forestry in Sabrang when men would see her entering the forest and call out to her as *andi*, or man. Now, however, men recognize women's aptitude and even leadership in the Social Forestry space. Due in large part to the additional income they are now contributing to the family, men are now supportive of women's forest farming ventures—one woman's husband quit his job to help her manage the forest plot, and another reported that where her husband at first did not want her going into the forest, he is now proud and helps her to load fertilizer onto the motorbike before visiting the forest plot.

Women participants in the subproject are now taking it upon themselves to become organized and share their learning in the agroforestry space. Women interviewees reported that whereas in the past they never came together to discuss forest products or planting, they are now organizing themselves into groups to share information. Women who know about planting or processing of one type of crop organize events to teach other women farmers. Members of Sabrang's women forest farmer group have even created a WhatsApp chat to plan activities and share knowledge.

Through their participation in Social Forestry, women have become increasingly involved in village level policy making. According to officials from the village government, before the implementation of the DGM subproject in Sabrang, village level policy making involved only village officials and members of the village deliberative council. Through the Social

Forestry application process, which included development of the Village Regulation (the forestry management plan), women were invited to consultations to provide input into their desired vision for the Social Forestry process. A female interviewee recalled that “sometimes we were invited to have a discussion, they want to hear our opinion and [understand] the obstacles that we see and what we really want.” A different woman recalled how, in the development of the Village Regulation, her idea for an economic development opportunity specifically for women was included in the plan. She proposed making a food product from one of the harvest plants, asserting that “if we make the food product and then we sell it to the market, then we will have much more income. This is the part men cannot do.” Women’s input was in part the impetus for the decision to prioritize widows, the elderly, and other marginalized peoples in the process of dividing forest plots among households. Village government officials report that women continue to be actively involved in meetings

organized by the village government, noting that “they have attended many meetings with village government and SD INPERS... they become representatives of the people who want to share their feedback and complaints.”

Social Forestry in Sabrang has the potential to stifle the flow of outmigration from the village, and attract former residents back.

Anecdotal evidence suggests that migrant workers, and especially women, are returning to the community after hearing about the income potential of the forest farms. One female beneficiary of the subproject noted that there were now many women forest farmers. “In the old days if you needed money you have to go abroad and be a migrant worker. But since the Social Forestry exists, they don’t go abroad. They become a forest farmer. They have high hope about the future in here.” Sabrang government officials expressed hope Social Forestry will continue to foster an attitude of “Develop Our Village,” and reduce migration out of the area.

Conclusion

The DGM in Indonesia has been successful in supporting meaningful, positive changes for women at multiple scales. In the specific context of the examined subproject—a project in East Java aimed at securing forest access rights within the state-owned forest enterprise for a local community—community members both male and female report a number of benefits and positive shifts for both men and women at the individual level, including tangible benefits like income and access to credit. Men and women also report receiving intangible benefits like increased feelings of security, heightened confidence and new knowledge. Community members also recognize ways in which these individual shifts are leading to positive shifts toward greater gender equality in some village norms, such as perceptions of women’s appropriate roles in forestry. This finding is in line with this Fostering Gender-Transformative Change in Sustainable Forest Management Study’s analytical framework on the progression of gender transformative change, which maintains that inputs provided to women—in the form of assets, skills, or others—lead to women’s gains in voice, agency, and/or income, and men’s increased recognition of the benefits of women in leadership.

The success of DGM Indonesia in engendering positive change for women can be attributed to several factors. Perhaps the most significant has been the **strong leadership pushing for gender equality at multiple levels of DGM-I governance and implementation**, which helped to strengthen the DGM-I gender strategy and sensitivity. This leadership, within the DKN and enabling organizations like AMAN, at the level of the NSC membership, and continuing down into leadership at the NEA level, pushed the DGM-I to adopt innovative strategies for gender sensitivity in the project. **The DGM-I has since the beginning called for a target of at least 30% women beneficiaries in all subprojects**, signaling even in its foundational documents (see the PAD and Operations Manual) a dedication to positive impacts for IPLC women. Within the NEA, **the use of a gender advisor in screening all subproject proposals**, and the advisor’s guidance in strengthening gender strategies in all proposals approved for implementation, was identified by interviewees at all levels, from the World Bank down to the subproject implementing organization, as an important influencing factor in the DGM-I’s ability to ensure that positive changes such as improved tenure security also benefit women. These enabling factors for success should be noted, and where possible incorporated into the design of similar projects in the future.

