

COUNTRY PARTNERSHIP FRAMEWORK FOR RWANDA

FY21-FY26

Annexes

Annex 2. Completion and Learning Review.....	2
Annex 3. Options for Further Integrating Gender into the CPF	29
Annex 4. Selected Indicators of Bank Portfolio Performance and Management.....	31
Annex 5. Operations Portfolio (IBRD/IDA and Grants).....	32
Annex 6. Statement of IFC’s Held and Disbursed Portfolio	33
Annex 7. MIGA’s Portfolio and Pipeline	34
Annex 8. CPF Consultations Summary.....	35
Annex 9. Country Portfolio Performance Review recommendations	36

Annex 1. Completion and Learning Review

COUNTRY: The Republic of Rwanda

COVERAGE: Country Partnership Strategy FY14-FY20

DATE OF PERFORMANCE AND LEARNING REVIEW: March 20, 2017

INTRODUCTION

1. **This Completion and Learning Review (CLR) assesses the World Bank Group's (WBG) program in Rwanda during FY14-FY20** (see Table 1 for Summary of the Country Partnership Strategy – CPS - Self-Evaluation Matrix). The CPS was built around three pillars: (i) accelerating economic growth that is private sector driven and job creating; (ii) improving the productivity and incomes of the poor through rural development and social protection; and (ii) supporting accountable governance through public financial management and decentralization. It comprised 12 objectives and 34 indicators. It has drawn on discussions with WBG staff members involved in the delivery of projects and investments, ASA and advisory work, and a range of World Bank documents as well as other reports and discussions with Government of Rwanda (GoR) counterparts. These include the Rwanda Country Program Evaluation FY09-FY17 published by the World Bank's Independent Evaluation Group in June 2018. The CLR covers both program implementation under the CPS and Bank performance.

2. **The CPS was endorsed by the Board of Executive Directors in June 2014 and initially covered the period FY14-FY18.** The Strategy was approved following more than a decade of sustained high growth at an annual average rate of 8% and increases in the incomes of the poorest in Rwanda. The high growth rate was sustained during the first two years of the CPS but by mid-2016 Rwanda's growth started to slow as a result of fiscal consolidation, external economic conditions and environmental shocks that affected food production and security. Scaling-up of public investments in 2018 resulted in a pick-up of growth to 8 to 8.5% in 2018 and up from around 6% in 2017. As highlighted in the SCD, poverty rates, which had fallen from 59% in 2001 to 39% in 2014 (based on the national poverty line), stagnated in 2014-17 as a result of droughts, and lower than expected structural transformation and job creating potential of Rwanda's public investment-led growth model.

3. **A Performance and Learning Review (PLR), endorsed by the Board of Executive Directors on March 10, 2017, confirmed the continued relevance of the CPS structure.** The PLR enhanced the WBG's strategic focus on structural reforms in the energy sector, given growing concerns around the fiscal sustainability of electricity subsidies, and set out a multisectoral approach to improving nutrition that included health, education, and social protection to complement the supply-side approach pursued within agriculture projects. The PLR also extended the CPS to FY20. This two-year extension was designed to allow time to fully anchor the new Country Partnership Framework (CPF) in the Government of Rwanda's (GoR) third development plan, National Strategy of Transformation, which took effect from 2018, and enable the Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD) to be informed by the results of the 2017 Fifth Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey and the 2019 Demographic and Health Survey. This brought the total period covered by the CPS to six years.

4. **The FY14–FY20 CPS focused on supporting specific objectives of the GoR's second Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EDPRS 2).** EDPRS2 aimed to accelerate private sector–led growth and further reduce poverty, including extreme poverty and had the highly ambitious goal of achieving the Vision 2020 goal of reaching lower middle-income status by 2020. It focused on: (i) economic transformation of industry and services; (ii) rural development to reduce the national poverty rate below 30%; (iii) productivity and youth employment; and (iv) accountable governance to improve service delivery as well as citizen participation and satisfaction. In line with revisions to its prescribed Division of Labor (DOL) among development partners, the GoR asked the WBG to remain as lead in the energy sector. It also requested the WBG to lead in urban development, to remain engaged, but no longer lead, in agriculture, and to continue as a silent partner providing budget support in social protection. The World Bank was also asked to support public financial management (PFM) and decentralization, though

these were not explicitly recorded in the revised DOL. By the PLR time, the World Bank's mandate also expanded to cover the entirety of the human development sectors.

5. **During the FY14-FY20 CPS the WBG's engagement in Rwanda expanded.** Under growing IDA allocations, about US\$1.1 billion was committed over the period FY14-FY17 (roughly in line with amounts foreseen in the CPS), followed by a further US\$1,467.2 million following the PLR (FY17) during FY18 and FY19 for a total of US\$2.57 billion under the CPS as a whole. This compares with US\$935 million committed during the previous period FY09–FY13 (which was itself substantially more than originally foreseen in the country Assistance Strategy -CAS). Active projects, including regional projects and Development Policy Operations (DPOs), increased from US\$465 million in FY13 to US\$1,511 million in FY19, and there was a steady increase in annual disbursements over the course of the CPS period from US\$166.94 million in FY14 to US\$282.86 million in FY19.

6. **This Review finds that the overall Development Outcome of the CPS is satisfactory.** The WBG program comprised a coherent blend of ASA, project and development policy financing (DPF) lending complemented by investments by IFC. Three of the 12 objectives were fully achieved, all under the third pillar 'supporting accountable governance through public financial management and decentralization'; seven were mostly achieved; and two partially achieved.¹ There were some exceptional successes, notably in the areas of access to electricity and improvements in the regulatory environment for businesses as well as governance.

7. **Overall WBG performance is rated as good.** The WBG program, including an extensive program of analytical and advisory services, continued to reflect a strong relationship with the GoR. The design of the Strategy reflected an integrated approach to WBG delivery as reflected in its results matrix. There was an appropriate balance of budget support, Program for Result (PforR) and investment lending supported by a solid program of ASA. The World Bank responded quickly to changing context which is demonstrated by focusing the DPO on the energy sector when it became apparent that the rapid electricity access expansion could jeopardize the fiscal sustainability. In practice, synergies across the WBG were not always fully realized, although individually IDA, IFC and MIGA were all responsible for some notable achievements. For example, coordination between World Bank and IFC in the agriculture sector was not consistent and systematic from the beginning of the CPS period but has recently improved. The World Bank benefited from the highly structured Division of Labor instituted by the Government and as a result coordination with other Development Partners was effective. The overall quality of supervision, including management of program risk, and timeliness of implementation was satisfactory. There was consistent and adequate attention to safeguards. In addition, there is now a solid program of ongoing activities for the next strategy period. For these reasons, Bank performance is rated as good.

PROGRESS TOWARDS CPF DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES

8. **The results of the WBG's program in Rwanda are summarized below.** The discussion is organized around the three pillars of the FY14-FY20 CPS namely: (i) accelerating economic growth that is private sector driven and job creating; (ii) improving the productivity and incomes of the poor through rural development and social protection; and (iii) supporting accountable governance through public financial management and decentralization.

Pillar 1: Accelerating economic growth that is private sector driven and job creating

9. The first pillar covered WBG activities in the areas of power, urban development, private sector development and regional integration.

10. **Objective 1 ("increased generation and access to electricity") was mostly achieved.** WBG activities in the energy sector were aimed at enhancing the operational efficiency of the electricity utility and increasing electricity access including through off-grid technologies and facilitating private-sector

¹ Outcomes are rated as 'mostly achieved' where a majority of quantitative targets have been met; 'partially achieved' where some but less than half of quantitative targets have been met; and 'not achieved' where few if any targets have been met.

participation in renewable off-grid electrification. They also supported an increase in the supply of electricity regionally, notably to the national grids of Rwanda, Tanzania and Burundi. As a result of World Bank support, installed generation capacity increased from 110MW to 225MW, slightly less than expected (the target was 300MW) but still comfortably enough to meet demand which has grown slower than originally projected in the CPS period. National access to electricity increased from 18% to 52% (against a target of 50%) with 38% on grid (against a target of 40%) and 14% off-grid (against a target of 10%). Hydropower generation capacity increased by 44.74MW (against a target of 49MW).

11. **Objective 2 (“development plans for secondary cities developed”) was partially achieved.** Under this objective, the World Bank supported the provision of access to basic infrastructure and enhanced urban management in selected urban centers in participating districts. As a result, urban planning and management guidelines for Kigali and secondary cities were developed and adopted. There was also an increase in the share of maintenance expenditures in district budgets from 6.5% to 8% (against a target of 9.5%). However, there was no increase in the supply of affordable housing units as a result of WBG support because the anticipated IFC investment has been delayed. Moreover, the number of people in urban areas within 500 meters of an all-season road increased modestly from 36,000 to 49,209 (against a target of 106,000). This number is expected to reach 79,000 by June 30, 2019.

12. **Objective 3 (“improved environment for private sector investments”), a key focus of the CPS, especially following the PLR in FY17, was mostly achieved.** Three of the seven indicators were achieved: the number of cities with online construction licensing increased from one to seven (against a target of seven); the cost of inspections in the telecoms, beverage and construction sectors fell by 75% (against a target of 10%); and the number of policy reforms to improve GoR service delivery and hence improve the business environment reached 20 (against a target of 20). One indicator was mostly achieved, namely the number of automated licences improving government service delivery which increased from one to six (against a target of seven). Two indicators were partially achieved: preparation for businesses to provide e-feedback on various dimensions of the business environment (public private dialogue) are close to be in place; and four new financial sector laws were enacted (against a target of six). One indicator, namely increased long-term funding to financial institutions, was not validated due to lack of data. However, IFC are investing in the development of a sustainable urban mixed-use community in Kigali, Rwanda. The Project is the first phase of what will ultimately be a 10,000-unit community development; and will consist of 781 residential units (including 252 affordable apartments and 480 middle income condominium apartments and 49 villas) and 35 shop lots with a total area of 1,206 square meters.

