RESULTS IN THE
LATIN AMERICA &
CARIBBEAN REGION
RESULTS IN THE
LATIN AMERICA &
CARIBBEAN REGION
# Table of Contents

1. Foreword
2. Argentina Increases Access to Basic Health Services for Uninsured Mothers and their Children
6. Improved Services and Better Resource Management in Argentina
14. Rio de Janeiro Improves Service Delivery and Reforms its Fiscal and Public Sectors
17. Expanding Economic Opportunities and Improving Quality of Life in Brazil
21. Brazil Strengthens Oversight of Public Expenditures
24. Chile Establishes a National System of Social Protection
28. Agricultural Innovation for a Competitive Chile
32. A More Promising Future for Poor Youth in the Dominican Republic
36. Using Dialogue to Inform Public Policies in the Dominican Republic
40. Grenada’s Land Registry Goes Digital
44. Guatemala Seeks to Increase Public Confidence
48. Securing Land Rights for the Poor in Nicaragua
52. Nicaragua Builds Confidence in Financial Services
56. Suriname Reconnects with Global Markets
60. Trinidad and Tobago Promotes Foreign Investment
64. Uruguay Expands its Full-Time School Model
68. A Regional Network of Access to Information Practitioners in Latin America
72. Refining Performance of Credit Unions for the Eastern Caribbean

---

**South South Knowledge Exchange Hub**

77. Improved Early Childhood Care and Development Action Plans in La Paz and El Alto, Bolivia
83. Enhancing South-South Cooperation to Reduce Urban Poverty
91. Social Inclusion through Sports and Physical Culture in Brazil
97. Reducing Vulnerability to Climate Change in the Caribbean
The Latin America and Caribbean region has had impressive achievements in the past decade, such as cutting extreme poverty by half and adding more than 50 million people to the middle class. Beyond the positive external conditions, it was the concerted efforts and dedication of the region’s countries to improve the lives of their citizens that enabled these and many other remarkable results.

The World Bank is proud to be a part of this story, learning from our partners and contributing with knowledge, convening power and resources for initiatives ranging from the local to the regional, increasing opportunities for all Latin Americans.

Results on the ground are at the core of the World Bank’s mission to eradicate extreme poverty and share the benefits of prosperity, especially for those at the bottom of the social pyramid. This publication presents some of the recent results the World Bank Group has helped achieve in the Latin America and Caribbean Region.

Hasan A. Tuluy
Vice President
Latin America and Caribbean Region.
World Bank
ARGENTINA INCREASES ACCESS TO BASIC HEALTH SERVICES FOR UNINSURED MOTHERS AND THEIR CHILDREN

In its first phase, Plan Nacer provided incentives to nine provinces to improve access to basic health services for vulnerable pregnant women and children. In its second phase, the Plan became nationwide (24 provinces), providing health insurance and basic services to 96 percent of eligible women and children. Performance-based payments were based on the number of eligible women and children enrolled and on health indicators achieved.

CHALLENGE

Despite Argentina's recovery after the deep economic crisis of 1999-2002, many problems persisted, including low access and quality of health services for the poor. Immediately after the 2002 crisis, the percentage of the population not covered by formal health insurance had risen to 44 percent (from 38 percent in 1997). Those without formal health insurance used the public healthcare system, which had significant shortfalls in quality and in service availability. This system was financed from public funds in a traditional manner based on financing of inputs, without any link between health facility revenues and the quality of care provided.

SOLUTION

In 2003, in response to the crisis, and with financial and technical assistance from The World Bank, the Government of Argentina developed a reform program that included Plan Nacer, a provincial public insurance program that provides a free basic package of pre-defined cost-effective services to women and children without formal health insurance through participating healthcare providers.

In its second phase, Plan Nacer was scaled up to cover all provinces in the country. All the public providers in the provinces participated and received payments on a fee-for-service basis (conditional on quality) on top of the financing they receive from the public system on a traditional basis. A second level of Results-Based Financing (RBF) provides payments to the provinces when they achieve certain goals, as part of a two-stage incentive mechanism.

RESULTS

During Plan Nacer’s second phase, between 2006 and 2012, large improvements were seen in a range of health indicators among uninsured pregnant women and children. These include:

- Newborns weighing more than 2,500 grams rose from 47 percent to 90 percent.
- Pregnant women with the first antenatal care visit before the 20th week of pregnancy climbed from 23 percent to 67 percent.
- Pregnant women tested for syphilis (VDRL) during pregnancy and tetanus vaccine previous to delivery increased from 45 percent to 83 percent.
- Eligible children under 18 months old with coverage of measles vaccine or triple viral rose from 45 percent to 77 percent.
- Children aged 1 year or less, with all healthy children consultations up to date (percentile of weight and height) increased from 12 percent to 45 percent.

to 2008 and found that the program led to a 32 percent decrease in stillbirths and a 74 percent drop in in-hospital neonatal deaths for program beneficiaries that used larger maternities.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

The second phase of Plan Nacer was supported by a Bank loan of US$300 million. This came after an earlier loan of US$135.8 million in support of the program’s first phase. In addition, the Bank provided a large amount of technical assistance to the program and was closely engaged on the ground. Most of the Bank's team consisted of country-based staff who engaged constantly with the Government team.

**PARTNERS**

A distinguishing feature of Plan Nacer is its implementation in the context of a federal system, requiring partnerships and annual negotiations between the 24 provincial governments and the National Government. The Bank was also a key partner and was closely engaged on the ground with the Plan’s implementation.

**MOVING FORWARD**

Plan Nacer has now been succeeded by Plan Sumar, which includes additional population groups: children and youth up to the age of 19 and women between the age of 20 and 64 that are uninsured. Financial sustainability is not an issue, given that Plan Nacer cost only about 1 percent of total provincial public health spending on average.

**BENEFICIARIES**

The beneficiaries of Plan Nacer consisted of all pregnant women and children under the age of six.

Analia, 21, a native of Chaco Province (one of the poorest in the country), and a beneficiary of Plan Nacer, says: “Since I was pregnant, I have been going to the Villa Libertad Health center. The attention I received was always very good. I would come in the mornings and I would see the doctor. I then developed high blood pressure, and I was referred to Perrando Hospital. My daughter Eugenia was born prematurely, but she was very healthy.”
After Argentina recovered from the 2001-2002 crisis, the country faced the challenge of establishing the foundation for sustainable and more equitable growth, which required difficult structural and governance reforms. Increasing public sector transparency and efficiency, and improving institutions at a national and subnational level, was crucial.

**Challenge**

After Argentina recovered from the 2001-2002 crisis, the country faced the challenge of establishing the foundation for sustainable and more equitable growth, which required difficult structural and governance reforms. Increasing public sector transparency and efficiency, and improving institutions at a national and subnational level was crucial.

**Solution**

The Subnational Government Public Sector Modernization Project was designed to build on past efforts at a subnational level (provincial and municipal development operations) which had indicated that provinces that modernized their administrations had more opportunities of fiscal autonomy, a greater cushion for economic downturns, and were better able to balance their accounts.

In response to the Ministry of the Interior’s call for institutional strengthening support, the provincial Governments applied for technical assistance. The provinces supported by the project demonstrated progress in their core sector areas and reforms were undertaken in judicial management, electronic Government, and public registries, among others.

**Results**

Significant progress towards improving subnational capabilities to effectively manage resources and increase the quality of Government administrative services has been demonstrated. The public sector management areas supported under this project are starting to contribute significantly to economic efficiency.

**The Subnational Government Public Sector Modernization Program**

The project aimed to improve the capabilities of the provincial Governments and their municipalities to effectively manage their resources and improve the quality of Government administrative services. As a result, between 2010 and 2013, two provinces increased the ratio of collected provincial taxes by more than 15 percent; one province increased its staff operating under integrated payroll information systems in human resources from 0 to 40 percent; and information exchanges now regularly occur between property registries and cadaster in two provinces.

The bulk of Argentine social services are provided by its 24 provincial Governments (including the City of Buenos Aires) and 2,150 local Governments which vary in fiscal and social performance, as well as size, populations and endowments.

Many Governments were ill-prepared to meet growing demands for improved services related to enhancing local development, economic competitiveness and safety nets to deal with poverty and unemployment. Also, many municipalities were entirely dependent on the provinces for their organization and taxing powers.

**Improved Services and Better Resource Management in Argentina**

The project aimed to improve the capabilities of the provincial Governments and their municipalities to effectively manage their resources and improve the quality of Government administrative services. As a result, between 2010 and 2013, two provinces increased the ratio of collected provincial taxes by more than 15 percent; one province increased its staff operating under integrated payroll information systems in human resources from 0 to 40 percent; and information exchanges now regularly occur between property registries and cadaster in two provinces.
Streamlining processes, organizational modernization, and better data management have resulted in improved decision-making and resource planning.

The project has helped to support improvements such as:

- In Mendoza, IDs can be issued in one week (previously one year) following the modernization of the civil registry.
- In Formosa, tax collection increased 40 percent between September 2010 and 2012. Also, an interface between the territorial cadaster administration and Real State Property Register Systems was developed, and the fiscal valuation process for property has been reduced to 10 days.
- In Chubut, 40 percent of staff has been integrated into the electronic payroll system and personnel information system, and tax collection increased 25 percent between September 2010 and 2012.
- Santa Fe increased the service capacity of its Data Center by 300 percent and Salta by 80 percent, and costs have reduced significantly.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION

This US$40 million loan built upon previous efforts to modernize Argentine’s provincial administrations and their municipalities (First and Second Provincial Development Loans as well as the Municipal Development Operations). These operations contributed to significant progress in areas such as tax and financial administration and property registration.

MOVING FORWARD

In a workshop held in 2012, provinces reaffirmed their commitment to the reforms. Puerto Madryn municipality and the province of Mendoza engaged in related activities with their own resources, and the province of Formosa developed a support plan for the territorial information system. There are positive signals that future World Bank engagement in Argentina would include a focus on strengthening subnational capacities for public service delivery.

BENEFICIARIES

The liquidity provided by the DPL with CAT DDO upon the declaration of emergency after the Pacaya volcano eruption and Tropical Storm Agatha in 2010 helped attend to the needs of more than 910,000 citizens who had been adversely affected by the two events. In addition, the improvements of institutional capacity for disaster risk assessment, reduction, monitoring and forecasting benefit the country as a whole.
ARGENTINA

**BUENOS AIRES HONES LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY**

**BETTER TOOLS TO ENSURE A MORE EFFECTIVE USE OF PUBLIC RESOURCES**

By developing new audit tools and control functions, the Buenos Aires Court of Accounts, with World Bank support, built capacity to provide citizens with higher quality control services and to hold provincial authorities more accountable for the transparent and effective use of public resources.

**CHALLENGE**

Serving the most populous and wealthy province of Argentina, the Buenos Aires Court of Accounts (Honorable Tribunal de Cuentas, HTC) is constitutionally vested with authority to control the use of public resources. To that end, HTC has developed a legacy of legal and financial compliance-based controls.

With the introduction in the early 2000s of public financial management reforms and the program budgeting approach in the province, especially the new integrated financial information and budget execution system, HTC has been challenged to modernize and adapt its traditional control skills, systems, and tools to the new paradigm of performance auditing and financial risk-based controls.

**SOLUTION**

The goals of the Buenos Aires Infrastructure Sustainable Investment Development Project were to improve the provision of transport, water, drainage, and sanitation services to 5 million people, to help promote sustainable economic growth, alleviate poverty, and to increase social equity. The project included a component to build the province’s institutional capacity and strengthen agencies involved in infrastructure and economic management.

Within this component, HTC was granted US$1 million to:

- Strengthen its traditional audit and control work through the introduction of modern information technology (IT) tools and systems.
- Develop new functions such as project auditing, IT systems auditing, and performance evaluation of public programs.

With this support, HTC initiated capacity-building activities in new areas of auditing and control that improve performance and generate a gradual change in its culture from a legal focus to a more performance-oriented approach. A new audit software tool was introduced and intensive training was provided, both of which allowed the institution to improve audit planning and execution, streamline audit processes, and strengthen management of working papers, time estimation, and tracking and monitoring of staff work. The Bank facilitated brainstorming of HTC staff on project activities, options, and management, with the goal of encouraging a broad conception in the context of transparent and effective oversight of the use of public funds.

**RESULTS**

HTC is now able to audit projects funded by the Bank and other donors. In 2012, it also developed a performance auditing methodology and guidelines, which it applied to two pilot projects, a health program and a road infrastructure program. Training activities in information technology (IT) system auditing have begun with a view toward further expanding the range and transparency of HTC’s review of the use of public funds. HTC was also the first provincial member of the Latin America and Caribbean Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions. This has made available regional and international initiatives in public sector audit institutional development.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

The Bank played an instrumental role in mobilizing HTC authorities and staff around shared goals and reform activities, and encouraging a more systematic effort to build an effective institution focused on performance.
PARTNERS
In addition to the Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) is also providing support through limited donations aimed at establishing the institution as the key provider of external auditing for provincial resources (including borrowed funds), in line with the objective of advancing the use of country systems at the provincial level.

MOVING FORWARD
Building on project results, HTC devised and adopted in December 2012 a Strategic Plan for 2013-2017. The formulation of the Plan was highly participatory, involving all internal stakeholders. The Plan is anchored in five areas critical for the institution’s future:

• Strengthening Government audits.
• Positioning HTC as the champion for Government transparency.
• Designing and implementing a communications strategy.
• Strengthening human resource management.
• Optimizing the physical and technological HTC infrastructure.

The key challenges are to sustain the reform’s momentum and access to funding to finance ongoing implementation of the Strategic Plan, which includes additional investment in IT, development and enhancement of current staff capacity through training in modern audit techniques, re-design of staff performance assessments, development of new staff position requirements, and small refurbishing works in HTC’s offices.

