FRAMING THE SOCIAL CONTRACT: A REVIEW OF ALGERIA, MOROCCO AND TUNISIA

Jenny Gold, Elissar Tatum Harati

July 2018

KEY MESSAGES:
The Arab Uprisings demonstrated a need for a new social contract in Maghreb countries as well as likely other regions, built on greater citizen trust, and inclusive and accountable service delivery. This brief focuses on key elements of the Social Contract, by comparing data from Algeria, Morocco and Tunisia:

- Women, youth, and marginalized groups need to be engaged in the social dialogue, and receive observed benefits from social services for a more inclusive Social Contract;
- Reforms should be geared towards improving service delivery at the municipal, national and regional levels across different sectors (health, education, water, electricity, etc.);
- Citizen engagement can strengthen the Social Contract between government and citizens, by making it more inclusive and providing feedback to improve the quality of services, address constraints, etc.

Rationale
Countries face competing development priorities, from engaging youth, to providing security and improving health care. Achieving these priorities requires involving multiple stakeholders (government, private sector, civil society, etc.). In practice, the Social Contract is the trade-off and consensus building between government, multiple stakeholders and citizens on directions to advance these reforms at the national and decentralized levels. There is an expectation that economic development will result in beneficial outcomes (while, not always the case). How can national development programs better respond to the expectations of citizens?

To be responsive, country programs need to address inequalities in development outcomes, as well as constraints which limit the benefits of development programs. Constraints may relate to inadequacies around voice and accountability, as well as how the current policies and social services deliver the expected benefits (health, education, water, etc.). The Social Contract offers a framework to guide the government-citizen relationship and guide how resources can be allocated to respond to the needs of different social groups. At the root of the framework is building trust and legitimacy in national institutions, which takes into consideration the roles of different groups in achieving development objectives.

This brief reviews the Social Contract in Algeria, Morocco and Tunisia. The objective is to use publicly available data to analyze citizen priorities and draw lessons on how to tailor operational support and measure results related to the Social Contract. The framework used to analyze the Social Contract looks at the following questions:

- **Priorities:** What are the priorities of citizens that frame the Social Contract in each country?
- **Citizen engagement:** What is the involvement of citizens and civil society groups in addressing these priorities?
- **Inequalities and constraints:** What are the key
issues that need to be addressed in each priority area?

**Methodology.** The priorities to frame the analysis of the Social Contract in each country were identified from citizen perception surveys. The analysis of citizen engagement used qualitative reports on social dialogue in each country, as well as data on citizen voice and participation. The analysis of inequalities and constraints triangulated the available data sources to assess key issues related to each priority. The main data sources included: Afro and Arab Barometer, World Governance Indicators, Global Youth Development Index, World Values Survey, World Development Indicators, Sahwa Youth Surveys, World Gallup Poll, Multiple Indicator Cluster Surveys (MICS), Human Development Report, Women Business and Law Database, World Bank Enterprise Surveys, and data from national statistic offices on health, employment, education and social protection. The focus was on data from the last five years, when available, and identifying indicators that could inform the problem analysis framing the Social Contract.

**Review Findings**

**DEVELOPMENT PRIORITIES IDENTIFIED BY CITIZENS**

Development priorities identified from citizen perception surveys included:

- addressing poverty, improving the economy, health, education and infrastructure (including water and housing);
- cross-cutting issues such as improving accountability, the role of women, and trust in local and national government services;
- concerns of youth specifically related to jobs, security, and the influence of religion in politics.

**CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT TO ADDRESS PRIORITIES**

Voice and accountability remain low in all three countries, with Tunisia showing promising trends: Tunisia ranked 57th, Morocco 29th and Algeria 24th percentile in 2016, compared to respectively 36th, 28th and 20th in 2011. Civic participation, openness of the media, internet penetration, trust, and religious beliefs can be either enablers or constraints to citizen engagement. In all three countries, fewer than 50 percent of citizens reported using the internet in the last 12 months. The Freedom of the World Score, which considers political and civil rights, was highest for Tunisia (78 percent), compared to 41 and 35 percent in Morocco and Algeria, respectively.