13. **Objective 4 (“increased integration into East African Community (EAC) regional markets”) was partially achieved.** The World Bank’s support for regional integration in the area of the Great Lakes aimed to facilitate cross-border trade by increasing the participating countries’ capacity for commerce and reducing the costs faced by traders, especially small-scale and women traders, at targeted locations in the borderlands. The number of visitors to Rwanda from EAC markets increased from approximately 362,000 to approximately 526,000 (against a target of 522,000). However, there were no data available to validate the value of goods traded through specific crossings on the Rwanda-Democratic Republic Congo (DRC) border.

Pillar 2: Improving the productivity and incomes of the poor through rural development and social protection

14. **The second pillar comprised a broad range of support for rural livelihoods, agricultural productivity and commercialization and social protection.** It comprised five objectives and resulted in a number of important achievements.

15. **Objective 5 (“improved agricultural productivity and sustainability”) was mostly achieved.** Under this objective the World Bank supported an increase in the agricultural productivity of organized farmers in the marshlands and hillsides of sub-watersheds targeted for development in an environmentally sustainable manner. It also aimed to strengthen their participation in market-based value chains. As a result of this support, the area of marshland and hillside under irrigation in target areas increased from approximately 25,500 ha to approximately 55,000 ha (against a target of 45,000 ha). The

area of land provided with progressive, bench or radical terraces increased from 848,000 ha to just over 1 million ha (against a target of just over one million ha). A third indicator, namely increased long-term funding to the agriculture sector by IFC was not achieved.

16. **Objective 6 (“improved access of rural/small farmers to inputs, financing and markets”) was mostly achieved.** Two of four indicators were achieved: the seed registration score increased from 12.5 to 20.2 (against a target of 16.3) and the score for plant protection was surpassed (12.5 to 30 against a target of 16.3). Micro finance score was partially achieved where it moved from 59.1 to 70 against a target of 76.8. One indicator was not achieved: annual lending to the agriculture sector which decreased slightly from six percent of total bank lending (against a targeted increase of nine percent).

17. **Objective 7 (“improved agriculture value chains”) was mostly achieved.** The value addition captured within country for coffee export crops increased from 35% to 58% (against a target of 60%) and for tea from 25% to 29.3% (against a target of 40%). The number of horticulture cooperatives with linkages to global firms increased from one to 14 (against a target of 15). A third indicator, an increase in the production of a range of priority crops (maize, rice, wheat, beans, potatoes and cassava) has not yet been achieved. Yields in a number of crops have plateaued in recent years due in part to very small land plot sizes resulting in technical inefficiencies in water distribution, crop choice and planting materials and limiting mechanized ploughing.

18. **Objective 8 (“improved rural roads condition and connectivity to market centers”) was mostly achieved.** The share of the total classified road network in targeted areas that is in good or fair condition is expected to increase from 15% to 32% by June 30,2019 (against a target of 48%) and the share of the rural population in targeted areas with access to all season roads to increase from 15% to 43% (against a target of 50%).

19. **Objective 9 (“enhanced effectiveness and expanded coverage of social protection system”) was mostly achieved.** World Bank support aimed to improve the effectiveness of Rwanda’s social protection system, notably the flagship Vision 2020 Umurenge Program (VUP), for targeted vulnerable groups. The number of sectors covered by VUP direct support increased from 120 to 416 (against a target of 300 sectors) and the number of households covered increased from approximately 19,500 to approximately 108,000 (against a target of 96,000) of which 68% were female headed (against a target of 60%). The number of sectors covered by VUP public works increased from 120 to 264 (against a target of 330; and the number of households covered increased from just under 67,000 to just under 172,000 (against a target of 160,000)..

Pillar 3: Supporting Accountable Governance through Public Financial Management and Decentralization

20. Under Pillar 3, the World Bank supported improvements in the transparency and accountability of public funds, revenue mobilization, and the quality and accessibility development data for decision making.

21. **Objective 10 (“enhanced local government tax generation and administration”) was achieved.** Local government taxes increased by 20% which was the CPS target.

22. **Objective 11 (“improved national and subnational transparency, efficiency, value for money and accountability in the use of public funds”) was achieved.** The share of budget entities (as measured by expenditure) publishing financial statements by the legally required date increased by nearly 87% (against a target of 50%). The share of ministries, departments and agencies receiving an unqualified audit opinion on their financial statements increased from 32% to 57%.

23. **Objective 12 (“improved use of public data for decision making”) was achieved.** The share of ministries, departments and agencies using official statistics for short-term decision making and longer-term policy formulation increased from 39% to over 62% (against a target of 50%).

WBG PERFORMANCE

Relevance – Alignment with GoR and Country Systems

24. **The objectives set out in the CPS were well aligned with the goals of the GoR.** The CPS was tailored to support the objectives of Rwanda's second EDPRS 2, which pursued an ambitious inclusive growth agenda, seeking to accelerate private sector growth and reduce poverty.

25. **The EDPRS 2 also targeted the Vision 2020 goal of lower MIC status, with the WBG's strategic focus strongly linked to helping Rwanda achieve this.** The three sectors in which the WBG provided sustained technical and financial support— energy, agriculture and social protection – were key in supporting the Rwandan economy and reducing the vulnerability of its population. The WBG also supported other areas that were essential conditions for progress towards Middle-income status, including PFM at the national and local levels, development of the TVET system, the business environment, Rwanda's road network, and the financial sector.

26. Alignment with the government's strategy cycles was improved through an extension of the CPS to FY20 in the 2017 PLR. This helped to ensure that the Systematic Country Diagnostic underpinning the next CPF could be based on up-to-date household living standards analysis.

27. **Overall, the WBG's areas of focus and overall program have been responsive to Rwanda's development goals, including its aim to achieve MIC status in a short time frame.** The strategic objectives in the CPS also reflected changes in government priorities following the previous CAS. These included an increased focus on private sector driven growth, a reduced dependency on ODA, accelerated regional integration and renewed attention to urban development.

Capacity Building

28. **Although capacity development was not an explicit strategic objective of the CPS, there was a strong focus on capacity development in many areas of the WBG's program.** This was especially the case in agriculture, social protection, and public resource management. In all three areas the World Bank worked closely with other development partners, and in cases like agriculture, including co-financing which facilitated dedicating some grant resources to capacity building. In social protection the World Bank made key contributions to capacity building through policy dialogue, ASA's and other financing since the inception of the Umurenge program (VUP). DFID's support to the sector is well aligned with the World Bank's and includes resident TA. In agriculture, World Bank initiatives have helped to build capacity among farmers and farmer cooperatives as well as government institutions. DFID, the Dutch government and more recently the Belgian government, also channel their resources through the World Bank. In PFM, the World Bank aligns its support with the basket fund created for this purpose. Overall, capacity development initiatives have helped to improve the GoR's ability to fulfil core functions, including regulation and service delivery. Rwanda improved its government effectiveness percentile rank by eight points in the World Governance Indicators Index between 2009 and 2016. While this primarily reflects GoR's commitment to capacity building, WBG activities across sectors provided sustained support for this aim.

29. **A notable area of the CPS was the World Bank's strong collaboration with the National Institute of Statistics Rwanda (NISR).** This included institutional strengthening work for the NISR through the World Bank's Public Sector Governance PforR operation. The World Bank is also providing TA to NISR in critical areas like poverty measurement. The World Bank has also actively supported and funded the development of several management information systems (MISs), for example MINECOFIN's IFMIS and the education sector MIS. In the energy sector, the World Bank has supported the development of an MIS through an Investment Project Financing (IPF) supporting sector-wide approach project (SWAp). Furthermore, DPF has supported on-going efforts by the Ministry of Local Government (MINALOC) and affiliated agencies to link various databases together in a data management system, with technical assistance funded by DFID.

Instruments – Design of WBG Interventions and Instruments

30. The blend of WBG instruments and activities, as well as their sequencing, were generally mutually reinforcing and well aligned with government priorities. Broadly there was a good balance between lending and ASA activities, including technical assistance and capacity-building support. PforR financing

supplemented IPF in several key areas including skills, agriculture, and PFM. Rwanda was the first country to have a PforR in agriculture and also processed the first additional financing to this PforR. In energy, development policy financing has recently succeeded investment policy financing when it was realized that the sector poses risk to fiscal sustainability. In social protection the reverse has occurred to allow for particular investments to finetune the well-established SP system.

Results – Strength of Results Framework Design

31. CPS outcome indicators used to track progress were generally SMART, although several were subsequently adjusted in the PLR as they were either not adequate or not possible to validate. In some cases, the definitions of objectives could have been improved. The objective of increasing access to electricity, for example, should have explicitly highlighted cost and affordability concerns.

Responsiveness of PLR to Changing Circumstances - Flexibility

32. Several proposals in the PLR sought to adapt WBG engagement to developments in the country context. An enhanced focus on structural reforms in the energy sector was needed to respond to growing concerns regarding the fiscal sustainability of electricity subsidies. The PLR also suggested the adoption of a multisectoral approach to improving nutrition to complement the supply-side approach pursued by agriculture projects. This saw the inclusion of health, education and social protection to the portfolio in efforts to improve nutrition.

ASA Program and Analytical Work

33. The WBG produced a strong body of analytical work. In agriculture, some of these analytics provided essential foundations for lending. In social protection, regular VUP household surveys and impact evaluations helped to scale up the program and improve policies. Regular economic updates were prepared and widely disseminated throughout the evaluation period. The National Institute of Statistics Rwanda (NISR) also published a Poverty Assessment prepared in FY15. The most substantial ASA delivered during the CPS is the WBG-GoR joint publication on “future drivers of growth”. Since its completion, this study has heavily influenced the Vision 2050 which is under preparation and has become the guiding document for engagement not just for the WBG but other bi and multilateral development partners.

34. **The World Bank's analytical work in the urban sector since resuming engagement in this sector has been of high quality and stimulated new approaches within the GoR.** A synthesis note on the role of urbanization in economic development, job creation, and poverty reduction was prepared for the government. Additionally, a 2015 Employment and Jobs Study examined the potential role of the six secondary cities in reducing poverty. These ASA outputs provided a basis for dialogue with the government and structuring the World Bank’s operational engagement in the sector.

