World Development Report 1993
Investing in Health

Published for the World Bank
Oxford University Press
Foreword

World Development Report 1993, the sixteenth in this annual series, examines the interplay between human health, health policy, and economic development. The three most recent reports—on the environment, on development strategies, and on poverty—have furnished an overview of the goals and means of development. This year’s report on health, like next year’s on infrastructure, examines in depth a single sector in which the impact of public finance and public policy is of particular importance.

Countries at all levels of income have achieved great advances in health. Although an unacceptably high proportion of children in the developing world—one in ten—die before reaching age 5, this number is less than half that of 1960. Declines in poverty have allowed households to increase consumption of the food, clean water, and shelter necessary for good health. Rising educational levels have meant that people are better able to apply new scientific knowledge to promote their own and their families’ health. Health systems have met the demand for better health through an expanded supply of services that offer increasingly potent interventions.

Yet developing countries, and especially their poor, continue to suffer a heavy burden of disease, much of which can be inexpensively prevented or cured. (If the child mortality rate in developing countries were reduced to the level that prevails in high-income countries, 11 million fewer children would die each year.) Furthermore, increasing numbers of developing countries are beginning to face the problems of rising health system costs now experienced by high-income countries.

This Report advocates a three-pronged approach to government policies for improving health in developing countries. First, governments need to foster an economic environment that enables households to improve their own health. Growth policies (including, where necessary, economic adjustment policies) that ensure income gains for the poor are essential. So, too, is expanded investment in schooling, particularly for girls.

Second, government spending on health should be redirected to more cost-effective programs that do more to help the poor. Government spending accounts for half of the $168 billion annual expenditure on health in developing countries. Too much of this sum goes to specialized care in tertiary facilities that provides little gain for the money spent. Too little goes to low-cost, highly effective programs such as control and treatment of infectious diseases and of malnutrition. Developing countries as a group could reduce their burden of disease by 25 percent—the equivalent of averting more than 9 million infant deaths—by redirecting to public health programs and essential clinical services about half, on average, of the government spending that now goes to services of low cost-effectiveness.

Third, governments need to promote greater diversity and competition in the financing and delivery of health services. Government financing of public health and essential clinical services would leave the coverage of remaining clinical services to private finance, usually mediated through insurance, or to social insurance. Government regulation can strengthen private insurance markets by improving incentives for wide coverage and for cost control. Even for publicly financed clinical services, governments can encourage competition and private sector involvement in service supply and can help improve the efficiency of the private sector by generating and disseminating key information. The combination of these measures will improve health outcomes and contain costs while enhancing consumer satisfaction.

Significant reforms in health policy are feasible, as experience in several developing countries has shown. The donor community can assist by financing the transitional costs of change, especially in low-income countries. The reforms outlined in this Report will translate into longer, healthier, and more productive lives for people around the world, and especially for the more than 1 billion poor.

The World Health Organization (WHO) has been a full partner with the World Bank at every
step of the preparation of the Report. I would like to record my appreciation to WHO and to its many staff members at global and regional levels who facilitated this partnership. The Report has benefited greatly from WHO’s extensive technical expertise. Starting from the Report’s conception, WHO participated actively by providing data on various aspects of health development and systematic input for many technical consultations. Perhaps WHO’s most significant contribution was in a jointly sponsored assessment of the global burden of disease, which is a key element of the Report. I look forward to continued collaboration between the World Bank and WHO in the discussion and implementation of the messages in this Report. The United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF), bilateral agencies, and other institutions also contributed their expertise, and the World Bank is grateful to them as well. Specific acknowledgments are provided elsewhere in the Report.

Like its predecessors, World Development Report 1993 includes the World Development Indicators, which offer selected social and economic statistics on 127 countries. The Report is a study by the Bank’s staff, and the judgments made herein do not necessarily reflect the views of the Board of Directors or of the governments they represent.

Lewis T. Preston
President
The World Bank

May 31, 1993

This Report has been prepared by a team led by Dean T. Jamison and comprising José-Luis Bobadilla, Robert Hecht, Kenneth Hill, Philip Musgrove, Helen Saxenian, Jee-Peng Tan, and, part-time, Seth Berkley and Christopher J. L. Murray. Anthony R. Measham drafted and coordinated contributions from the Bank’s Population, Health, and Nutrition Department. Valuable contributions and advice were provided by Susan Cochrane, Thomas W. Merrick, W. Henry Mosley, Alexander Preker, Lant Pritchett, and Michael Walton. Extensive input to the Report from the World Health Organization was coordinated through a Steering Committee chaired by Jean-Paul Jardel. An Advisory Committee chaired by Richard G. A. Feachem provided valuable guidance at all stages of the Report’s preparation. Members of these committees are listed in the Acknowledgments. Peter Cowley, Anna E. Maripuu, Barbara J. McKinney, Karima Saleh, and Abdo S. Yazbeck served as research associates, and interns Lecia A. Brown, Caroline J. Cook, Anna Godal, and Vito Luigi Tanzi assisted the team. The work was carried out under the general direction of Lawrence H. Summers and Nancy Birdsall.