BENEFICIARIES
The project beneficiary is HTC. Project activities and Strategic Plan formulation strengthened internal communication linkages among HTC’s principal departments

• Central Government Audit
• Decentralized Entities Audit
• Municipalities A and B Audit

According to HTC’s president, Eduardo Grinberg, “The project led to an internal process of integration and cross-cutting work which was extremely productive. The project, fostered by real needs arising from our everyday control work and hopes of change and growth within HTC, became an engine of continuous improvement and made it possible to access growth opportunities, which are already part our strategic objectives for 2013-2017.”
RIo DE JANEIRo IMPROVES SERVICE DELIVERY AND REFORMS ITS FISCAL AND PUBLIC SECToRS

With support from the World Bank, the Municipality of Rio de Janeiro restructured its debt and made more resources available for investment while supporting policy reforms to strengthen public sector performance and improve the quality of public service delivery.

CHA llenge
For the past two decades, Rio de Janeiro’s 6.2 million residents have been hard-hit by the city’s long-run economic decline, which exacerbated social and economic inequalities. Between 1985 and 2003, the economy of Rio, Brazil’s second largest city, has contracted at an average annual rate of 1.1 percent. Fiscal constraints in the aftermath of a mid-1990s fiscal crisis have further deteriorated the quality of municipal service delivery. The city’s poor make up about 13 percent of the population and nearly 19 percent of them live in slum neighborhoods with inadequate infrastructure, transportation, schools and health facilities. In addition, a large and expensive loan from Brazil’s National Treasury was a particular fiscal burden, although it included an option to reduce debt service costs by prepaying part of the outstanding balance.

SOLU tion
In January, 2009, the newly elected Municipal Government committed itself to improving public service delivery and public sector efficiency and effectiveness, and promoting private sector development, while maintaining fiscal discipline. To that end, the Municipal and Federal Governments approached the World Bank for a Development Policy Loan (DPL) to alleviate Rio’s debt service burden. This was the Bank’s first DPL with a Municipality. It was aligned with the Bank’s Country Partnership Strategy (CPS), which identifies engagement with subnational jurisdictions to enhance the effectiveness of the Bank’s technical and financial resources. Brazilian municipalities are natural partners in pursuing the goals of the CPS because they provide many essential services.

The Rio Municipal Development Policy Loan, approved in July 2010 for US$1.045 billion, financed a portion of Rio’s existing debt and served as a platform for dialogue about policy issues.

RES U LT S
The Operation’s results were in the following areas:
• Grew available resources by around 7 percent of current revenue.
• Prepaid the Municipal Government’s debt to the National Treasury and strengthened tax administration.
• Expanded public sector investments from 3.7 percent to 15.9 percent of total public expenditure, in bus rapid transit routes, schools, day care facilities, and health clinics.
• Expanded primary health care coverage from 6 percent of the population in 2009 to 40 percent in 2013, through a network of primary and urgent care clinics run by private, not-for-profit management companies.
• Improved learning outcomes through early childhood development, remedial literacy programs, innovative approaches for schools in dangerous neighborhoods, and improved teacher training and career development.
• Increased percentage of children with adequate reading skills at the end of grade 1 by 10 percentage points.
• Reduced percentage of children in grade 9 performing more than two years behind grade level by 7 percentage points.
• Improved public sector efficiency using a Public-Private Partnerships framework for projects in sanitation, sports facilities, waterfront revitalization and light rail transport.
• Simplified requirements and reduced the time to obtain a business license, from 20 days in 2010 to three days in 2013, for applications with low environmental and health impacts.
• Generated average savings of 39 percent on common goods and services in 2013, compared to 2010, through procurement reform and implementation of a centralized, electronic auction system. Reduced losses from an average of 4.9 percent in 2006-09 to 0.1 percent in 2012 using new stock management procedures piloted in the health system.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION
The Bank supported the Municipality with a Development Policy Loan in the amount of US$1.045 billion, disbursed in two tranches in 2010 and 2011. Two Technical Assistance operations provided additional support in several policy areas: the first, a PPP Reimbursable Advisory Services for US$609,000; and the second financed through a US$16.2 million Investment Loan.

MOVING FORWARD
The second of the Technical Assistance projects received Board approval in June 2013 and is expected to run through October 2017, providing additional support to several of the loan’s policy areas, including public investment management, Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and health and education reform.

BENEFICIARIES
Policy actions under the DPL have primarily benefited low income households. Health and education outcomes are highly correlated with income and socio-economic status.

The Government’s programs in these areas specifically targeted disadvantaged, underserved neighborhoods. Special attention to the needs of dangerous and violent neighborhoods was especially beneficial.

ESPANDING ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES AND IMPROVING QUALITY OF LIFE IN BRAZIL

Since 2010, with World Bank support, the State of Pernambuco has enrolled over 100,000 students in schools, expanded water rights by almost 60 percent, and implemented a flood monitoring alert system covering a population of 3.6 million. It has also trained almost 1,500 public employees on gender issues and improved the efficiency and transparency of public administration. Through these interventions, Pernambuco has achieved a 20 percent reduction in budgetary revisions.

CHALLENGE
Despite recent relatively fast economic growth, Pernambuco remains the 8th poorest state in Brazil (out of 26 states), and there remain large socioeconomic disparities within the state. It is one of the most vulnerable states to natural disasters (droughts and flooding) and social hazards (disease and crime). Moreover, unemployment
is higher in the rural interior of the state, where recent industrial expansion has not reached. By comparison, the Recife Metropolitan Area is a relatively affluent city on the east coast. In 2009, the student enrollment rate (ages 15-17) at secondary schools in Recife was 50 percent and 33 percent in the interior. Household access to water in Recife was 89 percent and 66 percent in the interior.

**SOLUTION**

This Expanding Opportunities Development Policy Loan (DPL) supported the Government of Pernambuco’s ongoing Development Plan, which prioritizes three strategic areas of intervention:

- Improving the quality of life through ensuring public services delivery.
- Expanding opportunities for productive inclusion and equity.
- Enhancing the capacity of the state’s public administration to generate policy results for the population.

The DPL provided technical and financial support to improve the quality of education, provide better water security and disaster risk management, support gender inclusion and job creation opportunities, and increase public administration capacity.

An integral aspect of the agenda involved focusing the quality of life and expanding opportunities in the interior, given the high correlation of regional inequities and inequities in other dimensions.

**RESULTS**

The project helped the Government to achieve results in all three priority policy areas of the State’s Development Plan.

**Improving the quality of life:**

- Increased by 185 percent from 2010 to 2013 the number of secondary students enrolled in schools receiving more hours of instruction per week.
- Increased by 24,059 students enrolled in integral and semi-integral secondary schools from 2011 to 2013.
- Expanded water-rights by 58 percent from 2010 to 2013, established a water users’ cadaster, and formalized procedures for a flood risk early warning system covering over 3.6 million people.

**Expanding opportunities for productive inclusion and equity:**

- Enrolled 13,687 additional students from 2010 to 2013 in professional education schools, 5,367 of which live outside of the Recife Metropolitan Area.
- Increased the number of public employees trained on gender issues from 600 in 2010 to over 2,000 by 2013.
- Increased funding for SMEs and rural producers, from 3 in 2010 to 19 in 2013.

**Enhancing the capacity of the state’s public administration:**

- Reduced by 20 percent budgetary revisions.
- Published systematic online a Social Management Report starting in 2011.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

The Bank provided US$500 million as a single-tranche DPL to the State of Pernambuco in order to consolidate the impact of actions requiring specific investments. Additionally, the Bank contributed US$690,000 in resources in the form of technical assistance to prepare and supervise the Project.

Enrolled 13,687 additional students from 2010 to 2013 in professional education schools.
The Bank worked in strong partnership with the Pernambuco State Government. The State’s Secretary of Planning and Management (SEPLAG) acted as the implementation agency and coordinated with other secretariats involved. These secretariats included the Development Agency of the State of Pernambuco (AGEFEPE ) in promoting the economic and social development of SMEs and rural producers, the Agency for Water and Climate (APAC) in expanding water security and developing the disaster risk management system, and the Women’s Secretariat (Secmulher) in providing public employees with gender training. Additionally, the Management Institute, established within SEPLAG, was responsible overseeing the promotion of efficiency and transparency in public administration.

Moving Forward
In 2013 the Bank approved a follow-up Development Policy Loan to the State of Pernambuco. The second loan builds upon the reforms supported by this DPL to assist the Government of Pernambuco in its strategy to strengthen the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs aimed at promoting sustained growth and improved economic opportunities for the poor, consolidating public sector management innovations, preventing crime and violence, and reducing the burden associated with chronic diseases.

Beneficiaries
In addition to the State at large through public administration reforms, this project benefits 2.6 million citizens being covered by a newly created national disaster alert system, 104,000 secondary students receiving higher quality education, 2,000 public employees receiving gender training, and 19 SMEs receiving financing and/or training contributing to local supply chains.

Brazil strengthens oversight of public expenditures
MODERNIZING AUDIT, COMPLIANCE, AND INVESTIGATIVE TOOLS

Brazil’s Office of Controller General (CGU), with Bank support, strengthened its fiscal transparency and the efficiency and accountability of public finances by refining the role, methodologies, and work tools of the Secretariat of Internal Control (SFC). Bank intervention helped modernize the SFC’s audit, compliance, and investigative tools, and develop two prototype information systems.

Challenge
The Brazilian Government has a fairly robust internal control framework; however, in the context of the recent establishment of subnational control units and the supreme audit institution’s responsibility to audit federally transferred funds, there were gaps in oversight responsibilities for large federal programs that transfer financial resources to sub-national governments and entities. The Government needed to clarify the roles of all the involved entities, avoid overlap of functions, promote stronger collaboration, and eliminate gaps in the framework for oversight and control.

Solution
In support of the Government’s effort to modernize its audit, compliance, and investigative tools, the project supported the following activities:  
- Diagnostic work with the SFC.  
- Work with the CGU to prepare a diagnostic and assessment report of the principle types of audits.
• A re-design of the integration of CGU information systems, audit and review procedures, and allocation of resources.

The project also supported the development of two prototype information systems in areas identified as CGU priorities:
• Follow-up on previous audit findings.
• Administration of documents and working papers.

The project contributed to an institutional strengthening plan that is a key element of the CGU Strategy for 2012-14. One vivid example is the new requirement for CGU to measure the impact of its audits, including the implementation percentage of the recommendations issued.

RESULTS

By 2012, Brazil had modernized its audit practices, tools, and key institutions. A more robust internal control system now enables greater transparency of public sector expenditures. The new system now meets the International Standards on Auditing. The project activities contributed to this institutional strengthening plan, which is a key element of the CGU Strategy for 2012-14. The functional scope of the office of the Controller General expanded from technical review of audits to include advisory support with respect to the overall efficiency of public sector expenditures. At the subnational level, there are positive spillover effects, as the internal control agencies adopt the new paradigm. One vivid example is the new requirement for the CGU to measure the impact of its audits, including the implementation percentage of the recommendations. This derived from a detailed recommendation that emerged from the Project activities.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION

The Bank supported a wide range of analytical and advisory services between May 2009 and March 2012. The project’s goals included:
• Identify gaps in audit practices.
• Improve audit procedures, tools, and lines of responsibility.
• Strengthen institutional capacity and skills of audit practitioners.
• Improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the oversight of public expenditures, in light of the increasing complexity and comprehensiveness of expenditure programs.

PARTNERS

The Bank financed the project activities through a grant of US$350,000 from the Institutional Development Fund (IDF). The CGU is also using funds from its own budget to implement the recommendations.

MOVING FORWARD

Some of the recommendations that emerged from the Project activities have been adopted. For example, an electronic management system for Working Papers and a Monitoring and Evaluation system of institutional results have been introduced. Going forward, Brazil will need to address a significant need for further capacity building and additional support for internal control agencies to implement fully its strategy for 2012-2014. The Project provided what could be potential directions for Bank support for the strengthening of internal controls, particularly actions to support plan implementation and capacity building at the sub-national level.

BENEFICIARIES

The primary beneficiary was the Office of the Comptroller General of Brazil (CGU) and its Federal Secretariat of Internal Control (SFC).

“The project enabled the directors and staff of SFC to review our activities, enabling better planning and a realignment of activities; all this contributed significantly to improving internal controls in Brazil.”

Ronald da Silva Balbe
Director of Planning and Coordination of Control Actions, Federal Secretariat of Internal Control (SFC), a key unit of Brazil’s Office of Controller General.
CHILE

CHILE ESTABLISHES A NATIONAL SYSTEM OF SOCIAL PROTECTION

CHILE SOLIDARIO IMPROVES THE LIVES OF FAMILIES IN EXTREME POVERTY

By the end of 2012, nearly 600,000 families had participated in Chile Solidario, an effective outreach program for the extreme poor designed to improve the receipt of monetary transfers and programs for housing and employment and health and education outcomes. Chile Solidario served as a base for the installation of a broader social protection system. Over the medium-term the program has had positive effects on employment and income for some families.

CHALLENGE

The Government of Chile was concerned that although the share of the population below the poverty line had declined during the 1990’s, the share in extreme poverty persisted. Analytical work suggested that an important determinant of persistent extreme poverty was exclusion from a variety of networks that provided access to public and private risk mitigation instruments. Although Chile’s social protection institutions were relatively strong and well run, several weaknesses in the social protection system were making it harder for the Government to address exclusion. Some of these weaknesses included:

- The inefficient use of available information.
- Weakness of the targeting instrument.
- Gaps in monitoring and evaluation of social programs and policies.
- Coordination failures at both the national and subnational levels.

SOLUTION

In addition to poverty assessments, an analysis of the social protection system, Chile: Household Risk Management and Social Protection, informed the reforms supported by this project and the accompanying adjustment operation. The Social Protection Technical Assistance Loan ensured adequate financing and advice during the implementation of the policy reforms supported by the Social Protection Sector Adjustment Loan.

The project supported the progress made by Chile in moving from isolated interventions to a coherent, connected portfolio of programs, under a systems approach. Over the life of the project, programs improved communications, shared to greater extent common administrative subsystems, and worked together to respond to risks and to deliver resilience, equity and opportunity to the extremely poor population.