35. **The World Bank's analytical work in Rwanda has been focused, directly linked to GoR priorities and WBG’s operational portfolio. However, more could have been done on the dissemination side.** The country team has almost systematically conducted analytical work prior to almost all operational engagement. Most of the time findings and conclusions of these pieces are primarily discussed with the direct counterparts in the GoR. More efforts should be spent on further disseminating findings of analytical work to different parts of the GoR, other development partners, CSOs and the private sector. The recent completion of the joint World Bank-GoR Future Drivers of Growth study and the Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD) are comprehensive pieces of analysis that have been much better disseminated than earlier work. The impact on the policy dialogue with GoR and development partners is evident.

WBG Synergy and Joint Working

36. **Intra-WBG synergies were strong in some sectors but not all.** The CPS specifically identified areas where intra-WBG synergies would be important and pursued for maximum development impact. These were: energy, ICT, agriculture, rural infrastructure, urban development, financial sector, and private sector development. In energy, the World Bank was instrumental in rallying development partners around a SWAp. The World Bank played a convening role and co-chaired the Sector Working Group (SWG), contributing to the rapid development of a sector that had previously suffered from a fragmented

approach. However, because most of the private sector engagement in the sector in the early years of the CPF were based on non-competitive processes, IFC didn't have the chance to engage. MIGA did provide one guarantee to an innovative project, namely a Kivu Lake emitted methane-to-power plant, which is no longer outstanding.

37. **There were several examples of synergy across the WBG in the agriculture sector.** IFC-World Bank synergies were part of TAS P4E implementation, where through AS projects the IFC has been contributing to advancing a reform agenda. There have also been strong synergies in IFC's AS project in support of an innovative multi-stakeholder PPP that seeks to link a high-nutrition food processing plant with farmer cooperatives. Synergies have also been instrumental in the strengthening of Rwanda's business environment. The IFC has built on and complemented earlier World Bank projects through Investment Climate Reform AS projects. World Bank diagnostic ASA and IPF support focused on strengthening regulatory and investments institutions has dovetailed particularly well with: IFC support for operationalizing laws and regulations, improving public-private dialogue and services to private business; and catalytic IFC investments and specific advisory services to support private ventures. One highlight was the IFC's role in securing Rwanda's first PPP transaction, in 2015, the country's first and the first competitively tendered Build, Operate, and Transfer (BOT) water concession in Sub-Saharan Africa (outside of South Africa). The most systematic collaboration has been in the housing sector. The World Bank is financing a line of credit to make longer term financing available to first time home buyers in certain income category and the IFC is partnering with a large private investor to partially fill some of the supply shortage in this category of housing. Both institutions are working closely together to support the GoR establish a refinancing facility for the housing sector.

Selectivity and joint working with other DPs

38. **Rwanda represents one of the best cases of structured and functioning donor coordination and the WBG is well integrated in this country-driven system.** Government-donor-third party forums, including SWGs, DPCG quarterly meetings and annual retreat, have facilitated this coordination and alignment. Notable examples of effective engagement include: the World Bank's lead role in developing and rallying donors around the SWAp in the energy sector; collaboration with other development partners in agriculture, particularly with DFIF, the Dutch and Belgian governments around its agriculture PforR; and in social protection, with regular and effective dialogue through the social protection SWG, an essential part of an overall package of World Bank support that has included DPF, technical assistance and analytical work. There is similar collaboration through SWGs in skills development (TVET) and PFM.

39. **The World Bank's recent engagement in the basic education sector, came to build on other partners' work in the sector.** Following the findings of the "future drivers of growth" study and the global human capital project and index, the GoR invited the World Bank to operationally support reforms in the sector. The World Bank team worked closely with other partners, in particular DFID, USAID and a number of NGOs who have been active in the sector in the last decade. The resulted project design reflects lessons learned by all others and is complementary to ongoing programs of the GoR and those financed by partners.

Supervision and M&E

40. **Several features of Rwanda's institutional environment are conducive to M&E and evidence-based decision-making.** These include the regular, in depth joint monitoring of progress in sector strategy implementation by SWGs. The WBG has made significant contributions towards strengthening M&E. This has in part been achieved through support for SWG activities and the preparation of M&E frameworks for several sector strategies, including in agriculture, energy, social protection, the financial sector, and PFM. Overall, the World Bank has contributed to steady improvements in the timeliness, quality, and dissemination of core economic and social statistics. Nevertheless, weaknesses in M&E remain. SWG monitoring exercises have focused on processes, making it sometimes difficult to keep track of the bigger picture. There have also been data discrepancies in agriculture between different monitoring systems, and pressure from the *imihigo* performance culture to report positive stories.

41. **On WBG portfolio, staffing numbers and profiles, regularity of supervision missions and handholding when needed have proved instrumental in keeping a healthy portfolio.** Rwanda continues to have one of the best performing portfolios in the region. WBG has been proactive in beefing up staffing in the country office with a good balance of international and local staff. A case in point in the human capital sectors which moved from not having any staff on the ground in the early years of the CAS to now having four professional staff given the recent shift to support in this area. Consistent engagement in the SWGs and dialogue with counterparts also make it feasible to identify problems early on and work towards finding solutions.

Overall Implementation and Results

42. World Bank portfolio performance has been good. Disbursement ratios remained above the Africa Region targets during the whole period of the CPS with 28.1% (FY14), 28.3% (FY15), 32.0% (FY16), 25.7% (FY17), 25.52% (FY18) and, 25.24% (FY19). Proactivity was 100% for the only one project at risk in FY14. Among two national projects at risk at the beginning of FY20, one is already back on track with significant implementation progress. By contrast, regional World Bank operations that have included Rwanda have fared less well. Three of the five regional projects active as of April 2018 had at least one moderately unsatisfactory rating in the latest ISR. 88% of the 25 World Bank projects for the period FY09-FY20 received IEG outcome ratings of moderately satisfactory or better. This is significantly higher than the Africa Region average of 65%. IDA 18 program equivalent to US\$928 million (which includes US\$158 over the original allocation) has been delivered. 2 operations are under preparation and will be ready to deliver in FY20 should additional reallocations become available.

ALIGNMENT WITH CORPORATE GOALS

43. **Gender.** The CPS highlighted gender as an overall cross-cutting issue to be pursued. The results framework included gender-disaggregated indicators, such as the number of female-headed households benefiting from social protection programs. Across the portfolio, closing gender gaps in key sectors has been an area of focus. The Great Lakes Emergency Sexual and Gender Based Violence & Women's Health Project (FY14) aimed to: (i) expand the provision of services to mitigate the short and medium-term impact of sexual and gender-based violence; and (ii) expand utilization of a package of health interventions targeted to poor and vulnerable females. By June 2019, the number of beneficiaries under the project had already exceeded 44,000, well above the target of 29,600 beneficiaries. Under the Strengthening Social Protection Project (FY18), enhancements were introduced to the public works component of the VUP to ensure women's access to employment opportunities. This included, for example, the introduction of non-civil work activities like day care to ensure women have a safe place to care for their infants. Emerging evidence from a Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) study indicates that the VUP has increased women's access to labor earnings and financial services, in turn enabling precautionary savings and improved coping capacity in the face of shocks. The project also introduced the nutrition-sensitive cash transfer, which provides cash to poor pregnant and lactating women. The recently approved Quality Basic Education for Human Capital Project (FY20) places emphasis on providing separate toilet facilities for girls and plans to finance new schools in areas where girls have had to move out of the house to attend schools.

44. **There were also several WBG gender-focused analytical products, which informed the country strategies and operations.** In social protection, there is some evidence from a FAO study that the Vision 2020 Umurenge program (VUP), which the World Bank has consistently supported, has increased women's access to labor earnings and financial services, in turn enabling precautionary savings and better coping in the face of shocks. Conversely, the same study found that the VUP only partially promoted economic advancement for women and marginally increased their bargaining power in the household. The study also found that women who were caregivers self-excluded from public works programs; consequently, an extended public works scheme has been launched with expanded employment opportunities, notably for caregiving women.

45. **Climate change.** World Bank support for climate resilience and mitigation has expanded over the last years, through the following programs: (i) The Landscape Approach to Forest Restoration and

Conservation (LAFREC) Project supports an integrated approach for the sustainable management of land and forest resources to enhance climate resilience and ecosystem services; (ii) Rwanda's Cookstove Program that includes Emission Reduction Purchase Agreements (ERPA) with two private-sector project entities (Inyenyeri and DelAgua). The two ERPAs aim to mobilize private sector finance for investments leading to a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions, household air pollution, and forest degradation. (iii) New funding from the Global Environmental Facility will support climate mitigation and resilience in Kigali. (iv) Technical assistance to support the Strategic Program for Climate Resilience, Rwanda's Nationally Determined Contributions and to institutionalize Natural Capital Accounting. MIGA worked with Symbion Power Mauritius Ltd (SPLK) to cover its equity investment to Symbion Power Lake Kivu Limited (SPLK), which is a special purpose vehicle established to develop the Kivu 56 Power Plant using methane from Lake Kivu, but a guarantee was not issued. MIGA is working on a project involving off-grid solar power aimed at increasing access to energy primarily for rural and peri-urban populations without access to the grid. The World Bank's support for sustainable rural and urban development likewise is likely to have contributed to building resilience among communities by improving livelihoods and investing in infrastructure.

LESSONS LEARNED

46. **The FY14-FY20 CPS built on the previous country program (FY09-FY13) and resulted in a steady increase in WBG engagement in Rwanda.** Key lessons learned during this time were as follows:

- **Strong government leadership and discipline have been an important determinant of development progress and ODA effectiveness.** The WBG should maintain the selectivity that has characterized its engagement in Rwanda under the CPS, considering government demand and the comparative advantage of the WBG institutions as well as complementarity with other development partners.
- **General budget support can be an effective means of supporting development, particularly when blended with IPF and TA.** DPOs have offered a means of providing large sums of financing to Rwanda, at relatively low transaction cost, while encouraging steady implementation of the reform agenda. Reforms supported under the energy, social protection and decentralization DPOs, coupled with investments and technical assistance (supported by World Bank IPF and other donors), have been associated with important development gains.
- **Sustained collaboration is essential to realizing synergies across the WBG.** Experience in agriculture sector suggests regular Bank-IFC staff interaction is key and should be increased in other sectors like energy and the financial sector. The CPS sought to reflect synergies across the WBG by integrating World Bank and IFC targets in the results matrix to a greater degree than is often the case. In practice, as noted by IEG, coordinated support while apparent in some areas, was not systematic across areas of WBG involvement.
- **The WBG could have more input into increasing the pool of professional staff in certain fields.** Project implementation experience usually encounter delays in recruitment of SPIU staff, in areas like financial management, procurement and safeguards. Instead of tackling this issue at the project level, the WBG could try to contribute to expanding the pool of professionals in these areas. Examining other experiences in different countries will help in this regard, where the WBG could partner with universities and higher education institutions to introduce practical dimensions in their curriculum and maybe introduce short courses to fresh graduates.
- **Rapid agricultural modernization requires proactive steps to ensure inclusivity.** The growth in nonfarm employment in Rwanda has been achieved in part through a process of rapid modernization in the agriculture sector, which has increased production and moved surplus labor off the farm into the nonfarm economy, including Kigali and secondary towns. But as IEG has noted, these efforts are less likely to result in reduced poverty where inequality is high and could lead to exacerbated poverty or marginalization of disadvantaged groups. The CPF will therefore encourage a more holistic rural-urban approach to ensure inclusive and sustained territorial transformation that does not leave the poor behind or widen inequalities.