Across all three countries, most citizens (over 70 percent) report having a strong feeling of social belonging. There is also an important link between religion and development. In Tunisia, 52 percent of citizens report that the laws should follow the values of Islam, while only 17 percent believe that religious leaders should influence government decisions. In Morocco, over 87 percent of citizens report that religion is very important in daily life.

**Voice of youth and women.** According to the Youth Development Index, youth engagement has fallen (Figure 1), particularly in areas of civic participation. In Tunisia, 80 percent of youth report that ordinary citizens can influence the political process while less than ten percent of youth are interested in politics. Nonetheless, there is opportunity to engage youth – in all three countries, civic engagement is higher among young people than in other age groups, with self-expression increasing by education level. The collective organized influence of women is also weak (Figure 2).

**KEY ISSUES TO ADDRESS IN EACH AREA OF CITIZEN PRIORITY: INEQUALITIES AND CONSTRAINTS**

**Challenges to economic improvement:** The Index of Economic Freedom remains low in the three countries: 56 percent in Tunisia, 62 percent in Morocco, and 47 percent in Algeria. Gender norms, youth inactivity, alignment of skills to jobs, perceptions of corruption, and access to finance are among the constraints.

- In Morocco, poverty is seen as a result of inactivity – there is 80 percent dissatisfaction with the government’s efforts to create jobs. A similar dissatisfaction is seen in Tunisia and Algeria.
- In Tunisia, new jobs are often for low skilled workers. In Algeria, 37 percent of firms report the workforce is inadequately educated. Most opportunities are in the informal sector (Tunisia 40 percent, Morocco 70 percent, Algeria 40 percent).
- In regards to access to finance, the poor and women face the biggest burden. Among the poor, 37 percent in Algeria, 17 percent in Tunisia, and 25 percent in Morocco have a bank account. Among women, that is 40, 21 and 31 percent, respectively.
Youth inactivity. In Algeria, 26 percent of youth 16-24 are not engaged in education or employment (NEETs) — unemployment is highest among educated youth. In Morocco, youth unemployment is 25 percent for higher education diploma holders, compared to 9 percent overall. In Tunisia, unemployment varies by education level and region. Perceptions of corruption, access to information (internet/media) and nepotism are constraints limiting employment and entrepreneurship. In Tunisia, 70 percent believe corruption is widespread in the public and private sectors; 25 percent of youth find jobs through a personal connection.

Discrimination of women. In Morocco, only three percent of women, versus 35 percent of men are actively employed. In Tunisia, most NEETs are women (81 percent rural, 60 percent urban, compared to 47 and 35 percent of men, respectively). Challenges range from beliefs around roles of married women to perceptions of men being more capable. The inequality of the family code is another challenge (marriage, child custody, inheritance). In Algeria, women face constraints to obtain an identity card and lack protection against domestic violence. In Morocco and Tunisia, women are similarly constrained, although the number of legal gender differences is less than in Algeria.

Challenges to municipal services. Constraints include bribes to receive services, and a lack of trust in service providers and dissatisfaction with the quality of services at the municipal level.

- In Tunisia and Morocco, police and religious leaders are among the most trusted actors, with municipalities and government of lower importance. In Tunisia, unemployment is highest among educated youth.
- In Tunisia, health and education are among the sectors with the highest bribery. In Morocco, most people (70 percent) who pay bribes are poor.
- In all three countries, there is low satisfaction with the delivery of municipal level services (Table 1).

Table 1: Perceptions of services and government efforts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>MOROCCO</th>
<th>TUNISIA</th>
<th>ALGERIA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education quality</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care quality</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efforts to deal with the poor</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Challenges to health services. In Morocco, the low satisfaction with health services relates to the cost of drugs, infrastructure, waiting times, hygiene and staff attitudes in health centers. In Tunisia, the low satisfaction relates to shortages in medicines and medical staff in public clinics. The quality of public facilities is lagging — Algeria faces a similar challenge. In Tunisia, where the dialogue on the Social Contract is most advanced, there is a focus on reinforcing the decentralized health infrastructure.