RESULTS

The following results were particularly important:

- Development of a legal framework for the inter-sectoral social protection system.
- Implementation of specific mechanisms and administrative arrangements to promote coordination including inter-institutional agreements, national budgeting procedures, an integrated social information system and registry of beneficiaries through which information is exchanged among nearly 40 public and private agencies. Use of the targeting instrument was extended to other programs.
- Improvement of the take-up of transfers and programs. The results from the impact evaluations show in the short-run an improvement in the take-up of transfers and other programs, and improved education and health outcomes. The medium-term results of the program indicate positive effects on employment and income for some groups of families, as well as gains in living standards, including more stable housing conditions. Results from the longer-term evaluation show benefits in particular for those who had been excluded from the social network as well as benefits from the progressive improvements on the supply side.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION

The original loan amount was $10.71 million. Additional financing of $3.0 million was approved in late 2009.
FINANCIAL AND SOCIAL INVESTMENT FUND (FOSIS).

Moving Forward

Most social programs include well-designed monitoring systems. The Budget Division of the Ministry of Finance ensures that evaluation results are taken into account in spending decisions and organizes an annual schedule of program evaluations.

Program monitoring indicators and evaluation results are accessible to the public. Programs must also comply with the requirements of the Law of Transparency, in which the integrated social information system has played an important role. Finally, the existence of social programs and transfers and the wide coverage of the targeting instrument enabled the Government to respond quickly to the needs of the poor during the previous financial and food price crises, by providing lump sum transfers to specific target groups.

Beneficiaries

The main beneficiaries were the nearly 600,000 families that participated in Chile Solidario. One of the aims of Chile Solidario was to implement a new model of management of public institutions. The project supported institutional changes and strengthening in several areas including better coordination and the integration of social assistance with social promotion.

“This Government has taken into account the poor, humble people, those who are making an effort. It is not so much the money...it is the support and orientation that they have provided us; in other words, the wish to move forward so that we can improve and become better people and have a better quality of life. I feel capable. I developed a personality that I did not have before. I didn’t talk. I said to my husband, you talk, you go. I didn’t handle any processes alone. I was ashamed to speak because everyone looked at me when I spoke. Now, I can talk with anyone. Now try to keep me quiet.”

Rosa Chaguan, Town of Castro, Lakes Region.
AGRICULTURAL INNOVATION FOR A COMPETITIVE CHILE

DESIGNING THE DIRECTORATE OF AGRICULTURAL INNOVATION TO IMPROVE COORDINATION AND HARNESS SYNERGIES

Since 2009, the World Bank has worked with Chile to develop a long-term strategy for agricultural innovation, which the country identified as key to reducing lagging agricultural productivity. However, the agricultural innovation system suffers from weak coordination, creating conflict and inefficiency. Drawing on intensive consultations and other international experiences, the World Bank responded to Chile’s request for the design of a technical unit in the Ministry of Agriculture dedicated to coordinating and enhancing agricultural innovation.

CHALLENGE

Chile has a national goal to become an important actor in global agrifood markets, and has had notable success with fruit, wine, salmon and forestry products in international markets. However, the initial dynamism of the agrifood sector fizzled during the last decade, contributing to a decline in productivity growth of the overall economy.

The Government sought to develop an investment program focused on agricultural innovation that would help Chile reach Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development standards.

Agricultural innovation, however, has been hampered by a lack of a clear, shared vision for the sector, with several disarticulated priorities and agenda setting mechanisms in place. Confusion, duplication, and even conflict of efforts resulted from poorly defined roles for the many public and private agencies and institutes working in this area.

SOLUTION

Through three analytical activities starting in 2009, the World Bank has worked with the Government of Chile to develop a long-term strategy for agricultural innovation to accelerate growth in the agrifood sector. The approach of the final analytical product was to create the recommended innovation coordination unit in the Ministry of Agriculture (MINAGRI) to implement the actions agreed in the early two analytical activities. To develop the design, the World Bank conducted intensive consultations with public agencies and the private sector and analyzed best practices in agricultural innovation coordination in six countries with comparable agricultural sectors to that in Chile.

The unit was designed to improve the existing, more informal coordination in place by:

• Inducing processes of agenda building and priority setting.
• Harmonizing funding flows and other innovation support activities, such as research.
• Implementing systematic monitoring and evaluation of the Agricultural Innovation System.

The unit was designed to mobilize an advisory council to evaluate the unit’s work and provide direct representation from the sectors, and a more autonomous think tank to tap into global knowledge networks and push the frontiers of innovation in Chile.

RESULTS

The design for the agricultural innovation coordination unit was well-received, and the Ministry of Agriculture is moving ahead to begin implementation of this unit according to the recommendations. Furthermore, the design of the unit has been incorporated in a new proposed law to restructure the Ministry of Agriculture.
This series of analytical activities has already led to several new initiatives by the Chilean Government, such as the development of long term funding lines and research programs and the establishment of enhanced technical assistance to Chilean farmers. New areas, such as ICT in agriculture, are starting to receive more attention, and research institutes have been modernizing their agendas. In the long term, Chile expects that the proposed measures will lead to increased private sector investment in research and development in the agro-food sector.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION
The World Bank was reimbursed for this series of analytical services by the Government of Chile, for a total amount of US$410,000.

PARTNERS
The innovation coordination unit was designed in partnership with the Ministry of Agriculture (MINAGRI) and the Chilean Foundation for Agricultural Innovation (FIA) and involved extensive stakeholder interviews with numerous Government and non-governmental agencies and private sector representatives.

MOVING FORWARD
The importance of the engagement between the World Bank and the Government of Chile has enabled it to withstand Government transition. Starting during the Michelle Bachelet administration, the work was further pursued by the Sebastian Piñera administration, and at the Bank’s recommendation, the groundwork for the unit has been implemented in order to continue to evolve under the new Bachelet administration.

BENEFICIARIES
The transformations in the agricultural sector catalyzed by the agricultural innovation coordination unit are intentionally targeted to improve inclusive priority-setting, giving voice to producers of all sizes and in regions sometimes marginalized by centralized decision-making.

Chile’s agro-industry, for example, in wines, fruits, salmon, and forestry, will benefit from improved coordination and regulation of innovation activities. In addition, revitalizing the agricultural sector in Chile will have economy-wide returns, and over time, Chilean consumers will benefit from improvements in food quality and reduced prices.
A MORE PROMISING FUTURE FOR POOR YOUTH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

At Least 38,000 Benefited from On-the-Job Training and Formal Education

With joint World Bank and Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) support, authorities in the Dominican Republic successfully implemented a Youth Training and Employment Program (PJyE) that provided technical/vocational and life skills training and on-the-job internships to poor, at-risk youth. The program had positive impacts, including increased earnings and better quality jobs among participants. The authorities also implemented the country’s first temporary employment program targeting poor unemployed adults.

ChALLENGE
Dominican youth, particularly the poor, face structural barriers to labor markets, including insufficient education, poor life skills, and weak job skills to transition from school to work. Exacerbating this already precarious situation, a banking crisis that unfolded in 2003 decreased even further the chances of youth to enter the labor market, particularly among the poor and unemployed. This was demonstrated by the disproportionate increase in youth unemployment, which rose by roughly a third between 2003 and 2005 to reach 31 percent for ages 15-24, as compared to 17 percent for the population at large.

SOLUTION
The Dominican Republic Youth Development Project responded to the urgent need to provide more opportunities to disadvantaged youth from poor families and with little schooling. The Project was part of a larger effort of the authorities to strengthen the country’s social protection system and was complementary to a series of operations being financed by the World Bank and the IDB. The Project had a two-fold strategy:

• First, it focused on improving the employability of poor, at-risk youth by building their work experience and life skills through training and on-the-job internships.
• Second, it supported the expansion of second-chance education programs aimed at providing youth and adults the opportunity to complete their formal education.

RESULTS
Results of the intervention included the following:

• Over 38,000 at-risk youth benefited from the PJyE, with the overwhelming majority living in the poorest areas and more than half women.
• Over 3,000 private firms offered internships to PJyE graduates, providing trainees with valuable on-the-job experience.
• Results from a rigorous impact evaluation show that program graduates had a higher probability of acquiring a formal job and a larger income, particularly among women. Teenage pregnancy rates were also lower among participants.
• A total of 600 power generators are now providing electricity to 350 schools offering second-chance education programs that previously had to rely on candles or gas lamps for lighting.

A total of 600 power generators are now providing electricity to 350 schools offering second-chance education programs that previously had to rely on candles or gas lamps for lighting.
The second-chance basic education curricula and supporting instruction materials were redeveloped under the Project and used to prepare the Quisqueya Aprende Contigo Literacy Program, a presidential flagship program that enrolled over 700,000 adults in 2013 alone.

A total of 3,920 low-income, unskilled long-term unemployed adults completed training under the country’s first temporary employment program. They gained work experience in selected projects managed by non-profit organizations and municipalities, including maintenance of physical infrastructure such as street and drainage maintenance and cleaning of public parks and watersheds.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

The World Bank contributed US$25 million to this project, which had an overall cost of US$50 million.

**PARTNERS**

The Ministry of Labor, the National Training Agency (INFOTEPE) and the Ministry of Education implemented the Project. INFOTEPE’s strong institutional capacity was a critical element in ensuring the successful implementation of PJyE. At the same time, the Project helped expand INFOTEPE’s traditional focus beyond training of employed, formal workers to include unemployed youth.

The IDB and the World Bank collaborated closely, supporting complementary operations focusing on enhancing the efficiency of labor markets in the Dominican Republic. There was also strong coordination between the supervision and evaluation teams of the two institutions in the framework of the PJyE.

**MOVING FORWARD**

Two new operations financed by the World Bank (Flexible Employment System Project) and the IDB (Support the National Employment System) continue to support the Government’s efforts to foster the employability of vulnerable population groups, particularly unskilled youth, as well as the development of labor market institutions.

The PJyE was awarded, among other recognitions, Best Practices in Youth Policies and Programs in Latin America and the Caribbean by the United Nations Development Program and the World Bank. The Ministry of Labor has disseminated widely the lessons learned in the implementation of the PJyE among other countries in the region.

**BENEFICIARIES**

Between 2008 and 2013, 38,000 young people between the ages of 16 to 29 benefited from the Youth and Employment Training Program run by INFOTEPE. 60 percent of beneficiaries were women between the ages of 18 to 20. 95 percent of the beneficiaries were living in extreme poor areas, as classified by the national poverty mapping. 45 percent of the female beneficiaries had at least one child, and 55 percent were single.
USING DIALOGUE TO INFORM PUBLIC POLICIES IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

At the request of the Dominican Republic’s incoming Administration in 2012, The World Bank and the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) convened to elaborate a set of 13 policy notes to help further the ambitious social agenda. Nine (out of 22) Ministries participated in a convention to discuss the policy notes, called the “Dominican Republic Dialogue Day,” and informed their respective action plans with the priorities agreed with the IADB and the World Bank. Progress has been observed in the areas of fiscal and macroeconomic stability, public financial management and procurement, access to finance, and quality of education, among other areas.

CHALLENGE
President Danilo Medina assumed office in August 2012 carrying an ambitious electoral program aimed at generating 400,000 jobs and agreeing on three nationwide targets on fiscal, energy and education priorities.

The emphasis of the new Administration on social policies was challenged by a large deficit and the tightest fiscal space in public finances in a decade. The Minister of the Economy called on the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) and the World Bank to elaborate in just two months a set of joint policy notes on topics identified by the Government, in order to inform sector dialogue and agree on priorities in the different Ministries and institutions, most of which were at that moment preparing their four-year action plans.

SOLUTION
In order to promptly respond to the request of Government authorities, the World Bank drew from an ongoing policy notes elaboration process. The World Bank and the IADB put together a joint coordination team in charge of defining homogeneous objectives and format for the different policy notes, as well as coordinating the inputs from the different sector experts. A total of 13 policy notes were prepared in 5 broad areas: macroeconomic management, the quality of public management, growth and competitiveness, electricity development and the social sectors. In order to ensure the quality of the content and the consistency of the messages, in March 2013 all the different focal points on the WB and IADB side presented and discussed the different notes in a joint review meeting.

Finally, on March 9, 2013 the Dominican Republic Dialogue Day was held, comprised of around 10 Ministries and high level representatives and experts on the IADB and the WB side. The dialogue created a unique opportunity for multi-sector discussion around the Dominican Republic Policy Notes.

RESULTS
While the following results cannot be solely attributed to the Policy Notes, as some of them were already in the Government’s agenda, the Dominican Republic Dialogue Day was convened by authorities precisely to agree on the priorities and to use the World Bank’s leverage to move forward in certain areas. These are some of the areas that have noticeably registered improvement:
• According to the General Directorate for Public Procurement, the number of non-competitive biddings diminished by 21.1 percent in 2013. In addition, the number of procurement processes published in 2013 reached 57,000, compared with 47,600 in 2012.
to just 1,000 in 2012.
- On December 3, 2013, the International Finance Corporation issued Taíno Bonds for a value of US$390 million, in its effort to develop the domestic market for corporate bonds.
- In the context of progress towards a Single Treasury Account, as of December 2013, 12 out of 12 hospitals in Santo Domingo National District had been fully incorporated to the decentralized payment system, compared to just 6 as of July 2013.
- As of August 2013, the first monitoring report on the progress of the actions agreed at Dominican Initiative for the Quality of Education (IDEC) was made public.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**
The total cost of the elaboration of the joint policy notes for the World Bank is estimated to be US$87,000. In addition, the World Bank and the IADB shared the cost of the logistics and venue for the Dominican Republic Dialogue Day.

**PARTNERS**
As aforementioned, the IADB contributed in equal terms to the development of the Policy Notes and the Dominican Republic Dialogue Day, both in funding and knowledge sharing. Specifically, the IADB Director for Central America, the Principal Economist of the IADB for Central America, the Economist of the IADB for the Dominican Republic, and the IADB Representative in Santo Domingo were the World Bank’s main counterparts in the process. In addition, more than 20 IADB experts participated in the elaboration of the policy notes and/or in the main workshop.

**MOVING FORWARD**
The Policy Notes have also helped inform the IADB Strategy in the Dominican Republic, and the World Bank Country Partnership Strategy. Once the approval process of the latter is completed, the Policy Notes will be made public as “Proceedings of the DR Dialogue Day,” and a series of BBLs and of web-based dissemination actions will be launched in order to ensure the continuity of the messages and to support the implementation of agreed priorities.