- **There is scope to use analytical work more strategically to draw timely attention to binding constraints or important policy reforms.** The World Bank played an important knowledge-generation role through its ASA, notably in its areas of focus, including agriculture and social protection. In the urban sector, ASA helped rebuild the World Bank's knowledge after several years' absence. ASA tasks with broad coverage included regular economic updates, poverty monitoring and analysis, and a high-profile Future Drivers of Growth study. In the financial sector, World Bank ASA and IFC AS represented a major part of its engagement. More integrative analytical work could help draw attention to areas constituting vital foundations for MIC status. DOL.
- **Regional integration (RI) is an important goal for Rwanda given its landlocked status, but RI projects are complex and require extra time.** However, relations between countries in the region of which Rwanda is part have not always been conducive to regional operations. For this reason, among others, RI projects have been taking longer time than national projects for activities to take off which has created a negative perception with Rwanda authorities. Regional operations will therefore remain a part of the WBG's menu of options for Rwanda, but they require extra preparation time and additional resources to ensure effective implementation than other projects.

Annex Table 2.1. Status of Rwanda – FY14-FY20 CPF Results Matrix (Summary table)

Description	Status at CLR	Overall rating
CPS PILLAR 1: ACCELERATING ECONOMIC GROWTH THAT IS PRIVATE-SECTOR DRIVEN AND JOB-CREATING		
CPS Objective 1: Increased generation and access to electricity		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
1.1 Installed generation capacity (MW).	Mostly achieved.	
1.2 National access to electricity (percent).	Achieved	
1.3 (IFC and IDA) Increased hydro power generation capacity (MW).	Mostly achieved	
CPS Objective 2: Development plans for secondary cities developed		PARTIALLY ACHIEVED
2.1 Urban planning and management guidelines for Kigali and secondary cities developed and adopted.	Achieved.	
2.2 Increase in supply of affordable housing units (IFC).	Not achieved.	
2.3 Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all season roads within a 500m range.	Partially achieved.	
2.4 Increase in share of maintenance expenditures of district budget.	Mostly achieved	
CPS Objective 3: Improved environment for private sector investments		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
3.1 (IFC): Number of secondary cities that have online construction permitting.	Achieved	
3.2 Reduced inspection costs and increased market share for private sector in telecoms, beverage and construction sectors (decrease in inspection cost and increase in market share - percent).	Achieved	
3.3 Enhanced Public Private Partnership Environment. Dimensions of PPD environment on which businesses provide e-feedback.	Mostly achieved	
3.4 Increased number of automated licenses to improve Government services delivery.	Mostly achieved	
3.5 Policy reforms to improve GoR service delivery and hence improve business environment for private sector.	Achieved	
3.6 Increased long-term funding to financial institutions.	Achieved	
3.7 Strengthened financial sector legal framework – number of new/updated laws enacted.	Partially achieved	
CPS Objective 4: Increased integration into the EAC regional markets		PARTIALLY ACHIEVED
4.1 Number of visitors from EAC markets.	Achieved.	
4.2 Value of goods traded through Rwanda/DRC border crossings: a) Petite Barriere; b) Rusizi 1.	Not validated	
CPS PILLAR 2: IMPROVING THE PRODUCTIVITY AND INCOMES OF THE POOR THROUGH RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL PROTECTION		
CPS Objective 5: Improved agriculture productivity and sustainability		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
5.1 Marshland and Hillside area under irrigation (ha).	Achieved.	
5.2 Area of land developed with progressive, bench or radical terraces.	Achieved.	
5.3 (IFC): Increased long-term funding to the agriculture sector.	Not validated	
CPS Objective 6: Improved access of rural/small farmers to inputs, financing, and markets		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
6.1 Annual lending to agriculture sector as a percent of total bank lending (percent).	Partially Achieved	
6.2 Improvements in seed registration score.	Achieved.	
6.3 Improvements in micro finance score.	Partially Achieved	
6.4 Improvement in plant protection score.	Achieved	

Description	Status at CLR	Overall rating
CPS Objective 7: Improved agriculture value chains		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
7.1 Production of priority good crops increased.	Not yet achieved	
7.2 Increase of value addition captured within country for coffee and tea export crops.	Achieved	
7.3 Number of horticulture cooperatives with linkages to global firms.	Mostly achieved	
CPS Objective 8: Improved rural roads condition and connectivity to market centers		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
8.1 Roads in good and fair condition as a share of total classified road network.	Partially achieved.	
8.2 Share of rural population with all-season access.	Mostly Achieved.	
CPS Objective 9: Enhanced effectiveness and expanded coverage of social protection system		MOSTLY ACHIEVED
9.1 VUP Direct Support (DS) coverage: (a) Number of Sectors; (b) Number beneficiary households (of which, female headed households).	Achieved.	
9.2 Indicator 9.2: VUP Public Works coverage: (a) Number of sectors. (b) Number of beneficiary households (of which female headed households).	Mostly achieved.	
CPS PILLAR 3: SUPPORTING ACCOUNTABLE GOVERNANCE THROUGH PUBLIC-FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND DECENTRALIZATION		
CPS Objective 10: Enhanced local government tax generation and administration		ACHIEVED
10.1 Percentage increase in local government taxes collected.	Achieved	
CPS Objective 11: Improved national and subnational transparency, efficiency, value for money and accountability in the use of public funds		ACHIEVED
11.1 Publication of audited financial statements for budget entities nine months after the fiscal year when these are due by law.	Achieved	
11.2 Number of ministries, departments and agencies receiving unqualified audit opinion on the financial statements.	Achieved	
CPS Objective 12: Improved use of public data for decision-making		ACHIEVED
12.1 Share of ministries, departments and agencies using official statistics for short-term decision making and longer- term policy formulation.	Achieved	