References

- Abdulkadir-Sunito, M., Siscawati, M. and Iswari, P. (2019). *Analytical framework of Living Spacs and Livelihood with Gender Equality and Social Inclusion (GESI) Perspectives: A Guideline*. Bogor, Indonesia. The Samdhana Institute.
- Arwida, S.D., Maharani, C., Sijapati Basnett, B., Yang, A.L., Resosudarmo, I.A.P., Wong, G., Brockhaus, M. and Madhavan, P. (2016). Gender in Forestry and REDD+ in Indonesia. Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR). Accessed 7 June 2021 at: <https://www.cifor.org/knowledge/publication/6010/>.
- Astri, C., Frisca Tobing, S. and Yulinda Affandi, D. (2020). Land Ownership and Women Empowerment. World Resources Institute (WRI) Indonesia. Accessed 8 June 2021 at: <https://wri-indonesia.org/en/blog/land-ownership-and-women-empowerment>.
- Banjade, M.R., Herawati, T., Liswanti, N. and Mwangi, E. (2016). Tenure reform in Indonesia: When? What? Why?. Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR). Accessed 22 July 2021 at: https://www.cifor.org/publications/pdf_files/infobrief/6333-infobrief.pdf
- Erbaugh, J.T. (2019). Responsibilization and social forestry in Indonesia. *Forest Policy and Economics*, 109. Accessed 9 June 2021 at: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forpol.2019.102019>.
- Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) (2015). Gender and forests in a changing landscape: Understanding women's participation in forestry in Indonesia [Policy Brief]. Accessed 7 June 2019 at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/306105910_Understanding_women's_participation_in_forestry_in_Indonesia.
- International Labour Organization (ILO) (2010). *Labour conditions in forestry in Indonesia*. Jakarta, ILO.
- Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) (2011). Country Gender Profile: Indonesia [Final Report]. Accessed 7 Jun 2021 at: https://www.jica.go.jp/english/our_work/thematic_issues/gender/background/pdf/e10ind.pdf.
- Siscawati, M. (2020). Gender and forest tenure reform in Indonesia. Working Paper 258. Bogor, Indonesia: CIFOR. Accessed 28 July 2021 at https://www.cifor.org/publications/pdf_files/WPapers/WP258Siscawati.pdf.
- Sunderlin W.D. (1999). Development of the Forest Sector in Indonesia. In: Palo M., Uusivuori J. (eds) *World Forests, Society and Environment*. World Forests, vol 1. Springer, Dordrecht. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-011-4746-0_22
- UNDP (2021). Indonesia: Gender Equality. Accessed 7 Jun 2021 at: <https://www.id.undp.org/content/indonesia/en/home/gender-equality.html>.
- Wahyuningsih, M., Pardede, D. and Hapsari, F.A. (2018). Indonesia: Hearing Women's Voices in Managing Natural Resources. Reliefweb. Accessed 8 Jun 2021 at <https://reliefweb.int/report/indonesia/indonesia-hearing-women-s-voices-managing-natural-resources>.

ECO-AUDIT*Environmental Benefits Statement*

The World Bank Group is committed to reducing its environmental footprint. In support of this commitment, we leverage electronic publishing options and print-on-demand technology, which is located in regional hubs worldwide. Together, these initiatives enable print runs to be lowered and shipping distances decreased, resulting in reduced paper consumption, chemical use, greenhouse gas emissions, and waste.

We follow the recommended standards for paper use set by the Green Press Initiative. The majority of our books are printed on Forest Stewardship Council (FSC)-certified paper, with nearly all containing 50-100 percent recycled content. The recycled fiber in our book paper is either unbleached or bleached using totally chlorine-free (TCF), processed chlorine-free (PCF), or enhanced elemental chlorine-free (EECF) processes.

More information about the Bank's environmental philosophy can be found at <http://www.worldbank.org/corporateresponsibility>.