**BENEFICIARIES**
The ultimate beneficiaries of this initiative are the citizens of the Dominican Republic, who are benefiting from the outcomes derived from better coordinated development efforts.
GRENADA

GRENADA’S LAND REGISTRY GOES DIGITAL
IMPROVING PUBLIC SERVICE EFFICIENCY IN SERVICE DELIVERY

This Public Sector Modernization Technical Assistance Credit supported the Government of Grenada in reducing the time needed to (i) register a company, (ii) register property deeds, and (iii) complete property registration. The investment made in the newly created Grenada Lands Agency permitted the digitization of maps and computerization of processes, with the bulk of some 170,000 registration documents from the 1930’s made available online as a customer service. To support job and small business creation, the Government also supported the development of entrepreneurial skills of population.

CHALLENGE
Several agencies, with no efficient information sharing system, were involved in land registration. Citizens were required to spend time dealing with each agency. Land registries were done manually and kept in hard copies. The high humidity had damaged the documentation because of inappropriate location and poor condition of the Office of the State Registrar and inadequate conservation of material. Information technologies to create, keep, share, and retrieve information were not available. The opportunities for Grenadians were scarce.

SOLUTION
With the support of the World Bank, the Grenadian Government improved its public service delivery by setting up and modernizing the Grenada Lands Agency, upgrading its processes and technology, as well as digitizing services. Additionally, all departments that constituted the Grenada Lands Agency were connected through fiber-optic lines to allow for information sharing. The quality of land survey, registration, and spatial planning improved radically, benefitting citizens and businesses.

RESULTS
The Grenada Public Sector Modernization project supported improvements in several key areas related to efficiency in public service delivery:
- The number of days needed to register a business and receive a company certificate declined from 10-20 to 1-2 days. Bills of sale are
filled and registered in one day.

- The number of days to complete all property registration activities decreased from 77 days to 47 days.
- The number of days to register deeds decreased from 60 days to 30 days.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**
The Bank contributed to these achievements through a Technical Assistance Credit in the amount of US$3.5 million, of which US$3 million were disbursed.

**PARTNERS**
The Project was financed by the World Bank. The key Government partners for this project were: the Ministry of Finance and the Department of Public Administration of the Cabinet Office of the Government.

**MOVING FORWARD**
The ongoing Regional Disaster Vulnerability Reduction Project, will support:
- Developing capacity for maintenance and upgrade of the information system for land management.
- Implementing a geodetic system and creating a National Cadaster.
- Integrating business processes of the land survey, physical planning, valuation, recording proprietors in the tax database, property registration and information search, and integrating respective information subsystems into one system.

**BENEFICIARIES**
The beneficiaries included the Ministry of Legal Affairs (responsible for Supreme Court Registry), the Inland Revenue Division of the Ministry of Finance (responsible for Land Valuation), the Ministry of Agriculture, Lands, Forestry, Fisheries, Public Utilities and Energy, the Ministry of Finance (responsible for physical planning), and the Grenada Investment Development Corporation. Ultimately the people of Grenada will benefit from more efficient and reliable services in land, property and business registration.
GUATEMALA SEeks TO INCREASE PUBLIC CONfIDENCE

EnHancing TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY THROUGH PUBLIC EXPENDITURES

With support from the World Bank and other donors, the Guatemalan Government enhanced its transparency and accountability by implementing some recommendations, which included recognition and measurement of long-standing off-the-books floating loans that had threatened the country's financial stability.

A joint Bank, IADB, and the European Union collaboration with the Government of Guatemala (GoG) produced a Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability (PEFA) assessment under a PEFA Plus approach with prioritized recommendations for the reform.

Challenge
The Government of Guatemala was aware of the need for public financial management reform; however, it did not have a blueprint of what was needed and how to implement the reform. The Government sought assistance of analytical work to help establish a baseline to guide the country’s reforms and to work out an action plan to modernize the financial management systems.

The Bank and other donors supported the Government with the Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability (PEFA) methodology, an internationally accepted standard to analyze and assess public financial management systems.

Solution
In 2009, the Guatemalan Government agreed to a Bank-proposed “PEFA Plus” approach. This approach provided prioritized recommendations in addition to the PEFA assessment (which usually does not provide recommendations). The effort involved extremely close and persistent collaboration with the Government, leading to an iterative process to determine evidence that justified the final PEFA scores, and to address long-standing issues of transparency and accountability.

After the assessment, and to help the Government implement the recommendations, representatives from the Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB), the European Union (EU), and the Guatemalan Government formed a joint supervision and monitoring team. Validation workshops were organized and yielded candid discussions and re-thinking. The discussion brought to light some sensitive matters, such as the institutional arrangements for budget execution outside the public financial management information system and unrecorded liabilities, which created unregistered debt in the Government’s financial statements. After three years, a second PEFA Assessment was conducted to evaluate and confirm the progress of the reform.
The Following results were achieved through the project.

• An initial action plan was immediately prepared with the results of the PEFA Assessment 2009 and was presented to the Cabinet and adopted by the Ministry of Finance in 2009.

• Municipal planning and delivery of social services were enhanced by the adoption of the recommendation to provide municipalities with the annual subvention early in the fiscal year.

• Confidence in the Government’s accountability for public finances rose as the Government assumed responsibility for the floating debt, undertook an audit with assistance from the International Monetary Fund (IMF), and, in June 2013, announced that it would issue bonds to pay off US$450 million of debts that had accumulated over two governments and which were not included in the 2013 budget.

• The Government’s PEFA scores improved. Comparing the 2009 and 2012 PEFA assessment years, two of the scores were significantly improved:
  » From “C” to an “A” for classification of the budget (which allows the tracking of spending across administrative unit, economic activity, and program).
  » From “D” to a “B” in transparency of inter-governmental fiscal relations (which frequently translates as sub-national governments providing primary social service delivery) with respect to transparent and rule-based systems.

• An indicator of future success was the high level of discussions of PEFA Plus recommendations, which were presented to the President and Vice President at a full cabinet meeting.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

For the PEFA Assessment 2009, the Bank provided about US$40,000 for a series of missions for analytical and advisory services. The missions began with the assessment’s inception and continued through the Concept Note, through supervision and monitoring, to the meeting with the President, Vice President, and Cabinet and the final delivery of the report.

For the analytical work of the second PEFA, the Bank contributed staff time.

**PARTNERS**

The Bank collaborated with the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) and the European Union throughout the process. The partners worked at two levels:

• Level One included the Technical Working Team, which was led by co-TTLs of the Bank and the IADB and members from both institutions.

• Level Two included the Steering Committee, formed by the EU, the Guatemalan Government of Guatemala, IADB and the World Bank to make important decisions.

In addition to Bank funding, the IADB and the EU provided financial support.

**MOVING FORWARD**

The Guatemalan Government continues to implement some of the recommended areas of the reform.

**BENEFICIARIES**

The beneficiary of the project is Government of Guatemala.

“One of the most significant outcomes of the PEFA report is the decision to develop a Strategic Plan for the improved public financial management based on the results of the PEFA Analysis.”

Marco Antonio Gutiérrez Montufar

Vice Minister of Internal Administration and System Development, Ministry of Finance.
Securing property rights and modernizing land administration was central to Nicaragua’s social and economic development. The country has embarked upon a regularization program covering more than 220,000 rural and urban properties, granting land titles to more than 60,000 poor households, demarcating 14 protected areas, and titling 15 indigenous territories that account for nearly 20 percent of the national territory.

**Solution**

To address the above challenges, the Bank supported Nicaragua through the Land Administration Project - PRODEP, which implemented an approach focused on legal and policy changes, institutional consolidation, organizational capacity building, modernization of land records and information systems, and extensive piloting and implementation of regularization and demarcation initiatives. Three fundamentally important laws were passed and implemented: Titling of Indigenous Peoples’ Lands Law (2003); Cadastre Law (2005); and Public Registry Law (2009). This legislation provided clarity and fairness to processes of demarcation and titling of indigenous communities as well as to cadastral and registration activities.

The adequacy of the project’s implementation framework was then tested through an extensive pilot regularization program focusing especially on small rural producers and urban households in medium-sized towns, in specific departments where poverty levels were highest. The territories of historically marginalized indigenous communities in the Caribbean Region were demarcated and collectively titled to better protect their asset base in a changing economy, and vulnerable protected areas were also demarcated for the first time. These processes were supported by alternative conflict resolution that has contributed to social peace and cohesion.

**Results**

The key results achieved during the project (2002-2013) included:

- Key legislation and policies were passed: Titling of Indigenous Peoples’ Lands Law (2003); Cadastre Law (2005); Public Registry Law (2009); Policy for Protected Areas Law (2009); and a General Land Policy Framework (2010).
- By July 2012, a total of 44,019 people in rural areas had benefited from new titles and

It was estimated that over one third of rural land was held without a clear title.
12,480 urban households received new land titles through regularization (51 percent of beneficiaries of new titles were women).

- By July 2011, 14 protected areas (6 in Chinandega, 5 in Estelí, 2 in Madriz and 1 in León) were demarcated and geo-referenced, and integrated into the Nicaraguan Institute for Territorial Studies (INETER) database. The delimitation and demarcation was completed for 14 protected areas following a participatory process, combined with an environmental awareness raising campaign. In addition, 15 indigenous territories, corresponding to over 20 percent of the national territory, were demarcated and titled in Nicaragua’s Caribbean Region, benefitting more than 100,000 indigenous people.

- A total of 32,905 agrarian reform titles were reviewed and the cases solved, and 1,140 cases from agrarian reform cooperatives were reviewed and 418 approved.
- The information system linking the legal and geographic information on each property became fully operational in Chinandega, 625 personnel of key land agencies were trained to strengthen institutional capacity.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

The Bank’s support totaled US$42.60 million of which US$10 million was approved as an Additional Credit in February 2010 as the Government of Nicaragua sought to complete coverage in the pilot municipalities and expand to a new province. Titling and regularization accounted for 45 percent of total project costs while demarcation and titling activities in indigenous territories and protected areas amounted for another 10 percent. More than one third of project costs went to institutional strengthening and decentralization.

**PARTNERS**

The Government of Nicaragua expanded its efforts with support from other development partners such as the Nordic Development Fund (NDF) and the US-Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC). NDF provided a credit of EUR5.5 million to support institutional strengthening and urban cadastral and regularization activities outside the scope of PRODEP. In addition, MCC financed the successful piloting of a new methodology for cadastral surveying and regularization that would be later applied under the project and subsequent programs. Moreover, MCC transferred about US$2.6 million for equipment and funded the studies and assessments needed to prepare the Additional Financing.

**MOVING FORWARD**

The Government of Nicaragua now has a clear vision and is implementing a long-term land national program. As part of the program, a second phase (PRODEP II, US$40 million) was approved by the Bank in March 2013 with similar components to PRODEP while expanding its activities to other municipalities.

Various factors contribute to the sustainability of project outcomes:

- The integrated information system is already operational.
- Municipalities are being involved more in the maintenance of the national cadastre system.
- National capacity for land administration has been strengthened through the hiring of more trained persons.
- Inter-institutional coordination and collaboration is taking root.

**BENEFICIARIES**

The project benefited 44,019 people in rural areas of 5 provinces, where 51 percent of the beneficiaries were women. One example is Maria de los Angeles Reyes, who works with her family on a 3.5 acre property in El Limón (20 miles southeast of the city of Rivas in the Pacific lowlands region of Nicaragua) that benefited from the Land Administration Program (PRODEP). Maria considers that “the titling and implementation of the National Cadastre allow us to have a more secure property, because we will know exactly our property measurements, produce better, and women can have access to land.” As a direct outcome of securing land tenure, additional social benefits could be provided to Maria, including training in animal and plant care that will help improve her family’s overall income.

A total of 32,905 agrarian reform titles were reviewed and the cases solved.
NICARAGUA BUILDS CONFIDENCE IN FINANCIAL SERVICES

IMPROVING CONSUMER PROTECTION

With World Bank technical assistance, Nicaragua has developed a national program to improve consumer protection for the banking and microfinance sectors. The Government has also enacted related transparency regulations to improve consumer confidence in the financial sector. In addition, the new consumer protection law includes a financial services chapter.

CHALLENGE

The 2008 global financial crisis and the “no-payment” movement opened the door to abusive financial practices, an array of misunderstandings about hidden microloan fees, forced savings (in the form of compensatory balances), and very high late payment charges. The damage to the financial system was severe and immediate. Between 2009 and 2010, 19 microfinance institutions lost over US$60 million in foreign financing and their credit portfolio in arrears skyrocketed to close to 17 percent (over 30 days overdue) from some 3 percent before the crisis. Several micro lenders went out of business or had to be heavily recapitalized, and the number of microfinance consumer loans sharply decreased, affecting access to finance for the lower income population.

Several micro lenders went out of business or had to be heavily recapitalized, and the number of microfinance consumer loans sharply decreased, affecting access to finance for the lower income population.

SOLUTION

The Financial Sector Reform and Strengthening Initiative (FIRST)—a multi-donor trust fund for strengthening the financial sector in middle and low-income countries—assisted the Superintendence of Banks and Other Financial Institutions of Nicaragua (SIBOIF) in developing a national program to improve consumer protection for the banking and microfinance sectors.

This Project aimed to establish a system that would provide adequate consumer protection for financial services and ultimately greater access to finance.

Project activities included:

- Assessing the legal, regulatory and institutional frameworks for consumer protection.
- Building consensus among key stakeholders in the form of a prioritized action plan to implement recommendations of the diagnostic review.
- Implementing priority measures identified in the action plan to strengthen consumer protection in Nicaragua (completed in 2013).

RESULTS

In June 2013, Nicaragua enacted a new consumer protection law and, in September, published related regulations to increase the transparency of financial transactions, among others. These regulations include a method for calculating total annual costs of credit products and a model (summary sheet) for disclosing terms and conditions of active and passive financial products to consumers in the banking sector, in addition to the contract.

Additionally, the regulation addresses the following issues:

- Rights and obligations of clients.
- Applicable criteria for fees and expenses, including their sustentation and the process for changing them.
- Transparency on advertising.
- Role of board of director and internal audit.
- Disclosure of formulas for calculating interests and fees.
- Financial product and services contracts abusive clauses.
• System for the attention of the financial users
claim.