Annex Table 2.2. Rwanda-FY14-20 CPF Results Matrix Evaluation

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
CPS PILLAR 1: ACCELERATING ECONOMIC GROWTH THAT IS PRIVATE-SECTOR DRIVEN AND JOB-CREATING			
CPS Objective 1: Increased generation and access to electricity MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: EDPRS2 Elements: (i) Access to adequate and reliable electricity services is key to Rwanda’s economic growth by increasing enterprises’ productivity and competitiveness and job creation; (ii) Increased electricity generation capacity to 563 MW, with private sector investment; (iii) accelerated access to electricity, water, roads, and land to priority sectors of the economy and/or large investors.			
1.1. Installed generation capacity (MW).	1.1 Mostly achieved. Baseline (FY13): 110 MW. Target (end FY20): 300 MW. Actual (end FY19): 225 MW, enough to meet demand at this stage, which had grown slower than originally expected during the CPS period [as of Sept. 2019].	MIGA • MIGA guarantee to KivuWatt Ltd. (FY11-FY17) IDA • Rwanda Electricity Access Scale-up and SWAp Development Project (FY10) • Regional Rusumo Falls Hydroelectric Project (FY14). • Rwanda Electricity Sector Strengthening Project (FY16) • DPO series (FY18, FY19 & FY20); • Renewable Energy Fund (FY17) IFC • At least one IPP committed or PPP mandate signed • IFC: Support to RDB, RURA, and MININFRA to strengthen capacity to deal with renewable ASA • Energy Sector Performance Review (Public Sector Expenditure Review) • Increased Electricity Access Impact Evaluation LEN • Energy DPO FY18, FY19 & FY20 • Rwanda Energy Sector DPO (FY18) • 2 nd Rwanda Energy Sector DPO (FY19)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Basing the SWAp (Rwanda Electricity Access Scale-up and Sector Wide Approach) on a sound geospatial plan helped facilitate rapid expansions in access to electricity. This plan also provided the basis for structured engagement by the government with donors and private sector partners, attracting significant financing. • Prioritizing the connection of public facilities ahead of progress on household connections in the off-grid program helped maximize development impact early on.
1.2. National access to electricity (percent).	1.2 Achieved Baseline (FY13): 18%. Target (end FY20): 50% (of which 40% on grid and 10 % off grid). Actual (end FY19): 52% (of which 38% on grid and 14% off grid) [as of April 2019].		
1.3. (IFC and IDA) Increased hydro power generation capacity (MW).	1.3 Mostly achieved Baseline (FY13): 0. Target (end FY20): 49 MW from Ruzizi III. Actual (Sept 2019): 44.74 MW from several small and medium-sized hydropower plants [as of Sept. 2019]		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
CPS Objective 2: Development plans for secondary cities developed PARTIALLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Physical development planning and economic development combined, and coordination of all development sectors strengthened. A network of cities and urban centers created that provide services and attract economic activities countrywide.			
2.1. Urban planning and management guidelines for Kigali and secondary cities developed and adopted.	2.1 Achieved. Baseline (FY13): No. Target (FY20): Yes. Actual (FY15): Yes.	IDA <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Urban Development Project (FY16) IFC <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • IT-based activities to cities across the country as part of its investment climate work • Kinyinya SPV (December 2019) - financing and advice for mortgage system and housing developers • C3P advise Kigali Water project MIGA <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kigali Bulk Water Supply (FY18) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • After a long absence from the urban sector, the World Bank prepared an operation in real time and build capacity during implementation, leading to delays. However, the ASA facilitated dialogue with the government and since the World Bank is sustain its engagement it should effectively influence the government's urbanization approach over time.
2.2. Increase in supply of affordable housing units (IFC).	2.2 Not achieved. Baseline (FY13): 0. Target (FY20): 2750 units. Actual (FY20): 0		
2.3. Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all season roads within a 500m range. Source: Urban Development Project (FY16)	2.3 Partially achieved. Baseline (FY15): 36,000 Target (FY20): 106,000 Estimated by June 30,2019: 79,000 Actual (FY20): 49,209 [as of April 2019]		
2.4. Increase in share of maintenance expenditures of district budget. Source: Urban Development Project (FY16)	2.4 Mostly achieved Baseline (FY15): 6.5% Target (FY20): 9.5% Actual (FY20): 8% [as of April 2019]		
CPS Objective 3: Improved environment for private sector investments MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Increased private sector investment and financing. Accelerated structural changes in the financial sector, in particular to increase long term savings and access to international finance. Strengthened business environment through regulatory reform to spur medium and large investors in priority and emerging sectors of the economy.			
3.1. (IFC): Number of secondary cities that have online construction permitting.	3.1 Achieved Baseline (FY13): 1 city. Target (end FY18): 7 cities. Actual (end FY18): 7 cities	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance for Competitiveness TA Project (FY12) ASA: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NLTA on Competition Policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The WBG was instrumental in capacity building and fostering the development of several institutions. • The improved business environment brought about by reforms contributed to increased investment levels, from US\$800
3.2. Reduced inspection costs and increased market share for private sector in telecoms, beverage and construction sectors (decrease in	3.2 Achieved Baseline (FY15): 0. Target (FY20): 10%. Actual (FY20): 75%		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
inspection cost and increase in market share -%).			million in 2007 to US\$1.675 billion in 2017.
3.3. Enhanced Public Private Partnership Environment. Dimensions of PPD environment on which businesses provide e-feedback.	3.3 Mostly achieved Baseline (FY13): 0. Target (FY20): 6 (business registry, work permits, environment, impact assessment, construction services, inspections). Actual (FY20): Preparation in place for the public private dialogue tool and it is expected to be fully functional by June 30, 2019.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rwanda Economic Update (REU) 7 (Managing Uncertainty for Growth and Poverty Reduction) • Rwanda Economic Update (REU) 8 (Financing Development) • Rwanda Economic Update (REU) 9 (Rwanda at Work) • NLTA on PPP legal and institutional framework and capacity building • Vendor Supply diagnostic IFC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • IFC Investment Services, ICA 	
3.4. Increased number of automated licenses to improve Government services delivery.	3.4 Mostly achieved Baseline (FY13): 1. Target (FY20): 7. Actual (FY20): 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of IT solutions to improve predictability and cost of government services to business • Targeted support for investment promotion in agribusiness (tea and horticulture) and tourism 	
3.5. Policy reforms to improve GoR service delivery and hence improve business environment for private sector.	3.5 Achieved Baseline (FY13): 0 Target (FY20): 20 reforms Actual (FY20): over 20		
3.6. Increased long-term funding to financial institutions.	3.6 Achieved Baseline (FY13): US\$17 million Target (by 2018): US\$80 million Actual (by 2018): US\$150 million		
3.7. Strengthened financial sector legal framework – number of new/updated laws enacted.	3.7 Partially achieved Baseline (FY16): 2 Target (December 2018): 7 (BNR Law, Banking Law, Insurance Law, Pensions Law, Deposit Insurance Law, Microfinance Law, Consumer Protection Law) Actual: 4 (BNR Law, Banking Law, Pensions Law, Deposit Insurance Law)		
CPS Objective 4: Increased integration into the EAC regional markets PARTIALLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Transformed logistics system with a strategic focus on exports.			

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
4.1. Number of visitors from EAC markets. Source: Governance for Competitiveness TA Project (FY12)	4.1 Achieved. Baseline (FY12): 362,433. Target (end FY18): 521,904. Actual (end FY18): 526,227 [2014]	LEN: • Regional Communications Infrastructure Program (FY09) • East Africa Public Health Laboratory Networking Project (FY10) • Governance for Competitiveness TA Project (FY12) • Great Lakes Trade Facilitation Project (FY16)	
4.2. Value of goods traded through Rwanda/DRC border crossings: a) Petite Barriere; b) Rusizi 1.	4.2 Not validated Baseline (FY15): a) US\$35 million; b) US\$27 million. Target (end FY20): a) US\$44.5 million; b) US\$34.5 million. Actual (FY18): data not available	IFC: • IFC: Advisory Services, ICA	
CPS PILLAR 2: IMPROVING THE PRODUCTIVITY AND INCOMES OF THE POOR THROUGH RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL PROTECTION			
CPS Objective 5: Improved agriculture productivity and sustainability MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Increased productivity and sustainability of agriculture.			
5.1. Marshland and Hillside area under irrigation (ha). Source: MINAGRI – (Combine marshlands hillside and small-scale irrigation)	5.1 Achieved. Baseline (FY13): 25,490 ha. Target (FY20): 45,000 ha. Actual (2019): 55,063 ha.	LEN: • Land Husbandry, Water Harvesting and Hillside Irrigation (FY10) • Governance for Competitiveness TA Project (FY12) • Third Rural Sector Support Project (FY12) • Lake Victoria Environmental Management Project (FY12) • Landscape Approach to Forest Restoration and Conservation (FY15) • Transformation of Agriculture Sector PforR (FY15) • Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program 4 Phase 2 (FY18)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Crop intensification and increased commercialization, which the World Bank supported through a mix of investment and capacity building interventions, led to significant results in targeted areas. • Overall, Bank support contributed substantively to progress in improving agricultural productivity and commercialization in marshlands and hillside areas in targeted sites under the RSSP series and the LWH project.
5.2. Area of land developed with progressive, bench or radical terraces. Source : Lake Victoria Environnemental Management Project (FY12)	5.2 Achieved. Baseline (FY13): 848,538 ha. Target (end FY18): 1,050,000 ha. Actual (2019): 1,066,909 ha.	ASA: • Agriculture Policy Note, Rwanda Land Sector Study • Impact of Land Husbandry (DIME) • User Feedback for Extension • Irrigation (DIME)	
5.3. (IFC): Increased long-term funding to the agriculture sector.	5.3 Not validated Baseline (FY13): 0. Target (end FY20): US\$70-75 million. Actual (end FY20): data not available.		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Financial Sector Strengthening and Inclusion IFC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Direct IFC financing for aggregators, and commercial farms. Indirect support for small farms Advice to financial institutions, public sector, PPPs Support enhanced public private dialogue to support investment and growth in export sectors IFC Advisory Services 	
CPS Objective 6: Improved access of rural/small farmers to inputs, financing, and markets MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: none in PLR			
6.1. Annual lending to agriculture sector as a% of total bank lending (%). Source: MINAGRI BNR	6.1 Partially Achieved Baseline (FY16): 6%. Target (FY20): 9%. Actual (FY20): 5.97%	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Land Husbandry, Water Harvesting and Hillside Irrigation (FY10) Third Rural Sector Support Project AF (FY12) Lake Victoria Environmental Management Project (FY12) Transformation of Agriculture Sector PforR (FY15) Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program 4 Phase 2 (FY18) ASA: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agriculture Policy Note Economic Geography and Urbanization Rwanda Rural Finance (DIME) Enabling the Business of Agriculture Report, MINAGRI IFC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Financing and advice to financial institutions Investment in horticulture (tea) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bank supported agriculture together with social protection projects improved financial access, but the development of innovative agriculture finance still faces constraints and remains at an early stage of development.
6.2. Improvements in seed registration score. Source: Transformation of Agriculture Sector PforR (FY15)	6.2 Achieved. Baseline (FY16): 12.5. Target (FY20): 16.3. Actual (FY20): 20.2. [Enabling Business of Agriculture (EBA)]		
6.3 Improvements in micro finance score.	6.3 Partially Achieved Baseline (FY16): 59.1. Target (FY20): 76.8. Actual: 70		
6.4. Improvement in plant protection score.	6.4 Achieved Baseline (FY16): 12.5. Target (FY20): 16.3. Actual: 30		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
CPS Objective 7: Improved agriculture value chains MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Better linkages between large firms and small firms.			
<p>7.1. Production of priority good crops increased. Source: NISR-Seasonal Agricultural Surveys (2019A, 2019B)</p>	<p>7.1 Not yet achieved Baselines (2013): Maize 573,038 MT Wheat 75,913 MT Rice 84,079 MT Beans 452,828 MT Irish potatoes 2,172,421 MT Cassava 2,716,421 <u>Targets (end of FY20):</u> Maize 2,096,239 MT Wheat 347,760MT Rice 377,520,760 MT Beans 868,002MT Irish potatoes 4,772,745MT Cassava 4,270,878MT <u>Actual (end of FY20):</u> Maize 421,218 MT Wheat 15,687 MT Rice 131,577 MT Beans 483,313 MT Irish potatoes 891,197 MT Cassava 1,181,825 MT</p>	<p>LEN:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land Husbandry, Water Harvesting and Hillside Irrigation (FY10) • Third Rural Sector Support Project AF (FY12) • Transformation of Agriculture Sector PforR (FY15) • IFCI investment/Advisory Services • Feeder Roads Development I • Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program 4 Phase 2 (FY18) <p>ASA:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feeder Roads (DIME evaluation) <p>IFC:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financing for aggregators and Commercial farms Advice for branding, traceability, certification for horticulture 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Progress recorded at the national level in implementing the ambitious PSTA-3, supported by the World Bank PforR, has slowed down. Yet, the PforR ended-up being critical in fostering debate on the new agriculture policy, informed by a comprehensive PER and the development of a series of diagnostic tools to examine why PSTA-3 missed its private sector targets. • Dialogue with the private sector could have been more intense to better identify bottlenecks and understand their needs and requirements. • Small average plot sizes have resulted in technical inefficiencies - e.g. in water distribution, crop choice etc. as well as inability to use mechanized ploughing - that have in turn held back progress in yields in recent years.
<p>7.2. Increase of value addition captured within country for coffee and tea export crops.</p>	<p>7.2 Achieved Baseline (FY13): Coffee - 35%, tea - 25%. Target (end FY20): Coffee - 60%, tea - 45%. Actual (2019): Coffee – 58%, tea – 29.3%</p>		
<p>7.3. Number of horticulture cooperatives with linkages to global firms.</p>	<p>7.3 Mostly achieved Baseline (FY13): 1. Target (end FY20): 15. Actual (end FY20): 14</p>		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
CPS Objective 8: Improved rural roads condition and connectivity to market centers MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Quality road network and rural feeder roads extended and in good condition.			
8.1. Roads in good and fair condition as a share of total classified road network. Source: Rwanda Feeder Roads Development Project (FY14)	8.1 Partially achieved. Baseline (FY13): 15%. Target (end FY20): 48%. estimate (end FY19): 32% (actual current achievement is 28%)	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Rwanda Feeder Roads Development Project (FY14) AF Rwanda Feeder Roads Development Project (FY17-TF) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improvements in rural transportation infrastructure led to several economic benefits, especially for remote villages. Households in remote villages see the largest benefits from road rehabilitation, allowing their incomes to catch up with others. The RFRDP did however experience implementation delays due to the change and the lack of capacity of the implementation agency.
8.2. Share of rural population with all-season access. Source: Rwanda Feeder Roads Development Project (FY14)	8.2 Mostly Achieved. Baseline (FY13): 15%. Target (FY20): 50%. Actual (end FY19): 42%.		
CPS Objective 9: Enhanced effectiveness and expanded coverage of social protection system MOSTLY ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Expand social protection coverage of the poor Harmonized social protection interventions to enhance effectiveness and promote graduation from poverty.			
9.1. VUP Direct Support (DS) coverage: (a) Number of Sectors; (b) Number beneficiary households (of which, female headed households). Source: Rwanda Third Support to the Social Protection System (FY14)	9.1 Achieved. (a) Baseline (FY12): 120 Sectors Target (end FY18): 300 Sectors. Already achieved (416 sectors i.e. full national coverage). (b) Baseline (FY12): 19,583 households (60% female headed). Target (end FY20): 96,000 households (63% female headed). (a) Actual (end FY19): 416 sectors. (b) Actual (end FY19): 108,496 (of which 68% female headed).	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Rwanda Third Support to the Social Protection System (FY14) Social Protection DPO (FY15) Social Protection DPO (FY16) Social protection Project (FY18) AAA/ESW: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing a Child Sensitive SP System Early Childhood Development Evaluation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Over the last decade, analytical work recurrently assessed VUP contributions and revealed areas of needed reforms. A feature of the budget support operations was the regular production of evaluations and collection of panel data which helped to adjust in policy and/or targets from one operation or series to the next. Regular Interactions between the World Bank team, Government, and lead donors through the sector working groups were very constructive. The GoR's revised DOL framework in 2013 identifies the World Bank as a main international
9.2. VUP Public Works coverage: (a) Number of sectors. (b) Number of beneficiary households (of which female headed households).	9.2 Mostly achieved. (a) Baseline (FY12): 120 Sectors. Target (end FY20): 330 Sectors. (b) Baseline (FY12): 66,856 households. Target (end FY20): 160,000 households.		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
<p>Source: Rwanda Third Support to the Social Protection System (FY14)</p>	<p>(a) Actual (end FY19): 264 Sectors. (b) Actual (end FY19): 171,790 (of which 52.5% female headed).</p>		<p>partner, along with DFID (the lead donor agency for SP) and UNICEF.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Much work remains to ensure expansion of the coverage of social protection programs. The coverage of PW needs to be extended to a higher proportion of eligible households. Women in households with children and elderly requiring care were less likely to participate in PW. • Building resilience takes time. A 2014 quantitative analysis and a follow-up 2015 qualitative study on the welfare trajectories of VUP beneficiaries suggest that longer term support is needed in order to ensure a gradual and potentially more sustainable expansion in material assets and material wellbeing and build more effective resilience to shocks. • The timing and predictability of the VUP payment is also key to using VUP as an effective risk management instrument. If PW payments could be made more frequently and reliably, this could improve its effectiveness as a risk management tool.