Many others inside and outside the Bank provided helpful comments and contributions (see the Bibliographical note). The Bank’s International Economics Department contributed to the data appendix and was responsible for the World Development Indicators. The production staff of the Report included Ann Beasley, Stephanie Gerard, Jane Gould, Kenneth Hale, Jeffrey N. Lecksell, Nancy Levine, Hugh Nees, Kathy Rosen, and Walton Rosenquist. The support staff was headed by Rhoda Blade-Charest and included Laitan Alli and Nyambura Kimani. Trinidad S. Angeles served as administrative assistant. John Browning was the principal editor, and Rupert Pennant-Rea edited two chapters.

Preparation of this Report was immensely aided by contributions of the participants in a series of consultations and seminars; the subjects and the names of participants are listed in the Acknowledgments. The consultations could not have occurred without financial cooperation from the following organizations, whose assistance is warmly acknowledged: the Canadian International Development Association, the Danish International Development Agency, the Edna McConnell Clark Foundation, the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Rockefeller Foundation, the Swiss Development Cooperation, the U.S. Agency for International Development, the Overseas Development Administration of the United Kingdom, and the Environmental Health Division and the Special Programme for Research and Training in Tropical Diseases of the World Health Organization. The World Health Organization and the United Nations Children’s Fund contributed to the preparation of the statistical appendices. Three academic institutions—the Harvard Center for Population and Development Studies, the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, and the Swiss Tropical Institute—provided important support for the preparation of the Report.
# Contents

**Definitions and data notes**  x

**Overview**  1

- Health systems and their problems  3
- The roles of the government and of the market in health  5
- Government policies for achieving health for all  6
- Improving the economic environment for healthy households  7
- Investing in public health and essential clinical services  8
- Reforming health systems: promoting diversity and competition  11
- An agenda for action  13

1 **Health in developing countries: successes and challenges**  17

- Why health matters  17
- The record of success  21
- Measuring the burden of disease  25
- Challenges for the future  29
- Lessons from the past: explaining declines in mortality  34
- The potential for effective action  35

2 **Households and health**  37

- Household capacity: income and schooling  38
- Policies to strengthen household capacity  44
- What can be done?  51

3 **The roles of the government and the market in health**  52

- Health expenditures and outcomes  53
- The rationales for government action  54
- Value for money in health  59
- Health policy and the performance of health systems  65

4 **Public health**  72

- Population-based health services  72
- Diet and nutrition  75
- Fertility  82
- Reducing abuse of tobacco, alcohol, and drugs  86
- Environmental influences on health  90
- AIDS: a threat to development  99
- The essential public health package  106

5 **Clinical services**  108

- Public and private finance of clinical services  108
- Selecting and financing the essential clinical package  112
- Insurance and finance of discretionary clinical services  119
- Delivery of clinical services  123
- Reorienting clinical services and beyond  132
6 **Health inputs** 134
- Reallocating investments in facilities and equipment 134
- Addressing imbalances in human resources 139
- Improving the selection, acquisition, and use of drugs 144
- Generating information and strengthening research 148

7 **An agenda for action** 156
- Health policy reform in developing countries 156
- International assistance for health 165
- Meeting the challenges of health policy reform 170