Likely benefits of the new regulations include:
• Improved household confidence in financial
services.
• Increased citizens’ use of financial products,
improve the fair competition among financial
service providers and contribute to the
soundness and stability of the financial system.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION
The FIRST Initiative multi-donor trust fund
funded this technical assistance. Project costs were
approximately US$165,000.

PARTNERS
The main counterpart for this project was SIBOIF.

However, as the project progressed, it also involved
the National Commission for Microfinance
(CONAMI), the new microfinance regulator.

MOVING FORWARD
Currently, there is a new window of opportunity
to implement the transparency regulations and
continue strengthening the role of SIBOIF in the
area of consumer financial protection. SIBOIF
is planning to create a consumer protection
department and dedicate staff to the issue. The
Bank team will follow up with SIBOIF and
CONAMI to coordinate future support on this
topic.

BENEFICIARIES
Beneficiaries include all the (current and future)
users of financial services. Because Nicaragua only
recently enacted the Consumer Protection Law
and the related regulations, it is too early to assess
impact for individual citizens; countries where
these initiatives were implemented have shown
a decline in the interest rate and higher levels of
competition.
Suriname’s weak accounting and financial reporting regime precluded private sector-led growth. An analysis of the country’s financial architecture, as it relates to accounting, auditing and public sector financial management performance, stimulated a national plan to strengthen the legal and regulatory framework for the accounting profession and foster the technical skills of accountants and auditors.

CHALLENGE
Suriname’s decades-long absence from global markets and engagement with the Bank severely limited its access to financial resources to support private sector-led growth. Key factors in this limited access were:

- A lack of reliable financial information about the family-owned small businesses seeking credit.
- A paucity of professional accountants and auditors.
- An absence of acceptable accounting and auditing standards.

All three factors are critical for the development of a vibrant capital market. They reassure potential investors that rational investment decisions are being made. As the Governor of Suriname’s Central Bank noted, “With only 35 qualified accountants Suriname cannot develop its private sector.” Moreover, regulators of the profession and of the financial reporting requirements lagged behind regional comparators.

SOLUTION
The Government of Suriname sought to re-engage with the Bank by inviting a Reports on Standards and Codes Accounting and Auditing (ROSC A&A) mission to assess the country’s financial architecture as it relates to accounting and auditing practices and wider public sector financial management performance. From December 2010 through June 2011 a Bank financial management mission visited Paramaribo, Suriname. Photo: teachandlearn, Flickr, CC0.
team worked with the Central Bank, the Ministry of Finance, the Office of the Auditor General, the Suriname Association of Accountants (SUVA), and others to clarify the challenges, propose remedies through a country action plan, disseminate findings, and offer assistance for next steps to improve the investment climate.

The first steps taken were to:
• Establish a sound legal and regulatory framework for the profession.
• Foster the technical skills of accountants and auditors.
• Strengthen the institutional capacity of SUVA and of educational institutions offering training in accounting.

RESULTS
This public financial management reform strategy resulted in a US$300,000 Bank Project supporting the development of Suriname’s accounting and auditing standards. The ROSC process led Suriname’s policymakers to value better accounting as central to private sector development and more efficient use of public finances. More broadly, the ROSC initiative has also led the Government to build relations with the International Finance Corporation (IFC), which is collaborating in establishing a credit bureau and engaging in the area of public-private partnerships. Finally, building on the ROSC missions, the Government has sought to align itself with the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative, which will have trickle down effects on wider Government transparency and on fiscal and economic stability and anticorruption initiatives.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION
The US$90,070 ROSC Accounting and Auditing (ROSC A&A) assessment provided for a wide range of analytical and advisory services from December 2010 to June 2011. It identified gaps in corporate sector accounting, financial reporting, and auditing practices. To support the Government’s objectives of private sector-led growth, financial sector development, and deepened integration with the global economy, the assessment proposed reforms that would enhance financial transparency in the corporate sector and institutional reforms in the public sector.

PARTNERS
The Bank’s task team was supported by a Senior Technical Manager for Member Body Development of the International Federation of Accountants.

MOVING FORWARD
To follow up on the recommendation made by the ROSC A&A, the Institutional Development Fund (IDF) is providing US$300,000 to support the implementation of the recommended actions, and development and capacity building of the SUVA, the Supreme Audit Institution, and local accountants and auditors.

BENEFICIARIES
The primary beneficiaries are the financial accounting and auditing institutions and their members, who will improve their performance and reputations. Suriname’s small and medium businesses will also benefit as the country’s business environment and access to financing and foreign direct investment improve.

"The Government of Suriname is determined to strengthen fiscal discipline, transparency, and government efficiency through the adoption of best international practices and standards. The Government is fully committed to prioritize and implement the recommendations in the ROSC A&A report, given their importance for the development of Suriname in general, and for the ability of the country to attract foreign investment in particular."

Mr. Gillmore Hoefdraad
Governor of the Central Bank of Suriname.
TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO PROMOTES FOREIGN INVESTMENT

IMPLEMENTING A MODERN ECONOMIC ZONE STRATEGY

Trinidad and Tobago, with World Bank support, assessed its capacity to attract foreign investment and improved the capacity of investment promotion institutions (IPI) to implement a modern economic zone strategy. Key stakeholders included Government ministers, senior management of key Government agencies, and approximately three dozen other government and business leaders in the country’s investment promotion institutions (IPIs).

The Bank team consulted with the stakeholders to assess the Government’s mandates, performance, and capacities and conducted comprehensive training on investment promotion and economic zones development, best practices and strategies for development. More than 35 operational and management staff of the lead investment promotion agency (IPA) and key public and private sector agencies participated in the training.

With support from this program, the Government has streamlined the institutional framework, which included more than 15 IPIs, and appointed and strengthened one lead IPA. The Government also commissioned evaluations focused on market demand and requirements for industrial space.

CHALLENGE

For decades, the Government of Trinidad and Tobago prioritized diversification of the economy, which is highly vulnerable, given the country’s reliance on the oil and gas sector. However, achieving this diversification has been elusive. Despite attempts to strengthen the enabling environment for private sector development, the oil and gas sector’s contribution to Trinidad and Tobago’s GDP increased from 31.3 percent in 2000 to 43.6 percent in 2012. This motivated the Government to focus on economic diversification in the non-energy sector, particularly by attracting foreign direct investment (FDI) to stimulate sustainable economic growth and development. The country’s record of attracting non-petroleum FDI has been weak, with an annual average of US$66 million from 2001 to 2007.

SOLUTION

A Bank assessment identified major areas for improvement in the policy, strategic and institutional frameworks related to investment promotion and special economic zones development. Based on this assessment, the Government designated InvesTT as the lead IPA and appointed eTeck as the lead agency responsible for asset management. Previously, InvesTT had been a subsidiary of eTeck. The agencies have now been formally separated, each with its own board of directors and separate offices. This will allow each agency to focus on its new mandate. This decision also streamlines the diffuse institutional framework, creates a “first point of contact” for all investors, and eliminates potential conflicts of interest.

The Bank provided training in investment promotion and special economic zones best practices to operational and management staff in InvesTT and other sector-specific IPIs, as well as key Government ministry and agency staff. The training emphasized the need to clarify roles within the streamlined institutional framework and increase coordination between the agencies.
RESULTS
Government policies and strategies informed. The assessment’s recommendations include:

- The consolidation of investment promotion agencies into one lead agency (Feb 2013).
- The separation of asset management functions from promotion (Oct 2013).
- Assessments of existing industrial estates, including analysis of market demand and requirements for further industrial development (ongoing).
- Advances in the commercialization of an existing special economic zone, including plans to analyze and revise the development plan, engage in phased development, and identify potential commercial opportunities to aid in the zone’s development (ongoing).

The recommendations and detailed action plan were also incorporated into a draft Government policy note for a potential broader Government-supported program.

Implementation capacity increased for client agencies. The Bank provided training of more than 35 operational and management staff of the lead IPA and key public and private sector agencies on investment promotion and economic zones development and best practices and strategies for development.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION
The Technical Assistance was one component of a larger Reimbursable Advisory Service Project. The budget for this work was approximately US$240,000.

PARTNERS
The project was a joint effort of the World Bank and the International Finance Corporation (IFC) effort. Technical inputs were provided by Bank and IFC staff members; in-country support was provided by IFC staff. The key partners in this project included the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Trade, InvestTT, and eTeK. These partners provided input and feedback and adjusted their institutional structures based on the program’s recommendations.

MOVING FORWARD
As part of this engagement, the Bank delivered an action plan to the Government of Trinidad and Tobago on further activities to strengthen the effectiveness of investment promotion and special economic zones development. The Government has expressed interest in expanded Bank technical assistance to support the implementation of the plan, which includes legal, policy, regulatory, institutional, and strategic components. The details of the scope of the continued technical assistance are currently being finalized. Additionally, a Global Investment Promotion Best Practice (GIPB) assessment was recently undertaken to evaluate specific aspects of InvestTT’s performance. Continued annual GIPB assessments have been requested through 2015, which is in line with the objectives of the outlined plan, as the assessments will aim to improve the effectiveness of InvestTT.

BENEFICIARIES
The program’s beneficiaries include the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Trade, and the organizations and InvestTT and eTeK. Capacity building activities directly beneficial staff at these organizations. Implementation of the report’s recommendations will likely lead to broader economic benefits for the private sector and the citizens of Trinidad and Tobago.
URUGUAy EXPANSes ITS FULL-TIMe SCHOoL MOdeL

ENHANCING THE EQUITY AND QUALITY OF EDUCATION

Uruguay improved its preschool and primary education by expanding its Full-Time School (FTS) Model. This model improved the quality of learning and mitigated the negative connotations of poverty. It extended the school day from 4 to 7.5 hours; improved educational infrastructure; provided meals and nutritional snacks; and introduced a broader curriculum and a new teacher development program. Project beneficiaries included students, parents, and school staff.

CHALLENGE

In 1995, the Uruguayan Government undertook an education reform aimed at improving the equity and quality of education, and increasing access among the poor. The reform recognized the need to improve the quality of education by introducing new pedagogical methods, extending the school day, and improving conditions for the disadvantaged to enter the work force. Despite improvements, the gap in learning achievements between wealthy and disadvantaged students remained wide. Repetition rates were concentrated in first and second grades and closely correlated to the students’ socioeconomic level. Uruguay’s drop-out rates compared unfavorably with Chile and Argentina. The pace of human capital accumulation, measured by the average number of years of schooling, had slowed, compared to other countries with similar levels of development in the region and Asia.

SOLUTION

The World Bank supported the Government’s education reform and financed the expansion of the Full-Time School Model. Schools operated over extended school hours and offered breakfast, lunch and snacks for students. The Project provided award-winning educational facilities, equipment and learning materials. Teachers and administrators received in-service training.

Schools operated over extended school hours and offered breakfast, lunch and snacks for students.

The Project also supported the focus on socio-economically disadvantaged students through, among other initiatives, the creation of interdisciplinary teams to strengthen school-family partnerships. These were later institutionalized within the Pre-school and Primary Education Council. The Government channeled substantial additional resources to students from the lowest quintiles.

RESuLTS

During the third phase of the Project (2002-2012), improvements were seen in a range of education equity, quality, and efficiency indicators relating to students from disadvantaged and very disadvantaged socio-economic backgrounds, parents, and school staff. These include:

- Increased capacity through the infrastructure works (building and schools rehabilitation).
• Increased number of students attending schools: from 21,419 to 40,156.
• Between 1999 and 2012, a significant reduction in repetition rates for the poor (lowest two quintiles) students in the first and second grades in both FTS and Non-FTS schools:
  From 23.4 percent to 18.5 percent for first grade.
  From 17.6 percent to 9.7 percent for second grade.
• Considering students in FTS schools alone, the results between 1999 and 2012, repetition rates of poor students in the first and second grades also show a decline:
  From 23.3 percent to 12.8 percent for first grade.
  From 17.1 percent to 6.1 percent for second grade.
• Improved academic results of students from disadvantaged and very disadvantaged contexts (as measured by the percentage of students that perform below a pre-defined satisfactory level of proficiency) in Language: from 48.8 percent in 1999 to 63.1 percent in 2012.

WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION
The third phase of the Basic Education Quality Improvement Project was supported by an IBRD loan of US$42 million and an Additional Financing of US$29.9 million, and had a total cost of US$93.4 million, including counterpart funds. This followed two earlier IBRD loans of US$31.5 million and US$28.3 million in support of the program’s first two phases. The World Bank also provided substantial technical assistance and was closely engaged on the ground. Most of the Bank team consisted of region-based staff and consultants with vast experience and strong skills, who collaborated closely with the Government team.

PARTNERS
The Project Coordination Unit actively promoted the close participation of key institutional stakeholders, including the National Administration for Public Education’s Central Steering Council (CODICEN) and the Pre-school and Primary Education Council (CEIP). The Project also benefited from meaningful consultations with principals, teachers, students, and parents. Project architects developed highly personalized designs for the school buildings by actively seeking input and feedback from the school and the broader communities.

MOVING FORWARD
A follow-on operation, Support to Uruguayan Public Schools Project, approved in September 2012, continues to provide support to the Government of Uruguay in the ongoing expansion of the FTS model as a means to enhance equity, quality, and efficiency of pre-school and basic education, particularly among more vulnerable population groups. In addition, this operation provides technical assistance for the institutionalization of teacher in-service training within CEIP.

BENEFICIARIES
As of December 2012, there were a total of 40,156 students enrolled in 175 FTS schools compared to 21,419 students in 92 FTS schools in 2002. The proportion of FTS students with respect to total urban enrollment in pre-school and primary education almost doubled during the life of the project, from 6.2 to 11.7 percent between 2002 and 2011.

Mercedes Choho is the School Principal of the FTS School #50, in Vergara City at the Treinta y Tres Department: “This school has been built with participation from pupils, teachers, the development commission and parents. We all have collaborated and wish that this small piece of country that is a Full-Time School will help the school community, especially the students, who are grateful for everything this kind of schools offers them”.