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
CPS PILLAR 3: SUPPORTING ACCOUNTABLE GOVERNANCE THROUGH PUBLIC-FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND DECENTRALIZATION			
CPS Objective 10: Enhanced local government tax generation and administration ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: Widen the local government tax base and increase efficiency in the collection of these taxes.			
10.1. Percentage increase in local government taxes collected.	10.1 Achieved Baseline (FY13): n.a Target (end FY20): 20%. Actual (end FY20): 20%	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of Decentralized Service Delivery Support DPO (FY13) Public Sector Governance Program for Results (FY15) PFM operation (FY19) Improving local government tax administration to support RRA in collecting and redistribute district taxes. ASA: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Governance 4 Competitiveness IFC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> IFC IC 	
CPS Objective 11: Improved national and subnational transparency, efficiency, value for money ACHIEVED and accountability in the use of public funds			
Country Goals: Enhance accountable governance by promoting citizen participation and mobilization for delivery of development, strengthening public accountability and improving service delivery.			
11.1. Publication of audited financial statements for budget entities nine months after the fiscal year when these are due by law. Source: Report of the Auditor General of State finances for the year ended 30 th June 2018 (http://oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=173)	11.1 Achieved Baseline (FY16): 0 Target (end FY19): 50%. Actual (end FY19): 86.6% (Coverage of the OAG audit in expenditure terms)	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of Decentralized Service Delivery Support DPO (FY13) Public Sector Governance Program for Results (FY15) PFM operation (FY19) --- (Rwanda Public Finance Management Reform Project FY19) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The PEFA assessment noted persistent weaknesses in certain dimensions, notably financial reporting, external audit, public asset management, and performance information for service delivery. There has been clear improvement in certain areas such as guidance in budget preparation, medium-term perspective in expenditure budgeting, and consolidation of cash balances through the Treasury Single Account (TSA).
11.2. Number of ministries, departments and agencies receiving unqualified audit opinion on the financial statements.	11.2 Achieved Baseline (FY12): 32%. Target (end FY20): 57%. Actual: (end FY18/19): 57% (financial audit opinion results)		

Cluster of objectives and objective indicators	Status and evaluation summary	Lending and non-lending activities that contributed to the objective	Lessons and suggestions for the new CPF
Source: Report of the Auditor General of State finances for the year ended 30 th June 2018 http://oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=173			
CPS Objective 12: Improved use of public data for decision-making ACHIEVED			
Country Goals: none in PLR			
12.1. Share of ministries, departments and agencies using official statistics for short-term decision making and longer- term policy formulation. Source: User Satisfaction Survey Report - 2016/2017 http://www.statistics.gov.rw/publication/user-satisfaction-survey-report-20162017	12.1. Achieved Baseline (FY12/13): 39% Target (end FY18-19): 50% Actual (end FY18-19): 62.3%.	LEN: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Decentralized Service Delivery Support DPO (FY13) • Public Sector Governance Program for Results (FY15) • PFM operation (FY19) 	

Annex Table 2.3. Rwanda Planned and Delivered IDA Operations FY14-FY20 CPS (US\$ millions)

FY	Project	Original IDA projection		Committed IDA
CPF (April 24, 2014) & PLR (March 20, 2017) Plans			Actual Deliveries	
2014	1. Agriculture 2. Rural Feeder Roads 3. Support to Social Protection System – delivered in FY15 4. Demobilization and Reintegration (AF)	50.9 45.0 70.0 8.8	1. Rwanda Feeder Roads Development Project 2. Regional Rusumo Falls Hydroelectric project 3. Great Lakes Emergency Sexual and Gender-Based Violence and Women’s Health Project 4. Second Emergency Demobilization and Reintegration Project - AF	45.00 113.30 14.95 8.97
	Subtotal (FY14):	174.70		182.22
2015	1. Agriculture (P4R) 2. Energy (Regional) – delivered in FY14 3. Support to Social Protection System 4. Public Sector Governance (PFM, Decentralization and Statistics) (P4R)	100.0 30.0 65.0 100.0	1. Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program Phase 3 – PforR 2. Social Protection System (DPO) 3. Public Sector Governance PforR	100.0 70.0 100.0
	Subtotal (FY15):	295.0		270.0
2016	1. Electricity Sector Strengthening 2. Urban Development Project 3. Second Social Protection System DPO 4. Great Lakes Trade Facilitation Initiative (Regional) 5. Eastern and Southern Africa Higher Education Centers of Excellence	95.0 95.0 95.0 26.0 20.0	1. Rwanda Electricity Sector Strengthening Project 2. Rwanda Urban Development Project 3. Second Social Protection System (DPO) 4. Great Lakes Trade Facilitation Project (Regional) 5. Eastern and Southern Africa Higher Education Centers of Excellence Project (Regional)	95.0 95.0 95.0 26.0 20.0
	Subtotal (FY16):	331.0		331.0
	Subtotal (FY14-16):	800.70		783.22
PLR ONWARDS			Actual Deliveries	
2017	1. AF PforR (Agriculture) 2. Third Social Protection System support DPO	46.0 95.0	1. Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program Phase 3 – PforR - AF 2. Third Social Protection System Support (DPO) 3. Renewable Energy Fund	46.0 95.0 48.94
	Subtotal (FY17):	141.0		189.94
2018	1. Rwanda Priority Skills for Growth 2. Energy DPO 3. Social Protection	120.0 125.0 80.0	1. Rwanda Priority Skills for Growth (PSG) 2. Rwanda Energy Sector Development Policy Operation – DPO 3. Strengthening Social Protection Project 4. Rwanda Stunting Prevention and Reduction Project (unplanned)	120.0 125.0 103.0 55.0