**Acknowledgments** 172

**Bibliographical note** 176

**Appendix A. Population and health data** 195

**Appendix B. The global burden of disease, 1990** 213

**World Development Indicators** 227

**Boxes**
1. Investing in health: key messages of this Report 6
2. The World Summit for Children 15
   1.1 Controlling river blindness 19
   1.2 The economic impact of AIDS 20
   1.3 Measuring the burden of disease 26
   1.4 The demographic and epidemiological transitions 30
2.1 Progress in child health in four countries 38
2.2 Teaching schoolchildren about health: radio instruction in Bolivia 48
2.3 Violence against women as a health issue 50
3.1 Paying for tuberculosis control in China 58
3.2 Cost information and management decisions in a Brazilian hospital 60
3.3 Cost-effectiveness of interventions against measles and tuberculosis 63
3.4 Priority health problems: high disease burdens and cost-effective interventions 64
4.1 Women’s nutrition 76
4.2 The Tamil Nadu Integrated Nutrition Project: making supplementary feeding work 80
4.3 World Bank policy on tobacco 89
4.4 After smallpox: slaying the dragon worm 92
4.5 The costs and benefits of investments in water supply and sanitation 93
4.6 Environmental and household control of mosquito vectors 94
4.7 Air pollution and health in Central Europe 97
4.8 Pollution in Japan: prevention would have been better and cheaper than cure 98
4.9 Coping with AIDS in Uganda 104
4.10 HIV in Thailand: from disaster toward containment 105
5.1 Making pregnancy and delivery safe 113
5.2 Integrated management of the sick child 114
5.3 Treatment of sexually transmitted diseases 115
5.4 Short-course treatment of tuberculosis 116
5.5 Targeting public expenditure to the poor 119
5.6 Containing health care costs in industrial countries 122
5.7 Health care reform in the OECD 125
5.8 Traditional medical practitioners and the delivery of essential health services 129
5.9 “Managed competition” and health care reform in the United States 132
6.1 International migration and the global market for health professionals 141
6.2 Community health workers 143
6.3 Buying right: how international agencies save on purchases of pharmaceuticals 146
6.4 The contribution of standardized survey programs to health information 149
6.5 Evaluating cesarean sections in Brazil 150
6.6 An unmet need: inexpensive and simple diagnostics for STDs 154
7.1 Community financing of health centers: the Bamako Initiative 159
7.2 Health sector reforms in Chile 162
7.3 Reform of the Russian health system 164
7.4 Health assistance and the effectiveness of aid 168
7.5 World Bank support for reform of the health sector 169
7.6 Donor coordination in the health sector in Zimbabwe and Bangladesh 170

Text figures
1 Demographic regions used in this Report 2
2 Burden of disease attributable to premature mortality and disability, by demographic region, 1990 3
3 Infant and adult mortality in poor and nonpoor neighborhoods of Porto Alegre, Brazil, 1980 7
1.1 Child mortality by country, 1960 and 1990 22
1.2 Trends in life expectancy by demographic region, 1950-90 23
1.3 Age-standardized female death rates in Chile and in England and Wales, selected years 24
1.4 Change in female age-specific mortality rates in Chile and in England and Wales, selected years 24
1.5 Disease burden by sex and demographic region, 1990 28
1.6 Distribution of disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) lost, by cause, for selected demographic regions, 1990 29
1.7 Trends in life expectancy and fertility in Sub-Saharan Africa and Latin America and the Caribbean, 1960-2020 30
1.8 Median age at death, by demographic region, 1950, 1990, and 2030 32
1.9 Life expectancy and income per capita for selected countries and periods 34
2.1 Mutually reinforcing cycles: reduction of poverty and development of human resources 37
2.2 Child mortality in rich and poor neighborhoods in selected metropolitan areas, late 1980s 40
2.3 Declines in child mortality and growth of income per capita in sixty-five countries 41
2.4 Effect of parents’ schooling on the risk of death by age 2 in selected countries, late 1980s 43
2.5 Schooling and risk factors for adult health, Porto Alegre, Brazil, 1987 44
2.6 Deviation from mean levels of public spending on health in countries receiving and not receiving adjustment lending, 1980-90 46
2.7 Enrollment ratios in India, by grade, about 1980 47
3.1 Life expectancies and health expenditures in selected countries: deviations from estimates based on GDP and schooling 54
3.2 Benefits and costs of forty-seven health interventions 62
4.1 Child mortality (in specific age ranges) and weight-for-age in Bangladesh, India, Papua New Guinea, and Tanzania 77
4.2 Total fertility rates by demographic region, 1950-95 82
4.3 Risk of death by age 5 for fertility-related risk factors in selected countries, late 1980s 83
4.4 Maternal mortality in Romania, 1965-91 86
4.5 Trends in mortality from lung cancer and various other cancers among U.S. males, 1930-90 88
4.6 Population without sanitation or water supply services by demographic region, 1990 91
4.7 Simulated AIDS epidemic in a Sub-Saharan African country 100
4.8 Trends in new HIV infections under alternative assumptions, 1990-2000: Sub-Saharan Africa and Asia 101
5.1 Income and health spending in seventy countries, 1990 110
5.2 Public financing of health services in low- and middle-income countries, 1990 117
6.1 The health system pyramid: where care is provided 135
6.2 Hospital capacity by demographic region, about 1990 136
6.3 Supply of health personnel by demographic region, 1990 or most recent available year 140
7.1 Disbursements of external assistance for the health sector, 1990 166
B.4 Burden of disease by age and the three main groups of causes, 1990 220
B.5 Burden of disease by consequence, sex, and age, 1990 221
B.6 Distribution of the disease burden in children in demographically developing economies, showing the ten main causes, 1990 222
B.7 Distribution of the disease burden in the adult and elderly populations in demographically developing economies, showing the ten main causes, 1990 223
B.8 Deaths by cause and demographic group, 1990 224
Definitions and data notes

Selected terms related to health, as used in this Report

Child mortality. The probability of dying between birth and age 5, expressed per 1,000 live births. The term under-five mortality is also used.