WoRld Bank gRoup ContRiBution
the third phase of the Basic education Quality Improvement Project was supported by an IBRD loan of US$42 million and an Additional Financing of US$29.9 million, and had a total cost of US$93.4 million, including counterpart funds. This followed two earlier IBRD loans of US$31.5 million and US$28.3 million in support of the program’s first two phases. The World Bank also provided substantial technical assistance and was closely engaged on the ground. Most of the Bank team consisted of region-based staff and consultants with vast experience and strong skills, who collaborated closely with the Government team.
A REGIONAL NETWORK OF ACCESS TO INFORMATION PRACTITIONERS IN LATIN AMERICA

Through various instruments, the Bank has supported the establishment of a formal, Regional Network of Access to Information Practitioners among state agencies. These agencies are charged with implementing Access to Information (ATI) legislation in their countries and, through the newly established network, have enhanced their coordination and strengthened their individual as well as collective capacity to promote greater public sector transparency. Additional objectives achieved include a greater collaboration among supervisory agencies and a venue to exchange information and set standards and regional policies. The Network has also attracted non-member countries with ATI legislation to more effectively implement such legislation and continues to serve as a catalyst for change among others without ATI legislation to move toward passing such legislation (e.g., Brazil, Colombia).

CHALLENGE
In 2012, fifteen countries in the Latin America and the Caribbean region (LAC) had adopted Access to Information (ATI) legislation to strengthen Government accountability and transparency. Despite the existence of 5 national Information Commissions (Chile, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua and Uruguay), only 3 (Chile, Honduras, and Uruguay) combine the promotion of the right to access information with powers of enforcement. In most countries, civil society organizations (CSOs) appeared more organized than the state entities charged with carrying out the mandate to promote and protect the right of access to information. Due in part to this minimal regional coordination, these country agencies experienced limited capacity in the implementation of new ATI laws. Responding to demand expressed by several countries to develop a deeper knowledge and consensus about the most effective mechanisms for using ATI as a tool to promote good governance and mitigate corruption, the Bank began to review its support in this growing movement in the LAC region.

SOLUTION
Following a review of several Bank-financed activities relating to ATI, through lending and non-lending instruments, a Spanish Fund for Latin America and the Caribbean (SFLAC) grant permitted a diverse Bank Task Team (including LCSOS, PRMPS, LCSPS and WBI), led by the LCR Regional Governance Adviser, to support the establishment of the Regional Network of Access to Information Practitioners. Through the facilitation of knowledge exchanges on jurisprudence, record keeping, statistics, and strengthening state efforts on ATI laws and their implementation at the national and regional levels, the Network was designed to address a knowledge gap that persisted between these laws and the institutions required to apply them.

RESULTS
The Network of Access to Information Practitioners, which is focused on promoting a formal network for implementation of access to information legislation and systems, has helped to support governance improvements with several key outcomes:

- Successful establishment in April 2012 of a formal, Regional ATI Network, comprised of Mexico, Chile, Uruguay, Bolivia, Peru, and Brazil, with other countries pending formal membership application. Known by its Spanish name, Red de Transparencia y Acceso a la Información (RTA), this collaboration has allowed for a more consistent and fluid...
exchange of information and leadership among these entities that supervise transparency and guarantee Access to Information in the LAC region.

- Ongoing interest among non-member countries with ATI legislation who wish to join the Network and have thus requested the Network’s technical assistance and interest to join as full members.

- Enhanced capacity among the participating agencies charged with implementing ATI legislation through regular workshops at the technical and administrative levels, as well as dialogue among countries’ political leaders and leaders of these agencies.

- Greater understanding of how to enhance ATI in the LAC region and improve collaboration among Governments and stakeholders through the production of a roadmap.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

The Spanish Fund for Latin America and the Caribbean (SPLAC), a trust fund established by the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Finance, provided financing to generate greater understanding of how to enhance ATI laws and country systems. This work spanned across a number of leading countries in the LAC region (e.g., Mexico, Chile) and supported collaboration among Governments and multiple stakeholders through the production questionnaires, a roadmap, knowledge exchange workshops and joint drafting/peer review sessions for improving the implementation of ATI initiatives at the national and sub-national levels.

**PARTNERS**

Through the leadership of state agencies such as Mexico’s ATI commission, the Instituto Federal de Acceso a la Informacion Publica y Proteccion de Datos (IFAI) and Chile’s Consejo para la Transparencia (Transparency Council), countries in the LAC region have benefitted from the first Index of Transparency and Access to Information (IATT), an indicator designed to measure the effectiveness of ATI implementation efforts. This multilateral partnership among LAC countries, other regional development banks (e.g., Inter-American Development Bank), and CSOs such as the Alianza Regional por la Libertad de Informacion has enabled the Bank to effectively promote the principles of the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness by allowing donor countries to coordinate, share information, and simplify procedures.

This Regional Network of Access to Information Practitioners in LAC is a sustainable network currently consisting of 6 countries in the Region.

**MOVING FORWARD**

This Regional Network of Access to Information Practitioners in LAC (Red de Transparencia y Acceso a la Informacion, RTA) is a sustainable network currently consisting of 6 countries (Bolivia, Mexico, Uruguay, Peru, Chile, and Brazil) in the Region. We expect to see other countries continue to express their interest in joining the Network, as well as continue to seek support from each other to enhance the capacity of state oversight and accountability systems as they work toward becoming a successful international model of exchange and cooperation on ATI specifically, and good governance more broadly.

In the future, the Network will likely have to address the challenges of managing the interests of its diverse membership, as many of its new members have varying levels of development and capacity for implementation of ATI legislation. While members are confident that they can provide operational expenses of the Network, funding to support activities of the Network remains an area that requires attention. The state agencies have development proposals to address this issue, including requiring annual contributions from members and permitting an “Observer” status for non-paying member countries to still benefit from knowledge exchanges.

**BENEFICIARIES**

The Network (RTA) is perceived as a fundamental tool to achieve both shared and particular objectives of the member institutions. It adds value to the work of these supervisory institutions by providing a forum for knowledge and experience sharing, as well as an opportunity to improve and build relationships among the state agencies while enhancing public trust in Government information through greater access. RTA has become an increasingly important coalition for state agencies to work in a proactive way to guarantee ATI laws’ implementation and address the challenges of a more open Government through information sharing with the public.
Credit unions are key players in the financial sector of OECS countries, holding deposits for over half of the working population. Although these institutions are the main vehicle of financial inclusion, most local jurisdictions provide no effective regulation, prudential oversight, or customer protection mechanisms. Thus, savings of economically vulnerable populations are at risk. Many credit unions lack investors who bring financial and governance discipline to operations. While credit unions serve populations that may otherwise be excluded from financial services, this is no excuse for weak financial oversight.

**SOLUTION**
Recognizing their limited institutional and regulatory capacity as a risk for vulnerable populations, the OECS Governments, working with the ECCB, initiated regulatory reform of the non-banking financial sector, which included a review of regulatory arrangements, drafting of harmonized legislation, preparation of prudential and financial reporting requirements, development of standards and supervision manuals, and training of regulators and industry professionals.

In 2008, the OECS governments conducted reports on the Observance of Standards and Codes (ROSC) Accounting and Auditing. Recommendations from these diagnostic exercises provided a basis for a sub-regional grant-financed technical assistance project focused on non-banking financial institutions in six OECS countries, implemented through the ECCB. Outreach to regulators and practitioners, including a sub-regional consultations process, various workshops, and hands-on direct assistance were provided.

The Project helped develop and implement medium-term strategic plans for oversight and regulation of non-banking financial institution. To that end, the Project supported the development of comprehensive financial regulations and supervision manuals, and delivered a sub-regional training program focused on financial and prudential reporting requirements for regulators and industry practitioners. On-site inspections were conducted in four OECS countries, targeting credit unions holding significant shares of population deposits. These provided key insights into sectoral practices, and enabled supervisors to collaborate, based on the process’ cross-jurisdictional nature. It also helped regional authorities assess the systemic risk and tailor mitigating measures, thus providing much-needed protection and assurance.

**RESULTS**
Upon project completion, in 2013, the savings of economically vulnerable populations are in institutions with higher standards of accounting and financial reporting and enhanced consumer protection mechanisms, and are overseen by
strengthened regulatory entities, which collectively provide an enhanced early-warning of systemic risk. This was effected through the development of comprehensive financial regulations and supervision manuals, a sub-regional training program focused on financial and prudential reporting requirements for regulators and industry practitioners delivered jointly with the International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS) Foundation, and the development and implementation of medium-term strategic plans guiding further development of oversight and regulatory practices in the non-banking financial sector.

**WORLD BANK GROUP CONTRIBUTION**

This effort was financed by a grant from the Institutional Development Fund (IDF) in the amount of US$455,000.

**PARTNERS**

The project was led by the Latin America and the Caribbean Financial Management (FM) team in close collaboration with the Eastern Caribbean Central Bank and, for trainings, the IFRS Foundation. The Latin America and the Caribbean Finance and Private Sector Development (FPD) team was involved in a broader financial sector oversight and regulation agenda in the Caribbean countries.

**MOVING FORWARD**

The Project was completed in September 2013. While it has achieved most of its objectives, the sub-regional reform agenda is ongoing. The new installment of technical assistance in this area is currently being prepared by the FPD team, which will help to fully operationalize the delivered activities and continue capacity building activities for regulators and practitioners.

**BENEFICIARIES**

The beneficiaries of the project are the credit unions of the OECS countries.

"The World Bank-financed project ‘Strengthening the Accountability of the Non-Bank Financial Sector in the OECS’ has fostered credit union supervision throughout the Eastern Caribbean Currency Union (ECCU). The project has provided valuable insight into the regulatory and operational framework of the credit union sector within the ECCU. The training assistance pertaining to the risk-based credit union manual, the mock on-site examinations were invaluable and contributed substantially to the continued development of the credit union supervisory framework in St. Kitts & Nevis.”

Mrs. Kjellin Rawlins-Elliott
Registrar of Credit Unions, Financial Services Regulatory Commission, St. Kitts & Nevis.
Bolivia’s National Development Plan and Country Partnership Strategy identify the improvement of basic social services as one of the four development pillars for sustained economic growth. New Education and Popular Participation laws call for education services that consider the nation’s rich cultural diversity. The same laws assign control of education infrastructure to municipalities, with broader participation from local families and communities.

Under the new Country Partnership Strategy, Bolivia’s municipalities of La Paz and El Alto planned to undertake comprehensive policy reforms across the social sector, and design the inter-institutional architecture required to implement policies and deliver services more efficiently. La Paz and El Alto particularly wanted to improve early childhood education, health, nutrition, child protection, and quality assurance to enhance opportunities for children and reduce intergenerational poverty and inequality.

To this end, both municipal governments requested World Bank assistance to learn from other countries’
best practices for delivering quality early childhood development services. The knowledge gained would help officials prepare and design their own policies and program implementation strategies. The Bank identified Colombia as a suitable fit for the knowledge exchange.

The exchange connected officials from the Bolivian cities of La Paz and El Alto with counterparts from Bogotá and Medellín in Colombia. The main objective was to enhance service delivery for young children in Bolivia. The exchange consisted of a series of video training and webinars, the creation of a knowledge sharing network among policymakers, and the development of a comprehensive early childhood education action plan.

Evaluating the exchange after it was complete, the participants said that the exercise was “an eye opener” and that it “enabled the team to learn about differential services for children with special needs from an inclusive approach.” They added that it was “motivating” to see examples of how Colombia was able to overcome challenges that they also identify with.

Overall, the exchange was effective in strengthening the capacity of the Ministry of Education and the municipalities of La Paz and El Alto to provide quality early childhood development services to the population. The exchange exposed technical staff members to innovative practices and enabled them to take charge of implementing the programs locally. As a result, they will be able to improve the quality of services provided to Bolivian children living in disadvantaged families.

**STRATEGIC CONTEXT**

*Capacity Building Goals: Efficiency of Policy Instruments*

Bolivia has undergone profound change since the Government of President Morales took power in 2006. The administration implemented a range of social and economic policies to empower indigenous peoples and reduce poverty and inequality.

In May 2006, the Government of Bolivia launched its National Development Plan (NDP), which, among other things, sought to introduce new social programs while scaling up existing ones to achieve profound social and political reform. Several years later, the World Bank and the Government have agreed on a four-year Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) as a viable medium-term program for addressing upcoming development challenges.

Improving child development through an integrated system for social wellbeing and equity is a key component of Bolivia’s Human Development Plan. The Plan outlines a regulatory framework that details the roles and responsibilities at the national, departmental, and municipal levels, requiring municipalities to allocate budgets and implement comprehensive child development policies for children aged 0 to 5.

La Paz and El Alto began developing strategic action plans to provide comprehensive early childhood development services and requested Bank support to gain firsthand access to international best practices, particularly in the areas of nutrition, parenting, initial education, training of care givers, and program monitoring and evaluation.
DESCRIPTION
Exchange Instruments:
- Conferences
- Dialogues
- Study Tour

The main objective of the exchange between the Bolivian cities of La Paz and El Alto and the Colombian cities of Bogotá and Medellín was to enhance service delivery for young children in Bolivia. Several activities helped achieve this objective:

- Videoconferences and a webinar: ten Government officials received training on incorporating quality early childhood development standards into policy.
- Study tour: four members of the municipality of La Paz, three members of the municipality of El Alto, one member Bolivia’s Ministry of Education, and two members of Nicaragua’s Ministry of Education participated in a four-day visit to Colombia. The participants identified lessons and best practices that specifically addressed the challenges and needs of their respective countries from the De Cero a Siempre strategy and from Medellin’s program Buen Comienzo. Field visits allowed participants to establish deeper connections.
- Knowledge sharing network among policymakers: information from the knowledge exchange and summaries of key learnings from the activities were published on www.comunidadprimerainfancia.com. The platform is accessible to members of the Latin America and the Caribbean Early Childhood Development Learning Community and was disseminated to workshop participants and 1,600 members of the community of practice.
- Revision of international standards for early childhood development: over the course of a two-day international workshop, the experts developed the blueprint for a comprehensive infrastructure plan for La Paz and El Alto. The revised standards were also shared with the municipal authorities.

OUTCOMES
Intermediate Capacity Outcomes:
- Enhanced Knowledge and Skills
- Enhanced Networks
- Formulated policy/strategy

The exchange enhanced the knowledge and skills of early childhood development officials and participating stakeholders from Bolivia. As a result of the video workshop, study visit, and a conference, all of the participants are better equipped to develop effective and integrated policies to improve service delivery for young children.