Financing and demand-side factors also affect the use of health services. In Morocco, out-of-pocket expenditure is high (58 percent, compared to 38 and 27 percent in Tunisia and Algeria, respectively). Figure 4 shows issues related to poor access to services in local communities. In Algeria, 50 percent of citizens report having difficulty accessing public clinics and hospitals.

In regards to health outcomes, the available data from Tunisia shows some inequities by region and women’s education level: 71 percent of uneducated mothers have four or more prenatal care visits, compared to over 82 percent of mothers with primary education. In Morocco, available data shows inequities by rural-urban geography, education level and wealth: 74 percent of uneducated mothers have prenatal care, compared to 90 percent of educated mothers; 54 percent of rural women have assisted births, compared to 91 percent of urban women. In Algeria, similar inequities are seen: 48 percent of uneducated mothers have four or more prenatal visits, compared to 72 percent with secondary education. Inequities are also seen for chronic disease in Algeria.

Challenges to educational services. While most Moroccans attend public schools due to cost (97 percent), private schools are more desirable and perform better. Challenges of public education include quality, distance to schools and low scores in science and math in rural areas. In Tunisia, citizen report dissatisfaction with the conditions of the public facilities and lack of qualified teachers — private schools and urban schools perform better. In Algeria, overall performance of the public schools is low, compared to the regional average, especially in sciences.
School enrollment drops at the secondary level. In Morocco, inequalities are seen by wealth: 26 percent of children of primary age in the poorest quintiles are out of school and 72 percent of children of secondary age. In Tunisia, inequalities in secondary school enrollment are seen by wealth, rural/urban geography and region. In Algeria, the wealth of the household also influences enrollment in secondary school: 63, compared to 87 percent of girls, and 60, compared to 85 percent of boys from the lowest vs. highest wealth quintiles are in school.

### Operational Considerations
The results of this analysis suggest that the following are key to operationalizing the Social Contract:

- creating mechanisms for social dialogue in communities, particularly for youth and women to influence government services;
- creating opportunities to engage youth and women in entrepreneurship;
- promoting behavioral change among families and trusted leaders on the roles of women;
- increasing the accountability of municipal services to citizens, especially in rural areas and lagging regions;
- improving the quality of health, education, water and other services in weak performing municipalities;
- reducing the cost of services for the poor, including formal costs (user fees, transport) and bribes.

### Possible Indicators
The following are potential indicators, which could be disaggregated to understand needs in different sub-groups and to monitor progress on the Social Contract:

- voice and accountability percentile rank;
- use of internet in the last 12 months;
- Youth Development Index;
- perceptions of policies in relation to religious values;
- youth membership in civic associations;
- confidence in women’s groups;
- satisfaction with government efforts to create jobs;
- extent that skills of new graduates align to jobs;
- coverage of social protection for informally employed;
- youth engaged in entrepreneurship (men/women);
- population of youth NEETs (men/women);
- perceptions of women’s capability in the workforce;
- satisfaction with the quality of local services;
- trust in service providers and local government;
- perceptions of corruption to access local services;
- health and education outcomes disaggregated by municipality, income & education level of parents.

### End Notes
2 World Development Indicators, World Bank, 2016.
8 Global Youth Development Index and Report, Common Wealth Secretariat, 2016.
9 Tunisia Youth Survey, Sahwa and Center of Arab Woman for Training and Research, 2015.
14 Enquête Nationale sur la Perception des Mesures Du Développement Durable, Haut Commissariat au Plan (HCP), 2016.
15 Afrobarometer, Morocco, 2015.
23 Breaking the Barriers to Youth Inclusion: Tunisia, World Bank, 2014.
28 Albanian Youth Survey, Sahwa and Centre de Recherche en Economie Appliquée pour le Développement, 2015.
32 Tunisia’s Political Barometer, Sigma Conseil, 2016. [Arabic]
42 Ibid, Afrobarometer, Algeria 2014.
43 Ibid, World Development Indicators, 2016.

This HNP Knowledge Brief highlights the key findings from a study by the World Bank on the “Analysis of the Social Contract in the Maghreb” by Jenny Gold and Elissar Tatum Harati.