Median age at death. The age below which half of all deaths in a year occur. This measure is determined both by the age distribution of the population and by the age pattern of mortality risks. It does not represent the average age at which any group of individuals will die, and it is not directly related to life expectancy.

Total fertility rate. The number of children that would be born to a woman if she were to live to the end of her childbearing years and bear children at each age in accordance with prevailing age-specific fertility rates.

Externality. A spillover of benefits or losses from one individual to another.

Intervention (in health care). A specific activity meant to reduce disease risks, treat illness, or palliate the consequences of disease and disability.

Allocative efficiency. The extent of optimality in distribution of resources among a number of competing uses.

Technical efficiency. The extent to which choice and utilization of input resources produce a specific health output, intervention, or service at lowest cost.

Cost-effectiveness (in health care). The net gain in health or reduction in disease burden from a health intervention in relation to the cost. Measured in dollars per disability-adjusted life year (see next two entries).

Global burden of disease (GBD). An indicator developed for this Report in collaboration with the World Health Organization that quantifies the loss of healthy life from disease; measured in disability-adjusted life years.

Disability-adjusted life year (DALY). A unit used for measuring both the global burden of disease and the effectiveness of health interventions, as indicated by reductions in the disease burden. It is calculated as the present value of the future years of disability-free life that are lost as the result of the premature deaths or cases of disability occurring in a particular year. (See Box 1.3 and Appendix B for further details.)

Population-based health services. Services, such as immunization, that are directed toward all members of a specific population subgroup.

Tertiary care facility. A hospital or other facility that offers a specialized, highly technical level of health care for the population of a large region. Characteristics include specialized intensive care units, advanced diagnostic support services, and highly specialized personnel.

Country groups

For operational and analytical purposes the World Bank's main criterion for classifying economies is gross national product (GNP) per capita. Every economy is classified as low-income, middle-income (subdivided into lower-middle and upper-middle), or high-income. Other analytical groups, based on regions, exports, and levels of external debt, are also used.

Because of changes in GNP per capita, the country composition of each income group may change from one edition to the next. Once the classification is fixed for any edition, all the historical data presented are based on the same country grouping. The income-based country groupings used in this year's Report are defined as follows.

- Low-income economies are those with a GNP per capita of $635 or less in 1991.
- Middle-income economies are those with a GNP per capita of more than $635 but less than $7,911 in 1991. A further division, at GNP per capita of $2,555 in 1991, is made between lower-middle-income and upper-middle-income economies.
- High-income economies are those with a GNP per capita of $7,911 or more in 1991.
- World comprises all economies, including economies with sparse data and those with less than 1 million population; these are not shown
separately in the main tables but are presented in Table 1a in the technical notes to the World Development Indicators (WDI).

Demographic regions

For purposes of demographic and epidemiological analysis, this year’s Report (including its health data appendices but not the WDI) groups economies into eight demographic regions, defined as follows:

- **Sub-Saharan Africa** comprises all countries south of the Sahara including Madagascar and South Africa but excluding Mauritius, Reunion, and Seychelles, which are in the Other Asia and islands group.
- **India**
- **China**
- **Other Asia and islands** includes the low- and middle-income economies of Asia (excluding India and China) and the islands of the Indian and Pacific oceans except Madagascar.
- **Latin America and the Caribbean** comprises all American and Caribbean economies south of the United States, including Cuba.
- **Middle Eastern crescent** consists of the group of economies extending across North Africa through the Middle East to the Asian republics of the former Soviet Union and including Israel, Malta, Pakistan, and Turkey.
- **Formerly socialist economies of Europe (FSE)** includes the European republics of the former Soviet Union and the formerly socialist economies of Eastern and Central Europe.
- **Established market economies (EME)** includes all the countries of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) except Turkey, as well as a number of small high-income economies in Europe.

These eight regions fall into two broad demographic groups. The first consists of the FSE and EME, where relatively uniform age distributions are leading to older populations. The other six regions are referred to as **demographically developing**, in the sense that their age distributions are younger but aging. The demographically developing economies correspond approximately to the low- and middle-income economies. Figure 1 of the Overview depicts these regional groups. Table A.10 of Appendix A lists all economies by demographic region and indicates their mid-1990 population. Appendix tables A.3 through A.9 provide demographic and health data by economy within these regions for economies with populations greater than 3 million.