Participants also expanded their networks for sharing knowledge (including help and advice) and developed formal partnerships. For example, officials in Bolivia, Colombia, and the international community of early childhood development policymakers and practitioners entered into a formal partnership.

Finally, exchange participants from each country agreed upon a blueprint for a results-based action plan for early childhood development. They drafted the document and submitted it to municipal authorities. At the conclusion of the project, the participants expressed their overall satisfaction with the outcomes. Some of them said that “the exchange enabled us to share knowledge and life experiences with practitioners in Colombia that deal with the same issues we do. It was also an amazing opportunity to learn the different service provision modalities and see first-hand the work that the teachers do with young children on the day-by-day basis. We will take these experiences and incorporate them into our current work.”.
LESSONS FOR EFFECTIVE KNOWLEDGE EXCHANGE

Clients
- Ensure that lessons from the exchange are shared among Government staff to build local capacity.
- Replicate effective initiatives that can be adapted to the local context.
- Maintain communication with the networks developed through the exchange using platforms such as the ECD Community of Practice.

Beneficiaries
- Get involved in projects that impact the community, families, and children.
- Request information about approaches implemented in other countries.
- Demand services that meet the needs of children in their early years that also take into account the needs of families and communities.

KNOWLEDGE PROVIDERS
- El Alto, Bolivia: Projects Unit Director, ECD Program Director, Education Director and Architect.
- La Paz, Bolivia: Gender and Generations Director, ECD Program Director, ECD Centers Coordinator, Child Unit Director and Architect.
- Bolivia’s Ministry of Education: Early Learning Director.
- Nicaragua: Preschool Unit Director, Infrastructure Unit Architect.

KNOWLEDGE SEEKERS
The list of participants included heads of the Children and Early Childhood Development units from both municipalities and three operational officers working in areas related to health, education, parenting, and childcare techniques.

ENHANCING SOUTH-SOUTH COOPERATION TO REDUCE URBAN POVERTY

In 2003, India, Brazil, and South Africa signed a Trilateral Agreement (IBSA) establishing a mechanism for South-South cooperation among these countries and other developing nations to advance inclusive sustainable development and to counter marginalization. These countries shared an urban challenge of millions of poor people living in slums; in response, in 2008 they established a Working Group on Human Settlement (IBSA-HS) to promote common policy approaches in human settlements, knowledge exchanges, and cooperation in skills development, scientific knowledge sharing, and partnerships with NGOs. The World Bank Institute (WBI) and the Cities Alliance have supported IBSA-HS to share knowledge and elevate urban poverty alleviation in global dialogue. Using a grant from the South-South Facility, WBI financed delegates’ attendance at a workshop in Pretoria to learn about human settlement programs and policies, improve the networking and effectiveness of IBSA-HS, and commence work on a strategy for IBSA-HS.
From October 11 to 13, 2011, more than 100 policymakers, city leaders, and representatives of academia and slum dweller organizations assembled in Pretoria ahead of a broader IBSA summit. For three days, delegates reflected on national policies and programmatic approaches to scale up slum upgrading and affordable housing programs. They discussed inclusive urban planning, housing subsidies, tenure security, and social inclusion. Delegates visited three informal settlements to understand slum dwellers’ challenges and how participatory approaches have been applied to slum upgrading programs.

Besides improving their know-how in human settlement, delegates took steps to strengthen their networking and the effectiveness and sustainability of IBSA-HS. They launched a Community of Practice to share and disseminate good practices and coordinate South-South activities. They established peer-learning clusters for specific groups (e.g., city officials) to share experiences through videoconferences, joint research, and country visits. Delegates also identified anchor institutions to manage contributions from each country and initiated discussions on a longer-term strategy for IBSA-HS.

The workshop was key in fortifying IBSA-HS, solidifying high-level commitment to expand slum upgrading and affordable housing programs. As a result, the revitalized IBSA-HS platform has supported regular thematic dialogues and visits of experts to countries to advise on human settlement. IBSA-HS members, represented by national secretaries from South Africa’s National Department of Human Settlement, India’s Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation, and Brazil’s Ministry of Cities, finalized the IBSA-HS strategy discussed at the workshop that established a funding mechanism to support cooperation in policy dialogue, technical assistance, and action-research. The IBSA-HS principals lauded this development: “The new IBSA HS strategy is well-structured and is moving in the right direction to achieve IBSA-HS development objectives.”

STRATEGIC CONTEXT
Capacity Building Goals:
- Effectiveness of Organizational Arrangements
- Strength of Stakeholder Ownership

In 2003, India, Brazil, and South Africa established the India-Brazil-South Africa Trilateral Agreement (IBSA) - a coordinating mechanism for South-South cooperation among these pluralistic countries and other developing nations to advance inclusive sustainable development and counter marginalization. The principles of IBSA are participatory democracy, respect for human rights, the rule of law, and strengthening multilateralism. Recognizing the roles of cities in development and the millions of people living in slums in these countries, IBSA established in 2008 a Human Settlements Working Group (IBSA-HS), which promotes 1) a common policy in human settlements, especially in slum upgrading and housing for the poor; 2) knowledge exchange through workshops, study tours, and other means; and 3) cooperation in trainings, skills development, scientific knowledge exchange, and partnerships with non-governmental associations (NGOs). To advance South-South cooperation and increase the prominence of urban poverty alleviation in global dialogue, the World Bank Institute (WBI) and Cities Alliance helped build the capacity of IBSA-HS through establishing a Secretariat, facilitating site visits, and developing an interactive web-based platform, among other activities.

As part of this support, WBI used a South-South Facility grant to send stakeholders from these countries to a workshop in Pretoria to share know-how and experiences in human settlement, strengthen the networking and effectiveness of IBSA-HS, and outline a strategy for moving forward. The workshop,
held in late October 2011 before a broader IBSA Summit, allowed participants to reflect on each country’s policies and programs as well as issues related to inclusive urban planning, housing subsidies, tenure security, and social inclusion. Participants shared insights and good practices from a rich base of programs, including India’s Rajiv Awas Yojana (RAY) and the National Urban Livelihood Mission programs, which improve access to housing and income opportunities in urban slums; Brazil’s PAC-Favela program that scales up slum upgrading and its “My Home, My Life” initiative to build 3.4 million affordable houses by December 2014; and South Africa’s efforts to improve the lives of 400,000 people in informal settlements using participatory approaches.

**DESCRIPTION**

Exchange Instruments:
- Communities of Practice
- Conferences

The National Department of Human Settlement in South Africa led in preparing for this workshop, which included developing a Concept Note, engaging counterparts in India and Brazil to identify participants, and finalizing the agenda.

More than 100 policymakers, city managers, urban practitioners, leaders of informal settlements, and other stakeholders assembled in Pretoria from October 11 to 13, 2011 to discuss challenges, policies, and programs in informal settlements. Besides providing delegates with face-to-face interaction critical to building relationships, the workshop offered video and audio connections to stakeholders outside Pretoria, such as ministries, public agencies, NGOs, and academic institutions.

During the workshop’s first day, country officials presented their national policies and programs, and delegates discussed how to improve land security as well as plan and design slum upgrading programs. On day two, delegates discussed approaches to providing social services and financing slum upgrading initiatives, particularly through partnerships with NGOs and the private sector. For day three, delegates visited informal settlements in Gauteng Province to learn about each settlement’s design, financing plan, service levels, and dweller demographics. Delegates learned about the importance of partnering with universities to develop trainings on how to design, build, and manage informal settlements.

At the workshop, delegates launched a Community of Practice (CoP) for IBSA-HS within the Inclusive Cities Practitioners Network to serve as a knowledge depository and to coordinate South-South learning (see inclusivocities.ning.com/page/ibsa-human-settlements). Delegates proposed regular thematic dialogues within this CoP. To improve the effectiveness of IBSA-HS, they established peer clusters to share knowledge among specific groups (e.g., city officials, academicians), and nominated anchor institutions to manage each country’s contributions to IBSA-HS. These anchor institutions included the Human Settlement Management Institute in India, the ABC Federal University in Brazil, and the Cities Network in South Africa. Participants began discussions on a long-term strategy for IBSA-HS. After the exchange, WBI prepared a report summarizing the workshop’s key learning points.

The grant from the South-South Facility covered the travel of non-state participants. The Governments of India, Brazil, and South Africa covered the travel of participants from national, local, and city governments. The Government of South Africa covered other logistical costs.

**OUTCOMES**

Intermediate Capacity Outcomes:
- Enhanced Knowledge and Skills
- Enhanced Networks
- Increased Implementation Know-how
- Raised awareness
- Strengthened Coalitions

The workshop improved the know-how and commitment of the delegates to improve the conditions of the urban poor in informal settlements. Delegates from the public and private sectors, NGOs, and informal
settlements enhanced their skills to design, finance, and implement policies and programs to upgrade slums and build affordable housing. Participants cultivated greater commitment to scale-up such programs, particularly through new policies and programmatic approaches.

The workshop enhanced networking opportunities and increased the effectiveness and sustainability of IBSA-HS. The CoP enabled members to identify and share innovations and good practices, such as in inclusive urban planning, financing approaches, land tenure security, participatory slum upgrading, monitoring and evaluation, and capacity building. The CoP stimulated seminars and expert visits to countries to inform slum upgrading programs, such as India’s RAY. The peer learning clusters and anchor institutions strengthened knowledge sharing in IBSA-HS. For example, anchor institutions have organized webinars on subjects such as resettlement policies, slum-free city planning, financing strategies, and monitoring and evaluation methods. The workshop also laid the groundwork for a new IBSA-HS Strategy, and initiated a rotating IBSA-HS Secretariat.

LONG TERM IMPACT
The exchange was a key building block in a broader Bank program to strengthen the capacity of IBSA-HS. The workshop helped increase high-level political commitment to human settlement policies and programs. It also contributed to the finalization and adoption of a new IBSA-HS strategy, which has established a long-term funding mechanism to support cooperation in policy dialogue, technical assistance, and action-research. Representatives from Brazil’s Ministry of Cities, India’s Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation, and South Africa’s National Department of Human Settlement lauded the new IBSA-HS strategy, noting it is “well-structured, and is moving in the right direction to achieve IBSA-HS development objectives.”

LESSONS FOR EFFECTIVE KNOWLEDGE EXCHANGE
• First, platforms for South-South Knowledge Exchange need to be truly owned and driven by countries in the Global South.
• Before creating a new Community of Practice, it is important to assess demand and investigate whether CoPs are already operating in a sector to avoid duplicating efforts.
• International agencies, such as WBI, can help by sharing their know-how on designing exchanges (e.g., through WBI’s Art of Knowledge Exchange Planning Guide) and supporting catalytic actions to strengthen institutions.
• Anchor organizations, such as universities, city associations, and think tanks, play critical roles in augmenting Governments’ capacity to manage knowledge exchanges, and in helping to navigate changes in leadership, particularly due to electoral cycles.

KNOWLEDGE PROVIDERS
The participants in this workshop provided and received knowledge on pro-poor human settlement. Participants came from national public organizations, including India’s Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation (MoHUPA), Brazil’s Ministry of Cities, and South Africa’s Department of Human Settlements. Delegates also came from civil society groups; academic institutions; non-governmental associations; informal settlement organizations; and local and city governments. Though a full participant
list is not available, key speakers at workshop sessions are noted below.

India
- Arun Kumar Misra, Secretary, Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation, MoHUPA
- Deepthi Mukherjee, Director, RAY, MoHUPA
- Sheila Patel, Head of Slum/Shack Dwellers International and SPARC
- Neelima Risbud, Professor, School of Planning and Architecture, Delhi

Brazil
- Inês Magalhães, National Housing Secretary, Ministry of Cities
- Júnia Santa Rosa, Director of Institutional Development and Technical Cooperation at National Housing Secretariat, Ministry of Cities
- Ícaro Moreno, President, Building Works Company of Rio de Janeiro State Government
- Rosana Denaldi, ABC Federal University
- Fabrizio Pellicelli, Director of Fundação, AVSI Foundation
- Anália Amortim, President of Associação, Escola da Cidade
- Francesco Villarosa, Expert of Social Work and Resettlement

South Africa
- Neville Chainee, Chief Operating Officer, Department of Human Settlements
- Sibongile Nxumalo, Department of Human Settlements
- Mbulelo Tshangana, Head of Department, Western Cape Department of Human Settlements
- Margo Weimers, Senior Specialist, Spatial Development Planning, City of Johannesburg
- Walter Melato, City of Johannesburg
- Amos Mboweni, City of Tshwane
- Aubrey Mokgosi, City of Ekurhuleni

Since Russia’s transition from a planned to a market economy over two decades ago, economic growth has been steady and GDP per capita has increased threefold - yet inequality has also risen significantly. Looking for ways to reduce inequality and social exclusion, Russian authorities chose sports as a powerful mobilizer and vehicle for access to remedial services. Global evidence suggests that sports also provide a powerful and cost-effective entry point for social inclusion. Studies have shown sports’ effectiveness in integrating disabled people and promoting equality, employment, education, youth development, gender relations, and healthier lifestyles in the wider population.

To this end, the Government of the Russian Federation drafted a Long-term Social and Economic Development Strategy for 2008-2020 to create conditions for social integration of vulnerable people through cultural, educational, and physical development. The Ministry of Sports developed a project to use sports for social integration of vulnerable groups, and is keen on learning from, and adapting, international approaches and models. At the time, the Russian Government did not have a clear understanding of the approach, the necessary policy frameworks, or the personnel requirements. The World Bank identified Brazil—a country with policy-makers and practitioners who have faced the same challenges in the past—as
a suitable partner for a knowledge exchange. The Russian exchange participants were key technical experts from the Ministry of Sports who were directly involved in preparing the Social Inclusion through Sports and Physical Culture project.

The knowledge exchange included visits to learn about social inclusion through sports programming supported by the Government and civil society and meetings with municipal and regional government officials on social inclusion policies and approaches. The delegation also met with other stakeholders to learn about approaches to working with vulnerable youth and the disabled, and it visited transparency and social accountability initiatives related to sports construction. The learning exchange was a great success. The Russian delegation met with more than 30 project staff members from 17 organizations working for social inclusion of vulnerable youth and people with disabilities.