FY	Project	Original IDA projection		Committed IDA
			5. Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program 4 – Phase 2 (unplanned)	100.0
			6. Rwanda Feeder Roads Development Project - AF	68.0
	Subtotal (FY18):	325.0		571.0
2019	1. Energy DPO	125.0	1. Second Rwanda Energy Sector Development Policy Operation – DPO2	125.0
	2. PFM	17.0	2. Rwanda Public Finance Management Reform Project	20.0
			3. Rwanda Housing Finance Project (Unplanned)	150.0
			4. Sustainable Agricultural Intensification and Food Security Project (unplanned)	26.30
			5. Socio-economic Inclusion of Refugees and Host Communities Project (unplanned)	60.0
	Subtotal (FY19):	142.0		381.30
2020	1. Energy DPO	125.0	1. Third Rwanda Energy Sector Development Policy Operation – DPO3	125.0
	2. Urbanization phase II – in preparation & expected to be delivered this FY (US\$ 106.40)	90.0	2. Rwanda Quality Basic Education for Human Capital Development Project (unplanned)	200.0
	3. Centers of Excellence – dropped – RI decision	10.0		
	<i>Subtotal (FY20):</i>	225.0		325.0
	Total planned FY14-20	1,633.70	Total actual (FY14-FY20)	2,250.46

Annex Table 2.4: Planned and Actual Deliveries of Non-Lending Services – ASA (FY14-FY18)

FY	CPF (04/24/2014) & PLR (03/20/2017) Plans	Actual deliveries
2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rwanda Economic Update ● Joint Staff Assessment Note ● FPD Policy Notes ● Agriculture Policy Note ● Land Sector Study ● Health Systems Strengthening - IE ● Support to Capacity Building ● Poverty Assessment ● Competition Assessment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Delivered in FY16
2015	<p>CPF – Table 5: Proposed AAA Program:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Urban Sector Note ● Energy Sector PER ● Rwanda Economic Updates ● Investment Climate (Includes competition policy and other PSD) ● Financial Sector Strengthening and Inclusion ● Rwanda Jobs and Employment Study ● Agriculture Sector Dialogue ● HD Dialogue ● Developing a Child Sensitive SP System ● Public Sector Governance (NLTA) ● Rwanda use of country systems ● Social and Economic Monitoring ● Poverty Assessment ● Development of Risk Profiles <p>PLR – Annex 5 (ASA FY 14 – 16) - Trust Funds & other ASA:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Early Childhood Development (Strategic Impact Evaluation Fund) ● Feeder Roads Development I (FS-GTI) ● Feeder Roads (DIME) ● Impact of Land Husbandry (DIME) ● User Feedback for Extension ● Irrigation (DIME) ● Enhanced Support to the Rwanda Second Emergency Demobilization ● Basic Education Impact Evaluation (SIEF) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Delivered in FY16 ● Delivered in FY17 ● Dropped ● To be delivered in FY20 ● Delivered ● To be delivered in FY20 ● To be delivered in FY22 ● To be delivered in FY22 ● To be delivered in FY22 ● To be delivered in FY20

FY	CPF (04/24/2014) & PLR (03/20/2017) Plans	Actual deliveries
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rwanda Rural Finance (DIME) ● Landscape Approach to Forest Restoration and Conservation ● Agriculture Transformation PforR (MDTF) ● Child Sensitive Social Protection (Early Learning Partnership) ● Feeder Roads Development II (FS-GTI) ● Pay for Performance for Teacher Retention and Recruitment (REACH) ● Building resilience to Flood Hazards ● Scaling up Tree Based Ecosystem Approaches ● Rwanda Country Economic Memorandum ● Economic Geography and Urbanization ● Rwanda Economic Update 7 - Managing Uncertainty for Growth and Poverty Reduction ● Rwanda Economic Update 8 – Finance Development ● Poverty and Labor Analysis TA ● Rwanda Poverty Assessment ● Rwanda Report on the Observance of Standards and Codes (ROSC) A&A 2015 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● To be delivered in FY22 ● To be delivered in FY21 ● <u>Dropped</u> ● To be delivered in FY22 ● <u>Dropped</u> ● Delivered ● Delivered in FY16 ● Delivered in FY16 ● To be delivered in FY20 ● Delivered in FY16
2016		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rwanda Poverty Monitoring (P132133) ● Development of Comprehensive Disaster Risk Profiles for Enhancing Disaster Management in Rwanda (P145464) ● Rwanda ROSC A&A 2015 (P154529) ● Rwanda Economic Update FY16 (P156677) ● Rwanda Economic Update 9 (P158540) ● Poverty and labor analysis TA (P157636) ● SPL Systems in Rwanda (P150643)
2017		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rwanda #P1 Strengthening Financial Stability – Part 2 (P149371) ● Enhancing green economic development in Rwanda’s Secondary Cities (P151955) ● Rwanda SREP Investment Plan (P153777) ● Rw-Preparation of action plans for the development of hydropower, solar energy & dissolved methane for electricity generation (P154303) ● Rwanda Debt Management Reform Plan (P160297)

FY	CPF (04/24/2014) & PLR (03/20/2017) Plans	Actual deliveries
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Economic geography and urbanization (P157637)
2018		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rwanda Poverty Program (P160986) ● Improved sanitation services in unplanned settlements of Kigali (P162085) ● Rwanda FISF (P151374) ● Strengthening the Institute of Certified Public Accountant – Rwanda Governance (P162738) ● Rwanda Economic Update FY18 (P164510)
2019		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rwanda Nutrition Situation Analysis and Policy Options (P162400) ● Rwanda Drivers of Growth Study (P164512) ● Rwanda Forced Displacement Strategy Note (P166457) ● Rwanda Poverty Advisory Services and Analytics (P168190) ● Rwanda Economic Update FY 19 (P168412) ● Rwanda – Policy Dialogue for Strategies to Enhance Urban Mobility in Kigali (P168759) ● Rwanda: Economic Activity and Opportunity for Refugee Inclusion (P169985) ● De-risking Agriculture Finance (P170026) ● Rwanda Education IE (Teacher P4P) (P150337)
2020		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Optimizing the use of Rwanda PFM System to enable Service Delivery (P165606) ● Strengthening Nutrition Sensitive Social Protection in Rwanda (P163635)

Annex 2. Options for Further Integrating Gender into the CPF

During the implementation of the CPF, the WBG will continue to explore options for new interventions and for building on existing work in a way that maximizes the impact of the portfolio on gender gaps, especially those that hold the most promise with regard to women's empowerment and increasing progress towards the demographic dividend.

The team will explore possibilities for bringing more of a focus on women's entrepreneurship and other areas where gender gaps are relevant to private sector development. Under the Rwanda Priority Skills for Growth Additional Financing (P172735) PforR, as well as prioritizing trades that are already attractive to women, through apprenticeships and internships, the team will consider promoting experience in higher paying male-dominated sectors where women currently have less opportunity. Emerging evidence from across the region suggests that women entrepreneurs operating in male-dominated sectors earn significantly higher profits than women in female-dominated sectors and identifies a few key factors that appear to be associated with women working in male-dominated sectors, including: gaining work experience or training in a male-dominated sector; networks and relationships, particularly those with male relatives who may act as role models; and access to information on opportunities in male-dominated sectors (Alibhai et al, 2017; Campos et al, 2015; Cherchi and Kirkwood, 2019). This evidence base could also inform a focus on increasing women's representation in the infrastructure and energy sector under the second and third Rwanda Energy Sector Development Policy Operations (P169040/P166458).

Within the agriculture sector, in addition to the business training supported under the Sustainable Agricultural Intensification and Food Security Project (P164520), the CPF will consider supporting women with non-cognitive skills training, which may not only enhance the performance of women taking up leadership roles but could also impact their likelihood of moving into more profitable export-focused crops. For example, recent evidence from Malawi finds that an increase of one standard deviation in women farmers' non-cognitive ability is associated with a 40% increase in their likelihood of growing tobacco (an export crop) and is a stronger predictor of tobacco adoption than literacy levels and health status. Non-cognitive skills appear to achieve this impact by increasing women's adoption and use of key productive inputs, including labor, fertilizer and agricultural advice services (Montalvao et al, 2017). A focus on supporting non-cognitive skills to enable women's greater participation in cash crop farming would also fit well under the planned Commercialization and Financing for Agricultural Transformation Project (P171462), which aims to promote commercialization among farmers and their cooperatives/organizations, SMEs, and agribusinesses.

The portfolio will have the opportunity to build on the knowledge around the effectiveness of different interventions addressing GBV that is coming out of evaluations of the recently closed Regional Great Lakes Emergency Sexual and Gender Based Violence & Women's Health Project (P147489), which covered Rwanda, DRC, and Burundi. A few broad messages are emerging from this and related work, although many of the results are still preliminary: mental health approaches are promising for both women and men; empowering women economically (such as through cash transfers, public works, etc.) can increase their economic independence and reduce exposure to domestic violence, but a backlash can occur in more conservative communities with relatively less empowered women; adolescent girls programming that combines vocational and life skills training with providing safe spaces for young women has promising impacts on exposure to violence and reproductive health outcomes; the evidence is stronger on engaging beneficiaries as couples rather than engaging men for interventions that seek to influence social norms and attitudes around violence – such couples interventions have also shown promise in terms of promoting greater sharing of household tasks when women and men are engaged together under couples training (e.g. see Doyle et al, 2018, on such an intervention in Rwanda). Work in the social protection sector will also consider integrating the aforementioned evidence on the effectiveness of couples' gender

norms training and engaging men as allies in women's empowerment. The Strengthening Social Protection Project (P162646), for example, could explicitly require fathers as well as mothers to attend parenting sessions as a requirement for the nutrition support grants and could design the program to promote greater sharing of parenting and other domestic tasks between women and men.

Finally, the CPF will consider further developing the evidence base on the question of gender differences in learning outcomes. Analytical work to better understand the size of any gap and underlying causes will be important to allow gender differentiated approaches to addressing the observed gap between expected and learning-adjusted years of education.