The regional grouping of economies in the WDI differs from that used in the main text of this Report. Part 1 of the table “Classification of economies” at the end of the WDI lists countries by the WDI’s income and regional classifications.

Low-income and middle-income economies are sometimes referred to as developing economies. The use of the term is convenient; it is not intended to imply that all economies in the group are experiencing similar development or that other economies have reached a preferred or final stage of development. Classification by income does not necessarily reflect development status. (In the WDI, high-income economies classified as developing by the United Nations or regarded as developing by their authorities are identified by the symbol †.) The use of the term “countries” to refer to economies implies no judgment by the Bank about the legal or other status of a territory.

Analytical groups

For some analytical purposes, other overlapping classifications that are based predominantly on exports or external debt are used, in addition to income or geographic groups. Listed below are the economies in these groups that have populations of more than 1 million. Countries with sparse data and those with less than 1 million population, although not shown separately, are included in group aggregates.

- **Fuel exporters** are countries for which exports of petroleum and gas accounted for at least 50 percent of exports in the period 1987-89. They are Algeria, Angola, Brunei, Congo, Gabon, Islamic Republic of Iran, Iraq, Libya, Nigeria, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Trinidad and Tobago, Turkmenistan, United Arab Emirates, and Venezuela.
- **Severely indebted middle-income economies** (abbreviated to “Severely indebted” in the WDI) are twenty-one countries that are deemed to have encountered severe debt-servicing difficulties. These are defined as countries in which, averaged over 1989-91, either of two key ratios is above critical levels: present value of debt to GNP (80 percent) or present value of debt to exports of goods and all services (200 percent). The twenty-one countries are Albania, Algeria, Angola, Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Bulgaria, Congo, Côte d’Ivoire, Cuba, Ecuador, Iraq, Jamaica, Jordan, Mexico, Mongolia, Morocco, Panama, Peru, Poland, and Syrian Arab Republic.
- In the WDI, **OECD members**, a subgroup of high-income economies, comprises the members of the OECD except for Greece, Portugal, and Tur-
key, which are included among the middle-income economies. In the main text of the Report, the term "OECD countries" includes all OECD members unless otherwise stated.

Data notes

- **Billion** is 1,000 million.
- **Trillion** is 1,000 billion.
- **Tons** are metric tons, equal to 1,000 kilograms, or 2,204.6 pounds.
- **Dollars** are current U.S. dollars unless otherwise specified.
- **Growth rates** are based on constant price data and, unless otherwise noted, have been computed with the use of the least-squares method. See the technical notes to the WDI for details of this method.
- The symbol / in dates, as in "1988/89," means that the period of time may be less than two years but straddles two calendar years and refers to a crop year, a survey year, or a fiscal year.
- The symbol .. in tables means not available.
- The symbol — in tables means not applicable. (In the WDI, a blank is used to mean not applicable.)
- The number 0 or 0.0 in tables and figures means zero or a quantity less than half the unit shown and not known more precisely.

The cutoff date for all data in the WDI is April 30, 1993.

Historical data in this Report may differ from those in previous editions because of continuous updating as better data become available, because of a change to a new base year for constant price data, or because of changes in country composition of income and analytical groups.

Economic and demographic terms are defined in the technical notes to the WDI.

**Acronyms and initials**

- **AIDS** Acquired immune deficiency syndrome
- **ARI** Acute respiratory infection
- **BCG** Bacillus of Calmette and Guérin vaccine (to prevent tuberculosis)
- **DALY** Disability-adjusted life year
- **DPT** Diphtheria, pertussis, and tetanus vaccine
- **EPI** Expanded Programme on Immunization (immunization against diphtheria, pertussis, tetanus, poliomyelitis, measles, and tuberculosis)
- **EPI Plus** EPI with additional components: immunization against hepatitis B and yellow fever and, where appropriate, vitamin A and iodine supplementation
- **GBD** Global burden of disease
- **GDP** Gross domestic product
- **GNP** Gross national product
- **HIV** Human immunodeficiency virus
- **HMO** Health maintenance organization
- **NGO** Nongovernmental organization
- **OECD** Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (Australia, Austria, Belgium, Canada, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Iceland, Ireland, Italy, Japan, Luxembourg, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Portugal, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, United Kingdom, and United States)
- **STD** Sexually transmitted disease
- **UNDP** United Nations Development Programme
- **UNICEF** United Nations Children’s Fund
- **UNPF** United Nations Population Fund
- **WHO** World Health Organization