**STRATEGIC CONTEXT**

**Capacity Building Goals: Effectiveness of Organizational Arrangements**

Since Russia’s transition from a planned to a market economy over two decades ago, growth has been steady and GDP per capita has increased threefold. However, between 1988 and 2009 inequality has also risen significantly, as measured by the GINI coefficient, from 23.8 to 40.1. The country’s strong economic recovery and downward poverty trends mask serious challenges of inequality and social exclusion. Russian authorities drafted a Long-term Social and Economic Development Strategy for 2008 to 2020, and chose sports as a powerful mobilizer and vehicle for access to remedial services and as an effective means of social inclusion.

The Russian Federation Ministry of Sport worked with the World Bank to help identify countries that had successfully gained a clear understanding of approaches, entry points, necessary policy frameworks, personnel and human resource capacity requirements to achieve social inclusion through sports. The World Bank identified Brazil as a good match, and a Bank team helped arrange a knowledge exchange for key technical experts from the two countries.

**DESCRIPTION**

**Exchange Instruments: Study Tour**

The learning activity included visits supported by Government and civil society, meetings with the municipal and regional government on social inclusion policies and approaches, consultations with stakeholders on approaches to working with vulnerable youth and the disabled, as well as visits to transparency and social accountability initiatives related to sports construction. These visits aimed to address program management, partnership development and public-private partnerships, communications and monitoring & evaluation as well as other issues relevant to Russia’s Social Inclusion through Sports Project.

The learning exchange was a great success. Russian officials met with more than 30 project staff from 17 organizations working on social inclusion of vulnerable youth and people with disabilities in Brazil, including non-governmental organizations, policy institutes, and municipal and state Government agencies. Three staff members of the Russian Ministry of Sport (MoS) and their counterparts for the Russia Social Inclusion through Sports Project were exposed to new concepts, approaches and implementation methods, and were exploring how these could be integrated into their work—including, but not limited to, the new Bank-supported project. They disseminated their learning to MoS colleagues and local counterparts in June 2012. In addition, key documents on social inclusion programming and methodologies received from the Brazilian partners who hosted the exchange were translated into Russian. These included Operations Manuals and Terms of Reference that could greatly help the Russian clients plan and manage their new Social Inclusion through Sports initiatives.

A number of external factors impeded the implementation of the grant within the planned timeframe. In early 2012, due to the Russian presidential elections (March 2012) and the transfer of power to the new Government (May 2012), the learning tour to Brazil was postponed to mid-May 2012. Later activities planned under this initiative, including information-sharing events and a follow-up visit by a Brazilian partner to Russia, could not be implemented during the grant execution period, since the Social Inclusion...
through Sports Project experienced a year delay in preparation, resuming in December 2012.

OUTCOMES
Intermediate Capacity Outcomes:
- Enhanced Knowledge and Skills
- Enhanced Networks
- Increased Implementation Know-how
- Raised Awareness

The learning visit by the Russian authorities to Brazil was truly transformational for them and for the evolution of the Social Inclusion project. The authorities learned about new concepts, approaches, and implementation methods. The participants became eager to explore how to integrate their learnings into their work, including, but not limited to, the new Bank-supported project.

Unfortunately, the impact of the exchange was not captured by the planned grant outcome indicators, which were tied to the implementation of the new Social Inclusion project. Because of unrelated administrative issues during the last six months of the grant period, the program preparation had to be put on hold for a year. Since then, the Social Inclusion Project has resumed, and it is expected that the planned outcomes of the grant will still be achieved.

The knowledge has especially informed the design of implementation arrangements and operational standards for sports facilities and programs promoting social inclusion of vulnerable groups. In particular, the exchange provided crucial knowledge regarding the role of municipalities in identifying the needs of local beneficiaries, overseeing design and construction of facilities, ensuring accessibility of facilities to vulnerable populations, managing recurrent facilities expenditures; and ensuring formal responsibility for their operation after the project concluded.

The exchange enabled Brazilian specialists to transfer knowledge accumulated over several years of successful project implementation. It was very efficient for their Russian counterparts to learn directly from knowledge providers intimately acquainted with these issues, rather than search for this information from scratch. The resources invested in this process by the South-South Facility paid immediate dividends through the direct application of the knowledge to the preparation of the Russia Social Inclusion through Sports Project.

Policy makers across Europe and Central Asia are increasingly interested in the potential of sports to address social exclusion and have demonstrated interest in learning from global experience (e.g. Kazakhstan and Georgia). The network of practitioners can be further expanded and exchange activities organized under this grant can be replicated among them.

LESSONS FOR EFFECTIVE KNOWLEDGE EXCHANGE
Knowledge exchange designers should take into consideration upcoming elections or other changes in Government that can affect the continuity of the program.

KNOWLEDGE PROVIDERS
Brazil: Officials involved in the design, implementation, and monitoring of social inclusion activities, including Government (central Ministry and Rio municipality), NGOs, private businesses, and beneficiaries
- The Vencedoras program, supported by the Inter-American Development Bank and coordinated by Partners of the Americas The Rio de Janeiro Metropolitan Urban and Housing Development project, supported by the World Bank.

KNOWLEDGE SEEKERS
Key technical experts from the Ministry of Sports, Tourism and Youth Policy (currently Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation), who are directly involved in the preparation of the project on Social Inclusion through Sports and Physical Culture. These include sports, social inclusion, and management specialists.
The Eastern Caribbean states of Dominica, Grenada, Saint Lucia, and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines (SVG) have worked with the World Bank, regional development partners, and donors to reduce their vulnerability to climate change. Activities have supported making infrastructure resilient to climate threats, modeling climate risks and hazards, and using risk information in development planning. In the context of the World Bank’s Regional Disaster Vulnerability Reduction Program (RDVRP) and Climate Investment Funds’ Pilot Program for Climate Resistance (PPCR), representatives from these countries and ministries helped to lead two regional workshops, Climate-Resilient Infrastructure and Caribbean Risk Assessment and Open-data management, in January and February 2012. Workshop aims were to enhance the capacity of participants from Caribbean countries and partners in these areas, foster greater regional cooperation, and equip country officials to make better decisions on physical planning and development.

At the Climate-Resilient Infrastructure workshop, 64 officials from ministries and planning agencies, regional organizations, and donor institutions assembled in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines to learn...
about engineering models, landslide risks, building codes and standards, and coastal zone management.

At the second workshop, 41 officials from planning departments and donor agencies gathered in Trinidad and Tobago to learn how to model and map climate risks and hazards. They also learned how to use open-source tools and technologies such as Geonode—a centralized platform for managing and sharing geospatial data. The University of West Indies in St. Augustine was a key partner in the second workshop.

Positioned within a multi-year program of donor support on climate change, these workshops strengthened high-level dialogue and regional cooperation. Reflecting these gains, participants launched a Community of Practice to sustain learning on data management and proposed forming a regional association to sustain dialogue on infrastructure issues. Participants enhanced their capacity to share and apply information on climate-related risks and to develop resilient infrastructure, whether through advanced engineering designs or simple measures such as using more nails in roofs to resist higher winds. One participant from Saint Lucia expressed the general feeling of the participants: “[the infrastructure workshop] was the best workshop that I have ever attended, and there is a lot of knowledge that should be immediately applied to Caribbean construction practices.”

Officials have started to apply their new skills to guide development planning and projects, such as using a Geonode in Dominica to guide investments in emergency shelters. The workshop also accelerated progress on other regional programs in climate change and disaster risk reduction.

**STRATEGIC CONTEXT**

**Capacity Building Goals:**
- Effectiveness of Organizational Arrangements
- Efficiency of Policy Instruments
- Strength of Stakeholder Ownership

The Eastern Caribbean states of Dominica, Grenada, Saint Lucia, and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines (SVG) have collaborated with the World Bank and donors to reduce their vulnerability to climate change.

Each country participates in the Bank’s Pilot Program for Climate Resistance (PPCR), while Grenada and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines participate in the Regional Disaster Vulnerability Reduction Program (RDVRP). Each has formulated a Strategic Program for Climate Resistance (SPCR), which supports developing climate-resilient infrastructure and sharing climatological, hydrological, and geo-spatial data to prepare for storms, flooding, drought and other climate threats. In addition, Grenada, Saint Lucia, and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines are piloting the use of Geonodes—centralized open source platforms for sharing geospatial data across agencies—to improve decision-making and development planning.

The global dimension of climate change requires greater regional cooperation in sharing infrastructure standards and practices and improving the management, sharing, and application of climate-related data. In this context, the governments of these states partnered with organizations under the PPCR and the RDVRP in leading two workshops. The Climate-Resilient infrastructure and Caribbean Risk Assessment and Open Geospatial Data Management workshops took place in January and February of 2012 in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines and Trinidad and Tobago, respectively. The goals were to increase the know-how and skills of country officials in these areas, strengthen networking and cooperation, and support officials in improving their policies and programs. Officials from the Caribbean region, the United States, England, and India led sessions, while participants came from ten Caribbean nations and regional agencies and their development partners. The South-South Facility financed the travel of participants from the four Eastern Caribbean states, while trust funds, donor agencies, and Government resources financed the other participants’ costs.

**DESCRIPTION**

**Exchange Instruments:**
- Communities of Practice
- Conferences

The Ministry of Transportation and Works in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines hosted the first workshop on climate resilient infrastructure from January 26 to 27, 2012. This workshop, which was attended by 64
officials from ten Caribbean countries and territories, focused on designing housing and other infrastructure that would be more resilient to climate changes, such as more intense storms, to reduce the risk of climate-related disasters. Sessions addressed landslide risks, engineering models and procedures, building codes and standards, coastal zone infrastructure, and other topics. Participants expressed support to establish a regional technical association to address climate challenges within the framework of the Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS). They also supported increasing regional trainings and harmonizing regulatory and building codes and standards across countries.

The University of the West Indies in Trinidad and Tobago hosted the workshop Caribbean Risk Assessment and Open Geo-spatial Data Management from February 2-3, 2012. Forty-one participants came from nine countries and donor and regional organizations. Co-sponsored by diverse agencies (see link to Workshop Proceedings below), this workshop explored topics related to data initiatives of the PPCR, the RDVRP, and the World Bank Caribbean Risk Atlas Project, which seeks to build the capacity of Caribbean countries to conduct hazard and risk assessments, model and map vulnerabilities, and improve decision-making. Participants explored Geonodes piloted by select countries, open source technologies, and ways to harmonize regional data management practices. Attendees from each country completed drafts of national strategies to improve data management practices and launched a Community of Practice (CoP) to continue learning.

OUTCOMES
Intermediate Capacity Outcomes:
- Enhanced Knowledge and Skills
- Enhanced Networks
- Formulated policy/strategy
- Implemented strategy/plan
- Improved Consensus and Teamwork
- Increased Implementation Know-how
- Raised awareness

The workshops, part of a broader program of Bank and donor support to help Caribbean countries manage and respond to climate-related threats, were critical to improving the skills and know-how of country officials and to advancing high-level dialogue and regional cooperation. Among other gains, participants increased their capacity to design and build climate-resilient housing and infrastructure; undertake risk analyses and hazard assessments; manage and share climate-related data; and apply risk information to development plans and projects. A participant from Saint Lucia stated that the infrastructure workshop was “the best workshop that I have ever attended, and there is a lot of knowledge that should be immediately applied to Caribbean construction practices.” Similarly, participants in the data management workshop increased their skills in modeling and mapping risks and hazards, such as floods and droughts, as well in mainstreaming risk information into longer-term development planning and programs.
These workshops, along with a previous workshop in Grenada in October 2011, were valuable for strengthening regional dialogue and cooperation among Caribbean countries, regional organizations, and donor agencies. This relationship-building has been critical to advancing country initiatives as well as regional goals and programs. The launch of the data management CoP and delegates’ interest in building a regional association to promote dialogue on climate-resilient infrastructure reflects this greater regional orientation.

LONG TERM IMPACT

Country officials and stakeholders have begun to apply their new know-how and skills to inform development plans and projects. For example, Dominica and other countries have used Geonodes to store and share geo-spatial data and guide infrastructure investments such as emergency shelters. Country officials continue to use the video “Building Climate Resilience: A Case for Caribbean Collaboration” which was developed for the workshop, to build awareness among colleagues and stakeholders of the importance of data sharing to inform building decisions.

Officials and stakeholders have used the CoP on data management as a platform for regional cooperation. The CoP has over 150 members, drawn from ministries, regional organizations, donor agencies, and other groups; it provides guides and resources, sponsors regular webinars, and provides a mechanism for coordinating trainings and knowledge sharing.

Momentum from the workshop helped to propel additional knowledge exchanges and regional projects. For example, three additional workshops were held in 2013 on managing and using data to improve decision-making.

LESSONS FOR EFFECTIVE KNOWLEDGE EXCHANGE

- Knowledge exchanges where countries both receive and provide knowledge promote valuable brainstorming around shared challenges.
- Knowledge exchanges are most effective when linked to country or donor operational activities.
- Workshops are not only a means to share knowledge, but also to create long-term relationships in support of broader development objectives.
- Whenever possible, share the workshop agenda with participants in advance of an exchange so they can provide input and assume ownership.
- To enhance the effectiveness and sustainability of an exchange, set clear expectations of participants and plan follow-up activities.
- It is useful to complement workshops with visits to project sites to provide “hands-on” learning.
- CoPs need continual nurturing to thrive, but be sure that all communications and trainings are useful to members’ daily work.
- Online forums and listservs can help sustain communication and support development activities.

KNOWLEDGE PROVIDERS AND KNOWLEDGE SEEKERS

Participants in the workshops from the lead countries – Dominica, Grenada, Saint Lucia, and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines – and other Caribbean nations both provided and received knowledge.

The 64 participants in the “Climate-resilient Infrastructure” workshop were mainly managers, engineers, and project supervisors from national ministries and agencies, as well as senior staff and project managers from regional and international organizations, including the OECS, the Caribbean Development Bank, the United States Army Corps of Engineers, and the World Bank.

The 41 participants in the “Caribbean Risk Assessment & Open Geo-spatial Data Management” workshop were mostly senior staff, public planners, IT specialists, data administrators, and technicians from planning departments or ministries in these countries, along with staff from the University of West Indies and donor organizations.