Annex 3. Selected Indicators of Bank Portfolio Performance and Management

As of Date 06/10/2020

Indicator	FY17	FY18	FY19	FY20
Portfolio Assessment				
Number of Projects Under Implementation ^a	10.0	13.0	12.0	15.0
Average Implementation Period (years) ^b	4.3	2.6	2.1	2.5
Percent of Problem Projects by Number ^{a,c}	0.0	0.0	8.3	0.0
Percent of Problem Projects by Amount ^{a,c}	0.0	0.0	4.9	0.0
Percent of Projects at Risk by Number ^{a,d}	0.0	7.7	8.3	0.0
Percent of Projects at Risk by Amount ^{a,d}	0.0	8.7	4.9	0.0
Disbursement Ratio (%) ^e	25.4	28.6	28.9	24.5
Portfolio Management				
CPPR during the year (yes/no)				
Supervision Resources (total US\$)				
Average Supervision (US\$/project)				
<hr/>				
Memorandum Item	Since FY80		Last Five FYs	
Proj Eval by IEG by Number	82		9	
Proj Eval by IEG by Amt (US\$ millions)	2,619.7		580.3	
% of IEG Projects Rated U or HU by Number	28.0		0.0	
% of IEG Projects Rated U or HU by Amt	14.4		0.0	

a. As shown in the Annual Report on Portfolio Performance (except for current FY).

b. Average age of projects in the Bank's country portfolio.

c. Percent of projects rated U or HU on development objectives (DO) and/or implementation progress (IP).

d. As defined under the Portfolio Improvement Program.

e. Ratio of disbursements during the year to the undisbursed balance of the Bank's portfolio at the beginning of the year: Investment projects only.

* All indicators are for projects active in the Portfolio, with the exception of Disbursement Ratio, which includes all active projects as well as projects which exited during the fiscal year.

Annex 4. Operations Portfolio (IBRD/IDA and Grants)

As of 05/31/2020

Closed Projects	97
IBRD/IDA*	
Total Disbursed (Active)	752.76
of which has been repaid (1)	0.00
Total Disbursed (Closed)	3,179.54
of which has been repaid	155.35
Total Disbursed (Active + Closed)	3,932.30
of which has been repaid	155.35
Total Undisbursed (Active)	673.59
Total Undisbursed (Closed)	
Total Undisbursed (Active + Closed)	673.5911961

Active Projects

Project ID	Project Name	Last PSR			Fiscal Year	Original Amount in US\$ Millions				Difference Between Expected and Actual Disbursements ^a /	
		Supervision Rating		Undisb.		Orig.	Frm	Rev'd			
		Development Objectives	Implementation Progress								
P150634	Electricity Sector Strengthening Project	MS	MS	2016	0.0	95.0		0.0	38.5	0.0	0.0
P131464	Landscape Approach to Forest Rest/Conser	S	MS	2015	0.0	0.0	9.5	0.0	1.8	1.8	0.0
P161876	PforR for PSTA 4	S	MS	2018	0.0	100.0		0.0	52.7	34.5	65.4
P164130	Refugees & Host Community Rwanda	S	MS	2019	0.0	60.0		0.0	56.5	3.6	0.0
P173855	Rwanda COVID-19 Emergency Response	#	#	2020	0.0	14.3		0.0	6.7	-2.3	0.0
P166458	Rwanda Energy Sector DPO2	S	S	2019	0.0	125.0		0.0	0.0	-110.7	0.0
P165649	Rwanda Housing Finance Project	S	MS	2019	0.0	150.0		0.0	135.3	28.6	0.0
P164807	Rwanda PFM Reform Project	S	S	2019	0.0	20.0		0.0	16.0	2.3	0.0
P252350	Rwanda Priority Skills for Growth (PSG)	S	S	2018	0.0	120.0		0.0	0.0	0.0	-1.3
P168551	Rwanda Quality Basic Education	S	MS	2020	0.0	200.0		0.0	167.8	-12.8	-30.8
P164845	Rwanda Stunting Prevention and Reduction	S	S	2018	0.0	25.0		0.0	15.2	13.1	0.0
P126498	RW: Feeder Roads Development	MS	S	2014	0.0	45.0		0.0	11.9	10.2	0.0
P150844	RW-Urban Development Project	MS	MS	2016	0.0	95.0		0.0	40.9	30.1	0.0
P162646	Strengthening Social Protection Project	S	MS	2018	0.0	80.0		0.0	31.2	24.9	41.5
P169040	Third Rwanda Energy Sector DPO	#	#	2020	0.0	225.0		0.0	99.0	0.0	0.0
Overall Result					0.0	1,354.3	9.5	0.0	673.6	23.3	74.8

* Disbursement data is updated at the end of the first week of the month.

a. Intended disbursements to date minus actual disbursements to date as projected at appraisal.

Annex 5. Statement of IFC's Held and Disbursed Portfolio

As of 05/31/2020

(In US\$ Millions)

FY Approval	Company	Committed					Disbursed Outstanding				
		Loan	Equity	**Quasi Equity	*GT/RM	Participant	Loan	Equity	**Quasi Equity	*GT/RM	Participant
FY19	3B GROUP OF HOTE	3.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY13	AB RWANDA	0.00	0.09	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.09	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY15	AB RWANDA	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY16	AB RWANDA	0.00	0.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.04	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY18	AB RWANDA	0.00	0.39	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.39	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY19	AB RWANDA	0.00	0.14	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.14	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY20	AB RWANDA	0.00	0.27	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.14	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY17	AIFHBV	0.00	1.33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.33	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY19	AIFHBV	0.00	0.53	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.53	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY15	BRALIRWA	12.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	12.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY18	I & M BANK RWAND	0.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	0.00
FY07	INTRASPEED	0.00	0.00	1.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.50	0.00	0.00
FY20	KINYINYA SPV	0.00	0.00	4.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
FY11	MSC LTD	6.38	3.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	6.38	3.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Total Portfolio:		21.88	5.80	16.00	0.00	0.00	18.88	5.67	11.50	0.00	0.00

Annex 6. MIGA's Portfolio and Pipeline

Portfolio

Effective Date	Expiration Date	Project Name	Sector	Investor	Investor Country	PRI*	Gross Exposure (US\$m)
03/30/2018	03/29/2038	Kigali Bulk Water PPP	Infrastructure	Metito Utilities Limited	United Kingdom	x	10.0
							10.0

- MIGA is supporting a UK-based investor with a 20-year PRI covering equity and quasi-equity investments by Metito Utilities Limited of the United Kingdom for the construction, operation, and maintenance of a greenfield 40,000m³/day bulk water facility in Kanzenze, in the southeastern part of Kigali. The project includes a water treatment plant, a well field, pumping stations, pipelines, and storage reservoirs.
- *PRI = Political Risk Insurance (Breach of Contract, Expropriation Transfer Restriction and Inconvertibility, War and Civil Disturbance)

Annex 7. CPF Consultations Summary

Extensive Consultations on the Rwanda CPF were held in early-February 2020 across a wide range of stakeholders and including: (i) representatives of universities; (ii) research institutes; (iii) think tanks; (iv) Civil Societies (CSO) and non-government organizations (NGO); (v) the private sector (PS) ; (vi) development partners (DPs) and (vii) representatives from the government and agencies.

During the consultations with Government stakeholders, the WBG's proposal of a six-year partnership framework was welcomed by the stakeholders. The Government was represented by the ministry of finance; World Bank project line ministries and representatives of project implementation units. Stakeholders commended the proposed CPF's focus on Human capital development, private sector development, access to infrastructure and Digital economy, increasing agricultural productivity and commercialization as well intensifying urban agglomeration, which closely resonates with the Government's national planning priorities. The participants underscored the importance of unlocking private sector investment by creating a conducive climate for access to finance; and building the capacity of the local private sector to enable it to compete with foreign companies for existing opportunities. A representative of the ministry of agriculture stressed the importance of targeting farmers resilience against climate change related challenges they faced recently.

Development Partners (DPs) stakeholders underscored the importance of quality education, skills development as well as enhanced DPs coordination and complementarity. They recommended a common policy dialogue; putting in place financing instrument to create affordable and accessible energy and, enabling a business enforcement that would help public investment to trigger the private sector development. DPs also recommended a sustainable policy program to strengthen the skills in all sectors of the country as a measure to create employment.

The Private Sector (PS) applauded the WBG for recognizing it as a cross cutting driver of development, and for including it as one of the CPF focus areas. Participants identified high cost, access and unreliability electricity, lack of skilled labor and access to finance (especially to SMEs) as major huddles to the sector's development. They recommended strengthening technical and vocational training, unlocking private sector investment as enabling moves to private sector growth and job creation. De-risking agriculture to make banks more confident in lending to agrobusiness investment possible was also recommended by the participants.

During consultations with the CSOs, NGOs, think tank and the academia, participants called for enhanced partnership and engagement with the government and WBG as well as for investment into Non-government actors led research. The CSOs recommended direct collaboration with the WBG and the government in designing and implementing development projects. They highlighted the need to strengthen their own capacity to monitor public policies and to forge an effective partnership with the donors and public authorities. For stronger collaboration and greater effectiveness, the CSOs recommended the World Bank to support a capacity building model that that bring together the Government and other stakeholders for a closer and meaningful collaboration. Research firms and academia underscored the importance of investing in research by universities and research institutes to provide the Government and the WBG with independent data and findings which are instrumental in designing development projects.

Annex 8. Country Portfolio Performance Review recommendations

No	Action	Timeline	Responsibility
1	Improve project readiness by enabling preparatory activities including recruitment of project staff, preparing feasibility studies and detailed designs, and safeguard instruments. (*)	By the effectiveness of a new project	Government of Rwanda & World Bank
2	Put in place a well-streamlined training program in coordination with institutions/universities to strengthen the technical capacity of project staff. This will also increase the potential pool of specialists in key areas such as procurement, financial management, environmental and social safeguards.	July 2020	Government of Rwanda, World Bank, and potentially other Partners
3	Term contracts for project staff should be at least at a minimum of two years after probation to attract well-qualified personnel and avoid staff turnover.	October 1, 2019	Government of Rwanda/Implementing Agencies
4	Expedite the interfacing of STEP and e-procurement systems to minimize duplicative work for project implementing Agencies.	December 2020	World Bank
5	Update the SPIUs structure and salary scales to attract high caliber candidates & again avoid high staff turnover.	July 2020	Government of Rwanda
6	Explore the possibility of streamlining the flow of funds to districts with appropriate fiduciary controls for decentralized projects. This would help LODA to perform more a capacity-building and oversight role.	July 2020	Government of Rwanda
7	Budget for resettlement compensation should be properly planned in time to ensure adequate & available funding in the next fiscal year.	Immediate	Government of Rwanda

(*) Preparatory activities can be financed by predecessor projects, project preparation advances (PPA) or retro-active financing

